1 BEFORE THE ILLINOIS POLLUTION CONTROL BOARD 2 3 CHARTER HALL HOMEOWNER'S ASSOCIATION) AND JEFF COHEN, Complainants, 5) No. PCB 98-81 6 OVERLAND TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM INC.,) 7 and D.P. CARTAGE, INC.,) VOLUME I 8 Respondents. 9 10 11 The PROCEEDINGS taken before JOHN BURDS, The 12 Hearing Officer, stenographically recorded by GEANNA 13 M. IAQUINTA, CSR, a notary public within and for the 14 County of Cook and State of Illinois, at the James 15 R. Thompson Center, 100 West Randolph Street, Room 16 8032, Chicago, Illinois, on the 12th day of May, 17 A.D., 1998, scheduled to commence at 9:30 a.m., 18 commencing at 9:45 a.m. 19 20 21 22 23 24

1 APPEARANCES:

2	ILLINOIS POLLUTION CONTROL BOARD
	100 West Randolph Street
3	Suite 11-500,
	Chicago, Illinois 60601
4	(312) 814-3669
5	BY: MR. JOHN BURDS
3	
6	JENNER & BLOCK,
7	One IBM Plaza
7	Chicago, Illinois 60611
8	(312) 222-9350 BY: MR. BILL S. FORCADE and MR. STEVEN M.
O	SIROS
9	
10	Appeared on behalf of the Complainants,
10	
11	McBRIDE, BAKER & COLES,
10	500 West Madison Street
12	40th Floor Chicago, Illinois 60661
13	(312) 715-5700
13	BY: MR. MARK J. STEGER
14	
	Appeared on behalf of the Respondents.
15	
16	
10	
17	
18	
10	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	

1 INDEX
2 PAGES
PAGES
GREETING BY HEARING OFFICER 4
OPENING STATE BY MR. FORCADE 6
TESTIMONY OF JEFFREY COHEN 11
6 TESTIMONY OF MARY ANN BERGAU 51
7 TESTIMONY OF DENNIS BERGAU 92
8 TESTIMONY OF BEHRAM DINSHAW 124
TESTIMONY OF TIBEBU SENBETTA 157
TESTIMONY OF KATHRYN HAYDEN 18:
TESTIMONY OF JUDITH LEXBY 203
12 CLOSING BY HEARING OFFICER 238 13
14 EXHIBITS
Marked for Identification
Complainants' Exhibit No. 1 13
17 Group Exhibit No. 1 56
Complainants' Exhibit No. 2 75
Complainants' Exhibit No. 3 75
Complainants' Exhibit No. 4 99
Complainants' Exhibit Nos. 5 22 and 6
23 Group Exhibit No. 2 126
24 Complainants' Exhibit No. 7 146

- THE HEARING OFFICER: Let the record reflect
- 2 that this is PCB 98-81 in the matter of Charter Hall
- 3 Homeowner's Association and various of its members
- 4 as complainants vs. Overland Transportation System,
- 5 Inc. and D.P. Cartage, Inc.
- 6 Today' date, for the record, is May 12th,
- 7 1998. It is approximately a quarter to 10:00 a.m.
- 8 in the morning. My name is Jack Burds. Welcome.
- 9 Pursuant to Board order, this matter has
- 10 been set for hearing and was scheduled for hearing
- 11 in compliance with the notice provisions as required
- 12 by the Environmental Protection Act and the Illinois
- 13 Pollution Control Board's procedural rules.
- 14 At this time, I would ask that counsel for
- 15 each party identify themselves. Mr. Forcade.
- 16 MR. FORCADE: Good morning, Mr. Hearing
- 17 Officer. My name is Bill Forcade, and with me is my
- 18 associate, Steven Siros. We're from the law firm of
- 19 Jenner & Block who represent the complainants, the
- 20 Charter Hall Homeowner's Association and various of
- 21 its members, including, but not limited to Jeffrey
- 22 Cohen.
- 23 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.
- 24 MR. STEGER: Yes. Thank you, Mr. Hearing

- 1 Officer. My name is Mark Steger. I'm with the law
- 2 firm of McBride, Baker & Coles, and I represent the
- 3 respondents in this matter Overland Transportation
- 4 System, Inc. and D.P. Cartage.
- 5 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. I will note for
- 6 the record that all attorneys have entered written
- 7 appearances in this matter. I will also indicate
- 8 for the record that prior to the -- prior to going
- 9 on the record, I discussed with counsel a motion
- 10 that was filed Friday afternoon, May 8th, 1998, a
- 11 joint -- well, a motion submitted by the respondents
- 12 in the form of an agreed motion requesting certain
- 13 agreed amendments to the complaint in this matter,
- 14 which I have allowed, and a written order will go to
- 15 that effect.
- 16 The motion also requested that this
- 17 proceeding be bifurcated and that this portion of
- 18 the proceeding deal with the liability issues and
- 19 that, if necessary, another hearing be scheduled to
- 20 deal with the issues related to any civil penalty.
- 21 That motion will also be allowed. There will be a
- 22 written order to that effect that should be mailed
- 23 to the parties and can certainly be faxed to the
- 24 parties sometime today.

- 1 All right. Now, at this point, I would
- 2 also indicate that there are members of the public
- 3 present. I believe certainly there are members
- 4 related to each of the parties, and as far as
- 5 preliminary motions, my understanding is that there
- 6 are none at this time. Is that correct, Mr.
- 7 Forcade?
- 8 MR. FORCADE: That's correct.
- 9 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Steger?
- 10 MR. STEGER: That's correct.
- 11 THE HEARING OFFICER: All right. Now, as far
- 12 as the order of the proceeding, we'll proceed in the
- 13 fashion as described under the procedural rules. At
- 14 this time I would ask if either of the attorneys
- 15 have opening statements.
- Mr. Forcade?
- 17 MR. FORCADE: I have a very brief opening
- 18 statement.
- 19 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you. Please.
- 20 MR. FORCADE: Thank you, Mr. Hearing Officer.
- 21 Members of the Board, ladies and gentlemen
- 22 of the audience, the complainants in this case are a
- 23 group of homeowners in a housing subdivision in
- 24 Palatine west of Route 53 and immediately south of

- 1 the Northwest Highway.
- 2 Our testimony will demonstrate that the
- 3 homeowners' subdivision is immediately adjacent to
- 4 and shares a common property line with the
- 5 respondents Overland Transportation and D.P.
- 6 Cartage.
- 7 By way of background, we will provide
- 8 testimony that the residents of Charter Hall lived
- 9 quite reasonably with the prior tenants of Overland
- 10 Transportation, but our testimony will show that
- 11 since Overland Transportation occupied the facility,
- 12 the noise has increased dramatically and that the
- 13 noise levels now and for the past several years of
- 14 Overland Transportation's occupation have been
- 15 unreasonable, illegal, and unacceptable for the
- 16 members of Charter Hall.
- We will show that the noise levels have
- 18 interfered with the routine normal daily activities
- 19 by the residents, including sleeping, communication,
- 20 watching TV, using their patios outside, and
- 21 recuperating from illnesses.
- We intend to make this demonstration by
- 23 providing three types of evidence. First, we will
- 24 provide testimony by eight residents from Charter

- 1 Hall who will testify that they have observed
- 2 activities at Overland Transportation that cause
- 3 noise and further testify that the noise caused by
- 4 those activities is unreasonably interfering with
- 5 their daily lives.
- 6 Second, we will introduce noise
- 7 measurements and other documents from Charter Hall
- 8 residents showing the loudness, the frequency, and
- 9 the duration of the noise.
- And, third, we will introduce testimony of
- 11 expert witnesses retained by Charter Hall to measure
- 12 and discuss the noise levels in the area.
- 13 As a totally separate matter, we will
- 14 introduce technical experts that will testify that
- 15 noise levels from Overland Transportation violate
- 16 the numerical noise limitations adopted by the
- 17 Illinois Pollution Control Board.
- We believe that the evidence is
- 19 overwhelming and will require the board to adopt the
- 20 remedies that we have requested. For remedies, we
- 21 will present expert testimony that there are
- 22 technically feasible and economically reasonable
- 23 methods of controlling noise from Overland
- 24 Transportation and that these methods include, but

- 1 are not limited to, constructing a tall, thick
- 2 wooden fence in between Overland Transportation and
- 3 the affected homes, enclosing in a sound-tight
- 4 device the truck loading and unloading operations,
- 5 which is one of the noisiest activities, and,
- 6 further, by restricting some of the noisiest
- 7 operations in both time and location at the
- 8 facility.
- We have further requested the Board to
- 10 require Overland Transportation to install
- 11 continuous noise monitors to monitor the future
- 12 noise levels of the facility to ensure future
- 13 compliance and to establish a schedule of stipulated
- 14 penalties for any future noise violations.
- We implore the Board to make its decision
- 16 in the fastest reasonable time and to command that
- 17 Overland Transportation implement all of the
- 18 requested noise reduction measures in the shortest
- 19 possible time not to exceed 30 days.
- We will further provide testimony that
- 21 Charter Hall has made diligent and reasonable
- 22 efforts in the past to contact Overland
- 23 Transportation and to attempt to secure reduction in
- 24 the noise levels from the facility, but that those

