## ILLINOIS POLLUTION CONTROL BOARD January 28, 2009

PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF ILLINOIS,	)	
	)	
Complainant,	)	
	)	
v.	)	PCB 00-211
	)	(RCRA Enforcement)
TOYAL, INC. f/k/a ALCON-TOYO	)	
AMERICA INC., a foreign corporation,	)	
	)	
Respondent.	)	
-	)	

#### **HEARING REPORT**

On December 10 and 11, 2008, a hearing in this matter was held at the Village of Bolingbrook, Board Room, 375 W. Briarcliff Road, Bolingbrook, Illinois. Assistant Attorneys General Christopher J. Grant and Vanessa Vail, appeared and participated on behalf of the complainant. Attorneys Roy M. Harsch and Yesenia Villasenor-Rodriguez, appeared and participated on behalf of respondent, Toyal, Inc. f/k/a Alcon-Toyo America., a foreign corporation (Toyal).

#### **Preliminary Matters**

On December 10, 2008, the respondent submitted a Motion to Include Witnesses' Narrative Testimony. The narrative testimony attached to the motion included testimony of Barry Van Hoose, Raymond J. Malmgren, Steve Anderson, Dennis Dobrodt and Christopher McClure (includes revised expert report, dated December 1, 2008). On December 10, 2008, the complainant orally objected, on record, to respondent's motion. For the reasons set forth on record at the hearing on December 10, 2008, respondent's motion to include witnesses' narrative testimony was denied, however, the motion and attached narrative testimony was taken as an offer of proof and marked as Hearing Officer Exhibit 1.

Also on December 10, 2008, the respondent's submitted a Motion to Allow Mr. McClure to Amend its Expert Witness Report. McClure's one page amendment is attached to respondent's motion. Respondent's motion was marked as Hearing Officer Exhibit 3. Complainant submitted a Motion to Exclude Late-Disclosed Expert Opinion at the hearing on December 10, 2009. Complainant's motion was marked as Hearing Officer Exhibit 2. For the reasons set forth on record at the hearing on December 10, 2008, the complainant's motion was granted, however, the one page amendment attached to the respondent's motion was taken as an offer of proof.

## **Witness Credibility**

Based upon my legal judgment, experience and observations at the hearing, I find that the credibility of the witnesses that testified at the hearing is not an issue in this matter.

### **Exhibits**

An exhibit list itemizing the offered exhibits and summarizing their status is attached to this order.

## **Briefing Schedule**

A briefing schedule was discussed and agreed to subsequent the hearing. The complainant's post-hearing brief is due to be filed on or before February 16, 2009. The respondent's post-hearing brief is due to be filed on or before March 31, 2009. The complainant's reply, if any, is due to be filed on or before April 14, 2009. Public comment is due to be filed on or before February 23, 2009.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Bradley P. Halloran

**Hearing Officer** 

Illinois Pollution Control Board

James R. Thompson Center, Suite 11-500

ly P. Helon

100 W. Randolph Street

Chicago, Illinois 60601

312.814.8917

PCB 00-211 December 10, 11, 2009, Hearing

# **Exhibit List**

Exhibit	Description	Status
Hearing Officer Exhibit 1	Respondent's Motion to Include Narrative Testimony with Testimony attached	Denied Motion, attached Narrative Testimony taken as Offer of Proof
Hearing officer Exhibit 2	Complainant's Motion to Exclude Late- Dislosed Expert Opinion	Granted
Hearing officer Exhibit 3	Respondent's Motion to Allow Mr. McClure to Amend its Expert Witness Report and a 1 page attachment	Denied Motion, attached Amendment of Analysis of Economic Benefit taken as an Offer of Proof
Complainant's Exhibit 17	Toyal's Response to Request to Admit Facts, file stamped November 12, 2008	Admitted
Complainant's Exhibit 20	Resume of Gary Styzens and attached Revised Economic Benefit Analysis, dated March 29, 2006	Admitted
Complainant's Exhibit 21	CAAPP Application, dated February 1996	Admitted
Complainant's Exhibit 22	Toyal Construction Permit, date issued, May 30, 2001	Admitted
Respondent's Exhibit 2	Toyal Financial Report, dated, December 31, 2007	Admitted
Respondent's Exhibit 3	Chronological Data For Installation of V.O.C. Unit	Admitted
Respondent's Exhibit 4	Agency Letter to Roy Harsch, dated December 21, 2006	Admitted
Respondent's Exhibit 5	Stack Test Document, dated December 30, 1998	Admitted