- 1 efforts were unsuccessful.
- 2 Only after those efforts were unsuccessful
- 3 did Charter Hall go to the time and expense to
- 4 retain technical experts and counsel to prosecute
- 5 this civil enforcement action before the Pollution
- 6 Control Board, and finally after the Board has
- 7 issued its interim order finding specific days of
- 8 violation and commanding implementation of the noise
- 9 reduction techniques, we have already requested a
- 10 second hearing at which we will address the issue of
- 11 civil penalties.
- 12 That concludes my opening statement.
- 13 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.
- 14 Mr. Steger?
- MR. STEGER: I have no opening statement at
- 16 this time.
- 17 THE HEARING OFFICER: All right. For the
- 18 record, we'll indicate that Mr. Steger has waived
- 19 opening statement at this time. However, I will ask
- 20 again at the beginning of his case in chief.
- 21 All right. The first witness.
- MR. SIROS: The first witness I'd like to call
- 23 is Jeff Cohen.
- 24 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. Mr. Cohen, it's

- 1 important that you speak clearly so the court
- 2 reporter can hear you. Will you be sworn in,
- 3 please? Can you swear in the witness, please?
- 4 (Witness sworn.)
- 5 THE HEARING OFFICER: Please state your name
- 6 and spell your last name for the record.
- 7 THE WITNESS: My name is Jeffrey Cohen,
- 8 C-o-h-e-n.
- JEFFREY COHEN,
- 10 called as a witness herein, having been first duly
- 11 sworn, deposeth and saith as follows:
- 12 DIRECT EXAMINATION
- by Mr. Siros
- 14 Q. Mr. Cohen, please tell us where you live.
- 15 A. I live at 647 Charter Hall Drive in
- 16 Palatine.
- 17 Q. And do you live there alone?
- 18 A. I live there with my wife Tara, T-a-r-a.
- 19 Q. Okay. Does anyone else reside there with
- 20 you?
- 21 A. No humans, just animals.
- Q. And what kind of animals do you have?
- A. We have cats and dogs.
- Q. And how many?

- 1 A. Three cats and two dogs.
- Q. Do you own your house?
- 3 A. Yes, I do.
- 4 Q. When did you move in?
- 5 A. I moved in in November of 1992.
- 6 Q. What's your occupation?
- 7 A. I'm a self-employed commodity trader.
- 8 Q. Are you taking time out to testify here
- 9 today?
- 10 A. Yes, I am.
- 11 Q. I'd like you to tell me where the Charter
- 12 Hall subdivision is located?
- 13 A. Charter Hall is located in Palatine south
- 14 of Northwest Highway between Smith Street and
- 15 Quinten immediately adjacent to Overland
- 16 Transportation.
- 17 Q. If I was to drive there from this building
- 18 here today, would you describe what route I would
- 19 take?
- 20 A. You would take the Kennedy past the
- 21 airport to the Northwest Tollway to 53. You'd go
- 22 north on 53 to Palatine Road, west on Palatine Road
- 23 to Northwest Highway, Route 14, and take 14 to
- 24 Charter Hall Drive and hang a left.

- Q. Would you identify the Overland facility
- 2 in terms of the geographic location with
- 3 relationship to the Charter Hall subdivision?
- 4 A. It is immediately to the east.
- 5 Q. I'd like to direct your attention to the
- 6 enlarged map on the stand there that I'd like to
- 7 mark for identification purposes Complainants'
- 8 Exhibit 1.
- 9 THE HEARING OFFICER: That's fine.
- 10 (Complainants' Exhibit No. 1
- 11 marked for identification,
- 12 5-12-98.)
- 13 THE HEARING OFFICER: Let the record reflect
- 14 that Complainants' Exhibit 1 is on an easel
- 15 approximately two-by-three-and-a-half feet square.
- 16 It appears to be a map.
- 17 BY MR. SIROS:
- 18 Q. Mr. Cohen, does that appear to be an
- 19 accurate representation of the Charter Hall
- 20 subdivision?
- 21 A. Yes.
- Q. Does that also appear, to the best of your
- 23 recollection, to be an accurate representation of
- 24 the Overland facility located directly to the east

- 1 of the Charter Hall subdivision?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Do you know when the homes in the Charter
- 4 Hall subdivision were constructed?
- 5 A. They were constructed during 1992. They
- 6 may have been begun in 1991, but the majority were
- 7 completed the end of 1992, very beginning of 1993.
- 8 Q. So after 1993, all the homes had been
- 9 constructed within the subdivision?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. I'd like for you to tell me a little bit
- 12 about the Charter Hall Homeowner's Association.
- 13 A. The Homeowner's Association is composed of
- 14 the 49 townhomes. Each townhouse has one vote at
- 15 our annual meeting, which is held in June of each
- 16 year. The association is run by a board of six
- 17 members.
- 18 Q. When was the association formed?
- 19 A. The association, the actual formation day
- 20 was before I moved in. However, we were handed off
- 21 to become self-governing by Pulte in 1993.
- Q. So Pulte ran the association?
- A. Pulte ran the association before us.
- Q. And what's the purpose of the association?
 - L.A. REPORTING (312) 419-9292

- 1 A. Basically to maintain the property,
- 2 enforce the rules, handling the assessments,
- 3 contracting, basically run the day-to-day
- 4 operations.
- 5 Q. And what's your role in the organization?
- 6 A. I'm president of the association.
- 7 Q. And how long have you been president?
- 8 A. On and off since the beginning. It was
- 9 either a one or two year period that I wasn't, but
- 10 I've been on the board since the beginning.
- 11 Q. And who was president during that period
- 12 when you weren't?
- 13 A. Bridget Sweeney.
- 14 Q. Did the association authorize the filing
- 15 of the complaint that's before the Pollution Control
- 16 Board today?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. I'd like to direct your attention back to
- 19 what we've marked for identification as
- 20 Complainants' Exhibit 1. Would you identify by
- 21 stating the numerical address of your house on that
- 22 blown-up exhibit?
- 23 A. 647.
- Q. So on that exhibit, your house is the unit

- 1 marked 647; is that correct?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. I request you to approach the exhibit and
- 4 put an X on your address in blue marker, please?
- 5 A. (Witness complied.)
- 6 MR. SIROS: Let the record reflect that
- 7 Mr. Cohen has marked Complainant's Exhibit 1 with a
- 8 blue X at the number 647, which represents his
- 9 address.
- 10 THE HEARING OFFICER: The record will so
- 11 reflect.
- 12 BY MR. SIROS:
- 13 Q. Would you please describe generally the
- 14 layout of your home?
- 15 A. My home is two stories. The first floor
- 16 is the kitchen, living room, dining room, and
- 17 one-half bathroom. Upstairs are three bedrooms and
- 18 two additional baths. The master bedroom faces east
- 19 and overlooks Overland Transportation.
- Q. And what is on the east end of your -- the
- 21 east part of your house on the first floor?
- 22 A. On the first floor there is a patio and
- 23 there is the dining room and the living room.
- Q. Would you describe the view from your
 - L.A. REPORTING (312) 419-9292

- 1 first floor dining room?
- A. Looking out you have our patio and then a
- 3 fence which was constructed by Pulte blocking the
- 4 view into Overland.
- 5 Q. And which direction is that view?
- 6 A. That view is east.
- 7 Q. Would you please describe the view from
- 8 your second floor bedroom, master bedroom?
- 9 A. From the second floor bedroom, you
- 10 overlook the patio and then you view directly into
- 11 Overland Transportation.
- 12 Q. Can you see Overland Transportation from
- 13 your second floor window?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. And what do you see when you look out?
- 16 A. I see the truck terminal and most of the
- 17 time I see Overland trucks along with the few other
- 18 trucks with a few other names, Zelner, I've seen
- 19 Frontier.
- Q. How far is your patio to the fence line?
- A. I'd say it's about 40 feet.
- Q. When you moved in in November of 1992,
- 23 were you aware that there was a trucking operation
- 24 located directly to the east of your property?

- 1 A. Yes, I was aware that Yellow was there,
- 2 but whenever we visited the property, they -- the
- 3 noise was really nothing.
- 4 Q. Were you aware that a notice of operation
- 5 of a trucking facility had been filed by Pulte prior
- 6 to your moving in?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Besides -- sorry.
- 9 Could you describe what you did, if
- 10 anything, to determine whether or not there would be
- 11 noise from the trucking operation located next door?
- 12 A. We had visited the property several times
- 13 and had never really noticed any noise or any
- 14 unreasonable noise.
- 15 Q. Who was the -- to the best of your
- 16 knowledge, who was the operator of that property
- 17 when you moved in in November 1992?
- 18 A. Yellow Freight.
- 19 Q. After November 1992, when did you first --
- 20 when were you first bothered by noise from the
- 21 facility?
- 22 A. Very occasionally we would be bothered by
- 23 Yellow Freight. Maybe every couple of weeks, once
- 24 every three weeks it would wake us up at night.

- 1 There would be a boom or something, but for the most
- 2 part, it wasn't a day-to-day occurrence. It was
- 3 fairly infrequently.
- 4 Q. And would you describe the type of noise
- 5 that you heard when you moved in in November of
- 6 1992?
- A. There would be assorted bangs associated
- 8 with the loading and unloading of the trailers.
- 9 Q. I'd like to bring you to the present. I
- 10 would ask you to answer how often the noise occurs
- 11 now?
- 12 A. It is almost a daily occurrence.
- 13 Sometimes it's a little less on weekends, but
- 14 probably six days out of seven is a good...
- 15 Q. Is there a particular day when you don't
- 16 hear noise?
- 17 A. If there's any day that we're not going to
- 18 hear noise, it would usually be Sunday during the
- 19 day.
- Q. Okay. I would like to take you through a
- 21 period, let's say, a typical Monday. We'll start at
- 22 8:00 in the morning and I'd like you to run to 8:00
- 23 in the morning the next day. I'd like you to
- 24 describe the times that you're bothered by the noise

- 1 from the operations.
- A. Well, 8:00 in the morning I'm already
- 3 downtown.
- 4 Q. Okay.
- 5 A. But then when I come home, I usually get
- 6 home around 3:30 in the afternoon. Occasionally,
- 7 it's noisy, but usually it's fairly quiet until
- 8 roughly dinner time, 5:30, 6:00 o'clock, when we
- 9 hear more banging.
- 10 Then it has -- sometimes they'll slow down
- 11 until 8:00 o'clock or so when occasionally there
- 12 will be a few more bangs, but the majority of the
- 13 time the banging starts between 10:00, 11:00
- 14 o'clock, usually 10:00, 10:30 in the evening and
- 15 continues for about an hour, and then on the times
- 16 that it wakes me up, usually that's around 2:30 in
- 17 the morning or so, 2:00, 2:30 in the morning.
- 18 It will continue for an hour or so, and
- 19 then when I get up in the morning at 5:00 o'clock in
- 20 the morning, I usually hear them in the morning.
- Q. And from 5:00 o'clock in the morning until
- 22 you leave for work, do you hear the noise?
- A. Usually yes.
- Q. And what time do you leave for work?

- 1 A. I leave for work at 5:20.
- 2 Q. Would you describe the types of noises
- 3 that you hear from the Overland facility?
- 4 A. I hear two types of banging. I hear a
- 5 double -- a loud double bang that I've since learned
- 6 is from the hooking and unhooking of the trailers.
- 7 Q. Okay. Let me ask you how you learned that
- 8 fact?
- 9 A. Overland Transportation, at a meeting we
- 10 had with them, told me that's what it was from.
- 11 Q. Okay. Have you ever seen any -- have you
- 12 ever physically observed the loading and unloading
- 13 operations and then associated the noise with that?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. And what other types of noises?
- 16 A. I hear the -- I hear another type of
- 17 banging when the forklifts actually load onto the
- 18 truck when they drive into the truck and drop their
- 19 loads.
- Q. And what kind of noise is that?
- 21 A. That is another type of bang.
- 22 Q. Okay.
- A. And then occasionally I will hear it's
- 24 almost like a screech of metal being dragged across

- 1 something.
- Q. Okay. And have you observed any specific
- 3 activity at Overland that you can associate with
- 4 that type of noise?
- 5 A. No.
- 6 Q. I'd like to now direct your attention to
- 7 the three types of noises that you just described.
- 8 I'd like you to go through each specific type and
- 9 tell me the range of time that you hear that noise?
- 10 A. Usually the bangs it will be -- you'll
- 11 hear a bang, bang when they're hooking up the
- 12 trailers and then nothing. It's a sharp single
- 13 bang. When they're loading and unloading the
- 14 trailers, it's the same type where it's a single
- 15 bang and then silence or until they load another
- 16 type of trailer, but it's not ever a continuous, you
- 17 know, bang, bang, bang, bang. It's always a
- 18 bang, and then there will be a pause, and then
- 19 another bang.
- Q. When they're loading and unloading the
- 21 trailers, how many times in a ten-minute period do
- 22 you hear the bang?
- A. Depending on the level of how many
- 24 trailers they're unloading, a lot. I mean, I would

- 1 have to say maybe sometimes every ten, 15 seconds
- 2 I'll hear something.
- 3 Q. Now, I'd like you to describe how the
- 4 noise has affected your daily life?
- 5 A. Well, for the most part, I can't use my
- 6 patio because if you open the door and you sit out
- 7 on the patio, you're just going to hear the bangings
- 8 all day.
- 9 Q. Did you use your patio when you moved in
- 10 in November of 1992?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. And when did you have to stop using your
- 13 patio?
- 14 A. I pretty much haven't used it since the
- 15 summer of -- that would have been the summer of '96.
- 16 Q. Okay. And what other affect, if any, has
- 17 this had on your life?
- 18 A. Well, I mean, I'm a commodity trader. I
- 19 get up very early in the morning. I'm also a very
- 20 sound sleeper. They do, however, wake me up on
- 21 occasion, which is actually pretty hard to do, and
- 22 if they wake me up, I'm usually up then for an hour
- 23 or so hearing them, and then the next day while I'm
- 24 trading, there have been times where I literally

- 1 have been so tired I fall asleep in the pit.
- 2 It also affects me because my wife, who is
- 3 more sensitive to the noise than me, and her side of
- 4 the bed is closer to the window, she's always tired
- 5 because she's up almost every night.
- 6 Q. Any other affects on your life besides the
- 7 inability to sleep?
- 8 A. There are times that it's hard to carry on
- 9 a normal conversation just because you're
- 10 interrupted. Downstairs you hear just a continuous
- 11 banging.
- 12 Q. Is that a conversation in the house?
- 13 A. In the house, yes. There will be times
- 14 that literally the noise will be so loud it will
- 15 literally shake the house and scare the animals.
- 16 Q. Are you able to have the windows open
- 17 during the springtime?
- 18 A. For the most part, no.
- 19 Q. Can you identify a specific event, a
- 20 specific time, when the noise particularly affected
- 21 you?
- A. I can remember the last specific time that
- 23 they woke me up at night.
- Q. When was that?

- 1 A. It was April 27th. I believe it was the
- 2 27th or the 29th. I think it was the 27th.
- 3 Q. Okay. And what year was that?
- 4 A. That was this year.
- 5 Q. And why does that -- why do you remember
- 6 that particularly?
- A. Because it was one of the times where they
- 8 were very loud. It was one of the times they woke
- 9 me up at night, and I remember going to work
- 10 literally having to sit down -- sitting down in the
- 11 trading pit after a little while and dozing off for
- 12 15 minutes.
- 13 Q. How has the frequency of noise changed
- 14 from November 1992 when you moved in to the present?
- 15 A. It's a lot more. It's magnitudes larger.
- 16 Before it was an occasional thing. Now, it's a
- 17 day-in-and-day-out thing.
- 18 Q. Has the type of noise changed since
- 19 November of 1992 to present?
- 20 A. It's louder.
- 21 Q. I'd like to direct your attention to the
- 22 previous efforts you personally and the association
- 23 has taken to attempt to resolve these noise
- 24 complaints with Overland.