Document re: Information requested by Agency, dated May 2, 2007  Letter from Toyal re; Additional Information for Permit Extension, dated February 19, 2002  Letter from Toyal re; Additional Information for Permit Extension, dated	Admitted Admitted
Letter from Toyal re; Additional Information for Permit Extension, dated February 19, 2002 Letter from Toyal re; Additional Information for Permit Extension, dated	
Information for Permit Extension, dated	ł – – – – – – – – – – – – – – – – – – –
February 26, 2002	Admitted
Agency Letter to Toyal re: Construction Permit, date issued, March 8, 2002	Admitted
Letter from Toyal to Agency re; Request for 180-Day Extension, dated August 19, 2002	Admitted
Letter from Toyal re: Agency October 9, 2002 Letter	Admitted
Agency Letter to Toyal re: Revised Construction Permit, date issued November 18, 2002	Admitted
Resume of Stephen B. Anderson	Admitted
Construction Permit, date issued May 30, 2001	Admitted
FESOP Permit, date issued November 25, 2003	Admitted
Construction Permit Grant, date issued June 6, 2005	Admitted
Resume of Christopher T. McClure	Admitted
Economic Benefit Analysis- Binder 1	Admitted
Economic Benefit Analysis – Binder 2- Capital Expenditures	Admitted
Expert Report of Christopher McClure, dated December 1, 2008	Taken as an Offer of Proof
Analysis of Economic Benefit (15 pages)	Taken as Offer of Proof
Analysis of Economic Benefit (1 page)	Taken as Offer of Proof
Clarification of the Use of Appendix I of the Clean Air Act document	Admitted
	Agency Letter to Toyal re: Construction Permit, date issued, March 8, 2002 Letter from Toyal to Agency re; Request for 180-Day Extension, dated August 19, 2002 Letter from Toyal re: Agency October 9, 2002 Letter Agency Letter to Toyal re: Revised Construction Permit, date issued November 18, 2002 Resume of Stephen B. Anderson Construction Permit, date issued May 30, 2001 FESOP Permit, date issued November 25, 2003 Construction Permit Grant, date issued June 6, 2005 Resume of Christopher T. McClure Economic Benefit Analysis – Binder 1 Economic Benefit Analysis – Binder 2- Capital Expenditures Expert Report of Christopher McClure, dated December 1, 2008  Analysis of Economic Benefit (15 pages)  Clarification of the Use of Appendix I of

Respondent's Exhibit 28	"Leveling The Playing Field", re:	Admitted
	Economic Benefit document	

### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

It is hereby certified that true copies of the foregoing order were mailed, first class, on January 28, 2009, to each of the persons on the attached service list.

It is hereby certified that a true copy of the foregoing order was hand delivered to the following on January 28, 2009:

John T. Therriault Illinois Pollution Control Board James R. Thompson Center 100 W. Randolph St., Ste. 11-500 Chicago, Illinois 60601

> Bradley P. Halloran Hearing Officer Illinois Pollution Control Board

James R. Thompson Center 100 West Randolph Street, Suite 11-500

Chicago, Illinois 60601

312.814.8917

PCB 2000-211 Roy M. Harsch Drinker Biddle & Reath 191 N. Wacker Drive Suite 3700 Chicago, IL 60606-1698

PCB 2000-211 Lawrence W. Falbe Drinker Biddle & Reath 191 N. Wacker Drive Suite 3700 Chicago, IL 60606-1698

PCB 2000-211 Vanessa A. Vail Office of the Attorney General Environmental Bureau 69 W. Washington, 18th Floor Chicago, IL 60602 PCB 2000-211 Yesenia Villasenor-Rodriguez Drinker Biddle & Reath 191 N. Wacker Drive Suite 3700 Chicago, IL 60606-1698

PCB 2000-211 Christopher J. Grant Office of the Attorney General Environmental Bureau 69 W. Washington, 18th Floor Chicago, IL 60602