- Can you tell me the first time that you
- 2 tried to resolve these?
- 3 A. The first time that we actually tried to
- 4 resolve them with Overland, we had talked to people
- 5 at Overland at the Palatine yard.
- 6 Q. Do you recall who you spoke with?
- 7 A. Offhand, no. We have called them.
- 8 Sometimes when they were loud, we would call them at
- 9 night to say listen, we're trying to sleep here, and
- 10 their response was basically well, we have a job to
- 11 do, and they just continued.
- 12 Eventually, it reached a point where we,
- 13 the homeowners, arranged a meeting with several
- 14 people from Overland, John DePietro, who we
- 15 understood to be in charge. There was a Don
- 16 Trujillo or something like that who was in charge of
- 17 the actual Palatine facility. We had a meeting with
- 18 them at the Palatine Village Hall.
- 19 Q. Do you recall the date of that meeting?
- A. It was May of 1996. I don't know the
- 21 exact date.
- Q. Okay. And would you describe what
- 23 happened at this meeting?
- 24 A. We had what we felt was a positive meeting

- 1 with Overland. They basically said yes, we know
- 2 we're loud. We know we have a problem. We're going
- 3 to work to see what we can do to eliminate the
- 4 noise, whether it's cushioning the dock plates or
- 5 maybe looking at building a fence, or we'll see what
- 6 we can do.
- 7 Q. Uh-huh.
- 8 A. And we thought, you know, this is good.
- 9 We've made progress. We're willing to be a little
- 10 patient because, you know, they said that they'll
- 11 work with us, and we felt it was a very positive
- 12 meeting.
- 13 Q. And how did the noise change after the
- 14 May '96 meeting?
- 15 A. If anything, it got worse.
- 16 Q. Was this immediately after the meeting
- 17 or --
- 18 A. No. It was just -- it was just a general
- 19 creep upward. As the facility got busier, the noise
- 20 increased.
- Q. What additional actions, if any, did you
- 22 take to attempt to resolve these noise concerns?
- A. We had -- I know some of the homeowners
- 24 had gone to the Village of Palatine to complain and

- 1 have basically gotten nowhere. We have tried
- 2 calling the police and have gotten nowhere. We had
- 3 contacted Overland again and said basically listen,
- 4 you know, if you -- you know, we've got to do
- 5 something and we're going to go to the Pollution
- 6 Control Board if we have to.
- 7 Q. And then what happened?
- 8 A. Nothing.
- 9 Q. And did you have any additional meetings
- 10 with Overland?
- 11 A. We did not -- we did not have any
- 12 additional meetings between Overland and the actual
- 13 Homeowner's Association.
- 14 Q. Did you have any meeting -- any other
- 15 meeting that you participated in with Overland?
- 16 A. I participated in a meeting with my
- 17 attorneys in May of 1997 at their office.
- 18 Q. And can you identify those attorneys,
- 19 please?
- 20 A. It was -- Bill Forcade was there and I
- 21 don't remember what his name is, the other attorney
- 22 in the back (indicating).
- 23 THE HEARING OFFICER: Let the record reflect
- 24 that the witness is pointing to, I believe, Mr.

- 1 Steger, but I am not --
- 2 THE WITNESS: No.
- 3 THE HEARING OFFICER: -- sure.
- 4 THE WITNESS: No.
- 5 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. Apparently the
- 6 party that he's identified as an attorney is the one
- 7 witness Mr. Steger has brought with him.
- 8 BY MR. SIROS:
- 9 Q. And what was discussed at the meeting?
- 10 A. Different types of noise solutions of what
- 11 basically they could do to reduce the noise.
- 12 Q. I'm sorry. Do you recall when that
- 13 meeting was that you had with your attorneys?
- 14 A. It was May of 1997. I think it was
- 15 like -- I think it was the 29th. It was the end of
- 16 the month.
- 17 Q. And, again, can you describe what was
- 18 discussed at that meeting?
- 19 A. The types of noise and different solutions
- 20 that Overland could take that would reduce the
- 21 noise.
- Q. Do you recall some of the solutions or
- 23 possible solutions that were discussed?
- A. Some of the possible solutions that we had
 - L.A. REPORTING (312) 419-9292

- 1 suggested were building a fence, a sound proof
- 2 fence, possibly enclosing the truck base, cushioning
- 3 the dock plates, replacing the yard tractor trailer,
- 4 which was something new that we had never seen until
- 5 Overland, possibly -- we had suggested possibly
- 6 restricting their hours or just operating on the
- 7 other side of the building at night.
- 8 Q. Would you describe the yard trailer? I'm
- 9 sorry.
- 10 A. The yard trailer is a -- it looks like a
- 11 weird cab of a truck. They use it to move the
- 12 trailers back and forth around.
- 13 Q. And you physically observed this?
- 14 A. I have physically observed it, yes.
- 15 Q. I'd also like to ask you when you said
- 16 that you suggested that -- you know, one of the
- 17 suggestions was that they carry on operations on the
- 18 other side of the building, what side of the
- 19 building do they currently carry on operations to
- 20 the best of your knowledge?
- A. Right now, they use both sides. Just from
- 22 general observing, it seems that they use the west
- 23 side more than the east side, but I might be
- 24 mistaken. I can't see the east side.

- 1 Q. And how is that -- I'll rephrase that.
- When you're looking out your upstairs
- 3 window, which side of the facility do you see?
- 4 A. I see their west side.
- 5 Q. Okay. And so the suggestion was that they
- 6 carry on their operations on the east side?
- 7 A. On the other side, yes.
- 8 Q. Okay. And what was their response, if
- 9 any, to your suggestions?
- 10 A. They said that they would discuss it with
- 11 their engineers and their operation people in
- 12 Indianapolis and see what they could do to reduce
- 13 the noise.
- 14 Q. And how did the noise change after the
- 15 May of '97 meeting?
- 16 A. For the most part, it didn't. It might be
- 17 a little worse now, but it's at the same basic
- 18 day-in-and-day-out level.
- 19 Q. One final question.
- When were you last bothered by noise from
- 21 the Overland facility?
- A. The last time I was bothered by noise
- 23 would have been yesterday morning.
- Q. And what type of noise was that?

- 1 A. I heard the general banging when I went to
- 2 work about 5:00, 5:15 in the morning I heard them
- 3 banging.
- 4 Q. Did that wake you up in the morning?
- 5 A. No, it didn't wake me up. My alarm woke
- 6 me up, and then I heard them just sitting there
- 7 banging. When I was out walking the dogs, I heard
- 8 them banging.
- 9 MR. SIROS: No further questions.
- 10 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Steger?
- 11 MR. STEGER: Yes. Thank you.
- 12 CROSS EXAMINATION
- by Mr. Steger
- 14 Q. I just have first a few questions on
- 15 geographics referring to Complainants' Exhibit
- 16 No. 1.
- 17 THE HEARING OFFICER: Whatever you need,
- 18 Mr. Steger. If you want me to move the easel, I'll
- 19 do that or I don't know what's easier for you.
- 20 MR. STEGER: I need the exercise.
- 21 BY MR. STEGER:
- Q. Could you -- could we have a pen? Let's
- 23 do -- what colors do you got? Let's do black.
- With respect to the geography or the
 - L.A. REPORTING (312) 419-9292

- 1 layout of this area, could you identify what is
- 2 directly underneath the Northwest Highway on this
- 3 exhibit?
- 4 A. Sure. That --
- 5 Q. I'll write it in.
- 6 A. The little box, that is the --
- 7 Q. The --
- 8 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. Hold on. Hold
- 9 on. Let him finish for the court reporter's sake.
- 10 BY THE WITNESS:
- 11 A. That little box is White Hall Plaza. It's
- 12 a small shopping center.
- 13 BY MR. STEGER:
- 14 Q. A strip mall?
- 15 A. More offices than stores though.
- 16 Q. Okay. So this is White Hall?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. Let the record
- 19 reflect that Mr. Steger is writing in under
- 20 Northwest Highway on the exhibit identified as
- 21 Complainants' Exhibit 1 the term White Hall directly
- 22 under the type print Northwest Highway.
- 23 BY MR. STEGER:
- Q. And Northwest Highway is how many lanes?

- 1 A. It is four lanes.
- 2 Q. Two in each direction?
- 3 A. Two in each direction.
- 4 Q. What is immediately east of Overland
- 5 Transportation?
- 6 A. That is another shopping center.
- 7 Q. Do you happen to know the name of the
- 8 shopping center?
- 9 A. Offhand, I don't know the name of it.
- 10 Q. I'll just mark this shopping.
- Does it go from Northwest Highway --
- 12 A. Pretty much --
- 13 Q. -- all the way down the length of Overland
- 14 on the east?
- 15 A. Pretty much. So yeah, it's the back of
- 16 it.
- 17 Q. Okay.
- 18 THE HEARING OFFICER: Let the record reflect
- 19 that Mr. Steger is now writing on the -- what would
- 20 be the east side or what would be represented as the
- 21 east portion of the document labeled Complainants'
- 22 Exhibit 1 shopping center adjacent to what has been
- 23 identified at the Overland Transportation Center.

1 BY MR. STEGER:

- Q. What is on the north side of Northwest
- 3 Highway?
- 4 A. There are other subdivisions.
- 5 Q. Residential subdivisions?
- 6 A. Residential subdivisions. Auburn Woods is
- 7 the one immediately across the street.
- 8 Q. Of Charter Hall?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Auburn -- I'm sorry, Auburn?
- 11 A. Woods.
- 12 Q. Woods.
- 13 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. Let the record
- 14 reflect that on Complainants' Exhibit 1, Mr. Steger
- 15 has now marked or written in the term Auburn Woods
- 16 not immediately on top of the Northwest Highway type
- 17 face, but north of the Northwest Highway.
- 18 BY MR. STEGER:
- 19 Q. Okay. Are you familiar then with the
- 20 dividing line between Overland and Charter Hall?
- 21 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. Is there a fence built on this?
- A. Yes, there is a fence.
- Q. How far does the fence extend?

- 1 A. The fence extends pretty much from unit
- 2 699 --
- 3 Q. 699.
- 4 A. -- and it continues down pretty much
- 5 through unit 627.
- 6 Q. And how high is that fence?
- 7 A. Eight feet or so.
- 8 Q. Okay. So from approximately 699 down to
- 9 627?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. It's an eight foot high fence?
- 12 A. Yes, it's roughly eight foot high. It's
- 13 eight foot high on our side. On Overland's side,
- 14 there is a drop off.
- 15 Q. Okay. Let's first focus on the fence.
- 16 A. Okay.
- 17 THE HEARING OFFICER: Before you proceed, let
- 18 the record reflect that Mr. Steger has marked from
- 19 what has been identified as unit 699 to unit 627,
- 20 which are apparently units within the Charter Hall
- 21 subdivision or Homeowner's Association going
- 22 north/south or south, north/south. It's a thicker
- 23 line that was previously there marked by black
- 24 marker.

1 BY MR. STEGER:

- Q. And with respect to the -- well, let's
- 3 finish this.
- 4 You said on your side of the fence line
- 5 how far is it to your -- how far is it to your
- 6 patio?
- A. To the edge of my patio, the furthest edge
- 8 of my patio it would be 20, 30 feet.
- 9 Q. Okay. Probably another ten feet to the
- 10 house?
- 11 A. Yeah, and then there's another ten, 15
- 12 feet from the patio to the house.
- 13 Q. And is it level?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. And then you previously mentioned that it
- 16 drops off on Overland?
- 17 A. It drops off on Overland's side a couple
- 18 of feet.
- 19 Q. Okay. So on the west side, do you know
- 20 how far of a drop it is from the fence line to
- 21 Overland's property or driveway?
- A. I would say it's 15 feet or so.
- 23 Q. Okay. Fifteen feet inside of
- 24 Overland's --

- 1 A. Yeah. It's roughly 15 feet, maybe 20 feet
- 2 until you get to Overland's actual property.
- 3 Q. And do you know how far of a drop it is
- 4 from the fence?
- 5 A. Three feet or so.
- 6 Q. Up by lot -- house 699 and 695, is there a
- 7 fence coming out from approximately the location of
- 8 those two units all the way across Overland's
- 9 property?
- 10 A. It's a cyclone fence.
- 11 Q. Do you know approximately where it starts?
- 12 A. No. Offhand, I really couldn't tell you.
- 13 Q. Okay. All right. We'll do that later
- 14 then.
- On the south part of the facility, is
- 16 there a fence along the south side of Overland's
- 17 property?
- 18 A. I believe there is.
- 19 Q. Do you know which unit it goes into?
- 20 A. No.
- Q. Okay. What is south of that fence line?
- A. Wetland area.
- Q. A wetland area. Okay.
- What is west here of Charter Hall?
 - L.A. REPORTING (312) 419-9292

- 1 A. That is the Deer Run Housing Association.
- Q. Deer Run?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. Let the record
- 5 reflect that Mr. Steger has now marked -- written
- 6 the terms Deer Run based on the north direction
- 7 along Complainants' Exhibit 1 directly to the west
- 8 of the Charter Hall -- what has been identified as
- 9 the Charter Hall Homeowner's Association.
- 10 BY MR. STEGER:
- 11 Q. Further south of Overland and Charter
- 12 Hall, are there train tracks there?
- 13 A. There are train tracks. They are south.
- 14 Q. They are south of Overland and Charter
- 15 Hall?
- 16 A. Significantly further south.
- 17 Q. Is it a commuter line?
- 18 A. For the most part, yes. It's the Union
- 19 Pacific line.
- Q. The Union Pacific line.
- Is there a depot near there?
- A. The depot is a mile, a mile and a half
- 23 away.
- Q. Do you know which direction?
 - L.A. REPORTING (312) 419-9292

- 1 A. It is pretty much south. It is south and
- 2 maybe a little southeast.
- 3 Q. Okay. I don't have any other questions
- 4 right now on that.
- 5 Okay. You say you purchased your property
- 6 in November of 1992?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. When did you actually enter into a
- 9 contract?
- 10 A. It wasn't much before that. Maybe
- 11 September.
- 12 Q. But you had visited the area before?
- 13 A. Yeah, we had visited the area several
- 14 times.
- 15 Q. Was the fence constructed when you
- 16 visited?
- 17 THE HEARING OFFICER: For the record, which
- 18 fence are you referring to?
- 19 MR. STEGER: The fence that I marked on the
- 20 exhibit running from the property line 699 through
- 21 627.
- 22 BY THE WITNESS:
- A. I really don't remember.

1 BY MR. STEGER:

- Q. You don't remember.
- 3 And you had previously testified that you
- 4 visited the property several times?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. When was that?
- 7 A. During the -- after we had signed the
- 8 contract during construction.
- 9 Q. And what part of the day?
- 10 A. It would have been different times of the
- 11 day. Basically, daylight hours, maybe early
- 12 evening.
- 13 Q. Okay. Did you ever ask the IEPA to
- 14 investigate the noise coming from the facility?
- 15 A. I know my wife talked to Greg Zack of the
- 16 EPA about the noise.
- 17 Q. But you didn't personally?
- 18 A. I did not personally, no.
- 19 Q. Was your unit constructed when you visited
- 20 it?
- 21 A. It was in the process of being
- 22 constructed.
- Q. And describe for me how these units sit?
- 24 Are they single freestanding townhomes or are they

- 1 connected to each other?
- 2 A. They are connected to each other.
- 3 However, the black line in the middle is the
- 4 demarcation of each separate building.
- 5 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. Let the record
- 6 reflect that there are thicker black lines between
- 7 certain units on the document marked as
- 8 Complainants' Exhibit 1, which Mr. Cohen has
- 9 identified as space between.
- 10 BY MR. STEGER:
- 11 Q. So your -- do you live in a unit that
- 12 consists of six units running from 647, which is
- 13 your unit, south to 627 or are those separate
- 14 buildings?
- 15 A. That is all one building.
- 16 Q. That's all one building, and you are on
- 17 the north side?
- 18 A. I'm on the north side, yes.
- 19 Q. Were there other units for sale when you
- 20 went to visit this property?
- A. Yes, there were.
- Q. Do you recall whether your unit was one of
- 23 the last units to sell or not?
- A. No, it was not one of the last units to

- 1 sell.
- 2 Q. Do you know what you paid for the unit?

- 3 MR. SIROS: Objection, relevance.
- 4 MR. STEGER: If I ask the next question, you'll
- 5 find out.
- 6 THE HEARING OFFICER: I'll let it -- I'll allow
- 7 it.
- 8 BY THE WITNESS:
- 9 A. It was the low 150s.
- 10 BY MR. STEGER:
- 11 Q. Do you know whether there are identical
- 12 units to yours on the other side of Charter Hall
- 13 Drive, the other side being the west side?
- 14 A. The ones on the west side all have
- 15 basements. Our side does not have basements.
- 16 Q. Other than that, they consist of the same
- 17 general --
- 18 A. They are the same general style.
- 19 Q. And you would expect those houses to be --
- 20 those units to be a little bit more expensive
- 21 because they have a basement?
- 22 A. Yes.
- Q. Do you know whether -- let's see.
- 24 Do you recall reading the Charter Hall
 - L.A. REPORTING (312) 419-9292

- 1 declarations of covenants, conditions, and
- 2 restrictions?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. Do you know when you received that?
- 5 A. I received that right around the time I
- 6 moved in. I don't remember if it was immediately
- 7 before or after, but I know we had looked at it
- 8 before we moved in. I don't know when I actually
- 9 received my little folder.
- 10 Q. Have you seen what has been filed as the
- 11 joint stipulation of facts referred and Exhibit C?
- 12 Have you seen that filing?
- 13 THE HEARING OFFICER: Hold on. Before we
- 14 proceed, how do we want to deal with the joint
- 15 exhibit here, gentlemen?
- 16 As far as the joint exhibit, for the
- 17 record, a joint stipulation was submitted by the
- 18 parties in this case. It consists of several
- 19 attached exhibits with the stipulation of certain
- 20 what the parties have represented to be relevant
- 21 facts in this case.
- Now, as far as referring to it, how do we
- 23 want to -- do we want to admit that document?
- 24 Putting it before the Board now with the clerk, are

- 1 we going to be admitting a separate document to
- 2 refer to or to have witnesses refer to? How will we
- 3 proceed here? Mr. Forcade?
- 4 MR. FORCADE: Can we go off the record for a
- 5 minute?
- 6 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. Let's go off the
- 7 record.
- 8 (Discussion had
- 9 off the record.)
- 10 THE HEARING OFFICER: Let the record reflect
- 11 that we are now back on the record at 98-81 after
- 12 going off the record pursuant to counsel's request
- 13 related to the joint stipulation.
- While off the record, joint counsel --
- 15 counsel for each party identified three pages that
- 16 have been -- copies of which have been handed to the
- 17 hearing officer. What has been agreed is that a
- 18 complete exhibit including the three pages will be
- 19 put together. I don't know which party is going to
- 20 take on that responsibility. I will ask --
- 21 Mr. Steger has indicated that he will take on that
- 22 responsibility.
- What we will do then with the joint
- 24 stipulation -- for the record, a joint stipulation

- 1 has been entered into in this case. It is
- 2 identified as such. We will refer to it as a joint
- 3 exhibit, Joint Exhibit 1, and all attached exhibits
- 4 thereto.
- 5 Upon any use of that for now, we will use
- 6 what we have with the three pages, but what I would
- 7 like hopefully before the end of the day is a
- 8 complete joint stipulation with all attached
- 9 exhibits including the three pages that have been
- 10 given to me to be submitted and marked as I
- 11 previously indicated so that we may refer to it and
- 12 that if witnesses are required to refer to it, they
- 13 may do so and we all have the same document.
- 14 Mr. Forcade?
- MR. FORCADE: Yes. Would it be possible
- 16 to make it before the commencement of the hearing
- 17 tomorrow? If we're going to have copies of it, I'm
- 18 not sure we can get it before the end of business
- 19 today with the testimony. So if we could submit it
- 20 prior to the opening of hearing tomorrow.
- 21 THE HEARING OFFICER: That's not a problem.
- 22 MR. FORCADE: Okay.
- 23 THE HEARING OFFICER: I guess I was hoping that
- 24 during the lunch break, if possible, but that's --

- 1 you know, that's my -- but I will not impose that
- 2 upon Mr. Steger. However, we are in the
- 3 Complainants' case in chief. The sooner the better
- 4 for all our sake. That's all I would request.
- 5 Certainly before the hearing begins tomorrow.
- 6 All right. Mr. Steger, you were in the
- 7 middle of cross-examination.
- 8 BY MR. STEGER:
- 9 Q. Back to the fence, the wooden fence, who
- 10 built fence?
- 11 A. I believe it was built by Pulte.
- 12 Q. I've got a few more questions here.
- 13 Okay.
- But for the Overland activities, what time
- 15 do you usually wake up for work in the morning?
- 16 A. 5:00 o'clock.
- 17 Q. And you leave?
- 18 A. 5:20, 5:25, sometime around then.
- 19 Q. And you return from work?
- A. I'm usually home around 3:30.
- 21 Q. Do you know what time you go to bed at
- 22 night?
- 23 A. 10:00 o'clock.
- Q. Is there anything else that disturbs your

- 1 sleep?
- 2 A. For the most part, no.
- 3 Q. Lucky you.
- 4 Are there other sounds that you hear?
- 5 A. What do you mean other sounds?
- 6 Q. Do you hear aircraft noise?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Do you have an air conditioning unit?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Birds flying overhead?
- 11 A. There are birds. I don't really hear
- 12 them.
- 13 Q. Do you hear traffic from Northwest
- 14 Highway?
- 15 A. No.
- 16 Q. You personally didn't take any sound
- 17 measurements?
- 18 A. No. My wife pretty much took the sound
- 19 measurements.
- Q. With respect to the makeup of your unit,
- 21 you indicated that there are three bedrooms
- 22 upstairs?
- 23 A. Yes.
- Q. Does only -- how many bedrooms face the

- 1 Overland property?
- 2 A. Just the master bedroom.
- 3 Q. And the other two are located where?
- 4 A. On the other side, on the west side.
- 5 Q. Facing Charter Hall Drive?
- 6 A. Facing Charter Hall.
- 7 MR. STEGER: I don't have any other questions.
- 8 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Siros.
- 9 MR. SIROS: Yes, just a couple questions.
- 10 REDIRECT EXAMINATION
- 11 by Mr. Siros
- 12 Q. When you moved in in November of 1992,
- 13 were you bothered by noise in the middle of the
- 14 night or early morning from the Yellow Freight
- 15 operation?
- 16 A. Every once in a while we would be.
- 17 Q. And when you say every once in a while,
- 18 could you assign a frequency to that?
- 19 A. Maybe every three weeks, once a month.
- 20 Nothing really that much.
- Q. And could you compare that to present?
- A. To present, it's almost -- it's pretty
- 23 much a daily thing.
- 24 MR. SIROS: Okay. Nothing else.

- 1 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Steger, any recross?
- 2 MR. STEGER: No.
- 3 THE HEARING OFFICER: No. All right.
- 4 Mr. Cohen, you may step down. The next
- 5 witness.
- 6 MR. SIROS: I call Mary Ann Bergau.
- 7 THE HEARING OFFICER: Ms. Bergau, welcome.
- 8 THE WITNESS: Thank you.
- 9 THE HEARING OFFICER: It's important that you
- 10 speak clearly.
- 11 THE WITNESS: Okay.
- 12 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Cohen did fine. He
- 13 was a fine example. We'll use Mr. Cohen as our
- 14 example for good testimony here, testifying loudly
- 15 and clearly.
- All right. Would you please swear in the
- 17 witness, Ms. Iaquinta?
- 18 (Witness sworn.)
- 19 THE HEARING OFFICER: Would you please state
- 20 your name and spell your last name for the record?
- 21 THE WITNESS: Mary Ann Bergau, B, as in boy,
- 22 e-r-g-a-u.
- 23 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you. Mr. Siros.

- 1 MARY ANN BERGAU,
- 2 called as a witness herein, having been first duly
- 3 sworn, deposeth and saith as follows:
- 4 DIRECT EXAMINATION
- 5 by Mr. Siros
- 6 Q. Ms. Bergau, would you please identify on
- 7 the exhibit that's been marked as Complainants'
- 8 Exhibit No. 1 the location of your home?
- 9 THE HEARING OFFICER: Let the record reflect --
- 10 BY THE WITNESS:
- 11 A. We live at 667.
- 12 THE HEARING OFFICER: Let the record reflect
- 13 that Mrs. Bergau has approached Complainants'
- 14 Exhibit 1 and placed a red X on the unit identified
- 15 as 667.
- 16 BY MR. SIROS:
- 17 Q. And do you reside there alone?
- 18 A. No. I live there with my husband Dennis.
- 19 Q. And does anyone else live there with you?
- 20 A. My son has moved in now temporarily. He
- 21 just moved back from Boston recently.
- Q. What's your son's name?
- 23 A. Dennis.
- Q. And do you own or rent your house?

- 1 A. We own.
- Q. And when did you move in?
- 3 A. In June of 1993.
- 4 Q. And what is your occupation, Mrs. Bergau?
- 5 A. I'm an outside sales representative.
- 6 Q. Are you taking time out from your job to
- 7 testify here today?
- 8 A. Yes, I am.
- 9 Q. I was wondering if you would describe
- 10 generally the layout of your home?
- 11 A. It's a two story. The first floor has the
- 12 living room, dining room, family room, kitchen,
- 13 powder room, and laundry room, and two car garage,
- 14 and the second floor has two bedrooms, two
- 15 bathrooms, and a loft.
- 16 Q. Would you please tell me what rooms are on
- 17 the east side of your home on the first floor?
- 18 A. On the first floor is our kitchen with the
- 19 patio outside off the sliding doors and the family
- 20 room.
- Q. And what's on the east side of your second
- 22 floor?
- A. The two bedrooms face the east side.
- Q. And how far is your house, the back, your

- 1 sliding patio doors from the Overland fence or from
- 2 the wooden fence?
- 3 A. Thirty-two feet. Approximately, 32 feet
- 4 give or take a few inches.
- 5 Q. Would you please describe the view from
- 6 your first floor looking out east from your patio?
- 7 A. From the family room and the kitchen as
- 8 well we look out onto the patio and then to the
- 9 fence dividing our properties.
- 10 Q. And would you describe the view from your
- 11 second floor bedroom looking east?
- 12 A. We look directly into Overland property.
- 13 Q. Okay. Would you tell me what you see when
- 14 you look directly east from your house?
- 15 A. We see the loading docks. There's
- 16 approximately 12 of them on our side I believe. I
- 17 don't know for sure. We also see their west side of
- 18 their office area, their parking lot.
- 19 MR. SIROS: I'd like to have marked for
- 20 identification a group exhibit of photographs as
- 21 Complainants' No. 2.
- 22 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. Is it a group
- 23 exhibit or one individual photograph, Mr. Siros?
- MR. SIROS: It's a group exhibit.

- 1 THE HEARING OFFICER: All right.
- 2 MR. SIROS: It's a group of five pictures.
- 3 THE HEARING OFFICER: I'm just wondering for
- 4 practical sake whether we should mark all the
- 5 documents. I just don't want to mix them up.
- 6 Is there some way to, if they do become
- 7 displaced with the paperclip, that we can identify
- 8 them within that group exhibit?
- 9 MR. SIROS: These are numbered from one to five
- 10 also on the back, and they also have handwriting on
- 11 the back with the dates on them.
- 12 THE HEARING OFFICER: But will they be
- 13 distinguishable from other photographic group
- 14 exhibits --
- 15 MR. SIROS: Yes.
- 16 THE HEARING OFFICER: -- by just the
- 17 numerical --
- 18 MR. SIROS: Yes, your Honor. Well, the
- 19 other --
- 20 THE HEARING OFFICER: So other group exhibits
- 21 will be numbered sequentially after five or what?
- MR. SIROS: Well, I was going to mark this as
- 23 one group exhibit, and then I've got other pictures,
- 24 but the other pictures have a date stamp on them.

- 1 So there's no way to mix the group exhibits up.
- THE HEARING OFFICER: All right. I just want
- 3 it to be made clear how we can distinguish them in
- 4 the event that they do become -- what will happen is
- 5 someone will be reviewing these documents, and I
- 6 want them to be able to put them back in the same
- 7 place and identify them that way.
- 8 MR. SIROS: Then I suppose we can number them
- 9 sequentially if that would be --
- 10 THE HEARING OFFICER: We'll deal with it as we
- 11 have to. All I want is for our own -- for purposes
- 12 of the record that the record be clear and complete
- 13 and that in the event that the photographs are mixed
- 14 up ultimately or upon review by a Board member or a
- 15 board assistant that they are able to place them
- 16 back into the position necessary to keep them in
- 17 that group exhibit.
- 18 If you've done that, that's fine. I just
- 19 want to ensure that has been done.
- 20 MR. SIROS: I've numbered these one through
- 21 five.
- 22 THE HEARING OFFICER: All right. Let the
- 23 record reflect that counsel has submitted copies of
- 24 what has been identified at Group Exhibit 1 --

- 1 Complainants' Group Exhibit 1 to counsel for the
- 2 respondents.
- 3 MR. SIROS: Yes.
- 4 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Steger, you've
- 5 received those copies?
- 6 MR. STEGER: It's Complainants' Group
- 7 Exhibit --
- 8 THE HEARING OFFICER: One through five, which
- 9 Mr. Siros has represented to be five photographs; is
- 10 that correct?
- 11 MR. SIROS: We can mark -- I was going to mark
- 12 this Group Exhibit 1, which consists of five
- 13 photographs.
- 14 THE HEARING OFFICER: That's fine.
- 15 (Group Exhibit No. 1 marked
- for identification, 5-12-98.)
- 17 THE HEARING OFFICER: Let the record reflect
- 18 that the witness is reviewing the document.
- 19 BY MR. SIROS:
- 20 Q. Would you please describe what is
- 21 represented in the picture which on the back is
- 22 marked one?
- A. Okay. This is an overview of the Overland
- 24 facility. I took this photo from the back where the

- 1 White Hall shopping center is -- between them and
- 2 the fence that divides White Hall from Overland. I
- 3 parked the car at that spot. I had a wide angle
- 4 lens on the camera so that I could show the whole
- 5 facility.
- 6 MR. SIROS: And let the record reflect that the
- 7 witness has indicated that she took the picture from
- 8 the area that is designated on Complainants' Exhibit
- 9 1 as White Hall, and she took the picture facing
- 10 south toward the Overland facility.
- 11 THE HEARING OFFICER: Is that correct?
- 12 THE WITNESS: Yes, that's correct.
- 13 THE HEARING OFFICER: The record will so
- 14 reflect.
- 15 BY MR. SIROS:
- 16 Q. Mrs. Bergau, would you please approach
- 17 what's been marked as Complainants' Exhibit 1 and
- 18 place a red circle where you were when you took the
- 19 picture?
- 20 A. This is approximate, but I was parked
- 21 about right here.
- 22 THE HEARING OFFICER: Let the record reflect
- 23 that --

1 BY THE WITNESS:

- 2 A. If this is the fence, I was behind that
- 3 fence. I just -- I don't know if that's the fence
- 4 or not.
- 5 THE HEARING OFFICER: Let the record reflect
- 6 that Mrs. Bergau has approached and marked on what
- 7 has been identified for identification purposes as
- 8 Complainants' Exhibit 1 and placed a red circle
- 9 where she took the photograph she has previously
- 10 described on what has been marked as Group Exhibit
- 11 1, photograph one; is that correct, Mr. Siros?
- MR. SIROS: That is correct.
- 13 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.
- 14 BY MR. SIROS:
- 15 Q. Would you please describe what's
- 16 represented in the picture in Group Exhibit 1,
- 17 picture number two?
- 18 A. Okay. Number two was showing all of the
- 19 trailers that are parked backing up to our
- 20 townhouses. This is reflective of what pretty much
- 21 happens every night and on weekends.
- Q. And where were you when you took this
- 23 picture?
- 24 A. Again, I was at the same location. This
 - L.A. REPORTING (312) 419-9292

- 1 is just using a zoom lens to zoom in closer.
- 2 Q. So you took this picture from
- 3 approximately the same place where you had
- 4 originally put the red circle on Complainants'
- 5 Exhibit 1?
- 6 A. Exactly, exactly.
- 7 Q. I'd like to direct your attention to Group
- 8 Exhibit 1, picture number three. Would you please
- 9 describe what's represented in that picture?
- 10 A. Okay. This picture reflects the east side
- 11 of the Overland property, and what I tried to
- 12 demonstrate is the difference between, since these
- 13 were taken at the same time from the same location,
- 14 the difference in between what trucks are all parked
- 15 on our side and all the room that's left on the east
- 16 side of the building that the tractor trailers could
- 17 have been parked over there.
- 18 Q. Did you take the same picture from the
- 19 same place where you had previously placed a red
- 20 circle on Complainants' Exhibit 1?
- 21 A. Exactly.
- 22 Q. I'd like to direct your attention to Group
- 23 Exhibit 1, picture number four. Would you please
- 24 describe what is referenced in that picture?

- 1 A. Okay. Again, this was a wide-angle shot
- 2 of the facility and hopefully indicating again all
- 3 of the trailers parked on our side of the property
- 4 of Overland's property and all of the vacant area
- 5 where they could have been parked on the east side
- 6 of the property to eliminate some of the noise when
- 7 they hook them up.
- 8 Q. Did you, again, take this picture from the
- 9 same location where you previously placed the red
- 10 circle on Complainants' Exhibit 1?
- 11 A. That's correct.
- 12 Q. I'd like to direct your attention to the
- 13 last picture in Group Exhibit No. 1, which has been
- 14 marked as picture number five. Would you please
- 15 describe what's referenced in that picture?
- 16 A. Again, this is showing all of the trailers
- 17 parked on our side of their complex just to give
- 18 another angle of, you know, the number of trucks to
- 19 give some idea of what, you know, we're dealing with
- 20 when they do start working and moving these
- 21 trailers.
- 22 Q. And would you, again, inform us where you
- 23 took that picture from?
- A. Where I drew the red circle on Exhibit 1.

- 1 Q. On Complainants' Exhibit 1; is that
- 2 correct?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. When you moved in in June of 1993, were
- 5 you aware that there was a trucking facility located
- 6 directly to the east of your property?
- A. We saw it when we went through the house.
- 8 Q. So you were aware that there was a
- 9 trucking operation?
- 10 A. We saw the building, yeah.
- 11 Q. Did you know if it was a 24-hour
- 12 operation?
- 13 A. We did not at the time that we looked at
- 14 the property, no.
- 15 Q. Were you aware that a restriction had been
- 16 filed by the developer which indicated that there
- 17 was a 24-hour trucking operation located to the east
- 18 of the property?
- 19 A. We were not made aware of first of all the
- 20 noise that was being emitted, that would be emitted
- 21 from this property, and also that it was -- that the
- 22 builder filed this form, whatever it is, until the
- 23 time of -- I believe it was the time of our closing
- 24 when we received a copy of our bylaws.

- 1 Q. So at the time of the closing, you were
- 2 aware of the existence of the 24-hour trucking
- 3 operation?
- 4 A. We actually were not made aware of it
- 5 until we read the bylaws --
- 6 Q. And when --
- 7 A. -- I'm thinking after the closing.
- 8 Q. When did you read those bylaws?
- 9 A. After the closing.
- 10 Q. Did you do anything before you purchased
- 11 the property to determine whether the facility, the
- 12 Overland facility, would be operating 24 hours a day
- 13 and create noise?
- 14 A. We drove past it several times after we
- 15 had put an offer in on the house, in fact, even a
- 16 couple times before we put the offer in. We put a
- 17 deposit on the day that we looked at it, but then we
- 18 drove past it a couple of times early evening,
- 19 during the day, on the weekend, and we just didn't
- 20 hear any noise. We didn't think it would be of any
- 21 concern. We had never lived next to a trucking firm
- 22 to begin with. So we had no expectation really of
- 23 what, you know, it meant.
- Q. Did you hear any noise when you drove by

- 1 on these preliminary drives?
- A. No, we did not.
- 3 Q. Did you ever drive by at night before you
- 4 purchased the property?
- 5 A. One evening I believe we drove by about
- 6 9:00, 8:30, 9:00 o'clock.
- 7 Q. Did you hear noise when you drove by?
- 8 A. No.
- 9 Q. After you moved in in June of 1993, when
- 10 did you first notice noise from the operations?
- 11 A. The first night actually that we slept in
- 12 the house.
- 13 Q. And when you moved in in 1993, can you
- 14 describe the number of times per week you would hear
- 15 this noise?
- 16 A. Probably I would say on the average three
- 17 times a week it would wake us up.
- 18 Q. Okay. How often do you hear the noise
- 19 now?
- 20 A. Six nights, six days a week. If we get
- 21 any reprieve, it would be Sunday afternoon, early
- 22 evening.
- Q. I'd like to take you through a whole day
- 24 from 8:00 in the morning until 8:00 in the morning

- 1 the next day, a day other than Sunday.
- 2 Can you tell me when you first begin to
- 3 hear noise after 8:00 o'clock in the morning?
- 4 A. Well, they've -- they're pretty much
- 5 finishing up by 8:00 o'clock in the morning.
- 6 Q. Okay.
- 7 A. I leave for work usually about 9:00
- 8 o'clock. At that time, they're pretty quiet. With
- 9 the job that I do, I do sales out of my house as
- 10 well as the store, and so frequently I'll stop at
- 11 home and make phone calls when I can't, you know, do
- 12 phone calls at work without interruptions.
- So I stop at home at various times during
- 14 the day, not every day, but on occasion. I've heard
- 15 them at various times during the day. Specifically
- 16 during the day, I couldn't tell you because I
- 17 don't -- it's kind of let me swing by and call so
- 18 and so and just automatically close the windows
- 19 because I can't hear and, you know, make my phone
- 20 calls and then, you know, be on my way again.
- I usually go back, you know, out on the
- 22 road late afternoons. I get home on the average
- 23 around 5:00, 5:30, and they're banging when I get
- 24 home. There tends to be a little bit of a quiet

- 1 time, and then they start in again 8:00 o'clock,
- 2 9:00 o'clock, and then it's --
- 3 Q. When does that quiet time start?
- 4 A. I would say maybe 7:00 o'clock, 7:00 to
- 5 9:00 is on an average.
- 6 Q. Okay.
- A. They start in between 8:00 and 10:00, you
- 8 know, and then sometimes they go as late as 1:30 in
- 9 the morning.
- 10 Q. What time do they normally end?
- 11 A. 12:30, 11:00 o'clock, 12:30, in that area.
- 12 Q. Okay.
- 13 A. They stop and then they'll start in
- 14 again. It seems like their routine has changed
- 15 somewhat recently. They used to start around 2:00
- 16 o'clock, 2:30. Now, it seems like they're starting
- 17 around 3:00 o'clock, 3:30, 4:00 we're noticing more
- 18 at that time.
- 19 Q. Is that -- that's 3:30 in the morning?
- A. A.m., uh-huh.
- 21 Q. Would you please describe the different
- 22 types of noise you hear from the operations?
- A. Okay. There's several different types.
- 24 The first one is the banging of the dock plates when

- 1 the forklifts go over -- drive over the dock plates
- 2 to load the trailer.
- 3 Q. How do you know it's the forklifts?
- 4 A. Well, after our meeting, we had a meeting
- 5 in May with Mr. DePietro.
- 6 Q. Do you know what year that was?
- A. It was 1996, yes, because it was scheduled
- 8 for March 20th of '96 and it didn't happen, and it
- 9 was actually held in about the middle of May of
- 10 1996, and after -- at that meeting, the members or
- 11 the people that were there from Charter Hall were
- 12 invited to visit the facility and see what actually
- 13 transpires there.
- 14 Q. Uh-huh.
- 15 A. Well, my husband and I decided yes, we
- 16 would go and visit the facility, and we got there
- 17 and they took us through the office part first, and
- 18 then they took us out to the loading dock area, and
- 19 while we were there, we physically saw these two
- 20 forklifts driving, one very fast, driving into the
- 21 trailer itself carrying freight, and as it went over
- 22 the dock plate, it went boom, boom, and then it got
- 23 into the trailer and it released its freight.
- 24 However, while we were -- there was always

- 1 a third boom that would happen occasionally, and
- 2 none of us could figure what it was. Well, when my
- 3 husband and I were there, there was one particular
- 4 freight -- forklift driver and he was going really,
- 5 really fast, and he went over, and the faster they
- 6 would go, the louder the noise would become, and at
- 7 one point, he was going so fast over the -- you
- 8 know, into the trailer bed, the truck rocked, he got
- 9 in there while the truck was rocking, and it looked
- 10 like he just dropped the forks or something on the
- 11 trailer floor. I mean, it made -- that was the
- 12 third bang.
- So the banging from the dock plates is the
- 14 first sound, and it's like -- I mean, especially
- 15 when we're sound asleep at night at 2:00 o'clock in
- 16 the morning, I mean, you're just falling asleep and
- 17 getting into a sound sleep, and it's like an
- 18 extremely loud close crack of thunder. It's that
- 19 sudden. It just bolts you up when they -- you know,
- 20 when these dock plates hit.
- 21 The second noise that we hear is when
- 22 they're hooking the trailers up, when they hook the
- 23 trailer to the truck itself. It's the banging when
- 24 they, you know, when they connect, and occasionally

- 1 they don't connect properly, I'm assuming, because
- 2 they start driving away and they drag the trailer,
- 3 these steel poles, you know, across the blacktop,
- 4 and when that happens, our whole house vibrates.
- 5 I mean, I have had to remove -- I have a
- 6 Hummel collection, and I've had to remove them from
- 7 the shelf because I'm afraid with the vibration that
- 8 they will fall off and break. So that's the second
- 9 noise is the banging and the dragging.
- There are radios. There are horns
- 11 beeping. Two weeks ago at 1:00 o'clock in the
- 12 morning I was up because they had not stopped yet,
- 13 and it was exactly like 1:04, something like that,
- 14 when I looked at the clock, and I thought I don't
- 15 believe this. The guy is beeping his horn, and it's
- 16 a quick beep, beep. You know, it's very definitely
- 17 coming from the truck, and I looked at the clock,
- 18 and I thought I don't believe this. It's 1:00
- 19 o'clock in the morning. All the complaining and
- 20 trying, you know, to help have them work with us and
- 21 they're beeping their horns at 1:00 in the morning.
- Q. So you've described three different types
- 23 of noises. Are there any others?
- A. The radios, sometimes they'll be out there

- 1 playing the radios in the trucks, especially in the
- 2 summertime. Yelling. This morning at 5:41 I went
- 3 over to open the bedroom window because we were in
- 4 the bedroom packing, and I went over to open the
- 5 bedroom window, I opened the bedroom window, and,
- 6 you know, they had just hooked up one of these
- 7 trucks, I mean, I've heard that before, and the
- 8 guys -- there were two people out there. One is
- 9 standing at the middle of the truck and trailer and
- 10 the driver was going around to get into the truck,
- 11 and they're yelling.
- 12 Q. Well, where was that truck located?
- 13 A. It was directly under our window.
- 14 Q. And so --
- 15 A. Directly out by our window.
- 16 Q. So it was directly on the other side of
- 17 the wooden fence --
- 18 A. Of the wooden fence, yes.
- 19 Q. -- that separates the properties?
- 20 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. Okay. Okay. One
- 21 person can speak at a time. That's all she can
- 22 record. That's all that needs to be speaking at a
- 23 time. You need to let him ask the question, and you
- 24 need to let her finish the question. Okay?

1 BY MR. SIROS:

- Q. Is that the wooden fence that runs -- that
- 3 divides Overland with the Charter Hall subdivision?
- 4 A. Yes, that's correct.
- 5 Q. And where was the truck located?
- 6 A. As I looked out our bedroom window, the
- 7 truck and trailer, it was a double trailer and the
- 8 truck, and it was parked directly out in front of
- 9 our bedroom window.
- 10 THE HEARING OFFICER: We're going to go off the
- 11 record for a second.
- 12 (Break taken.)
- 13 THE HEARING OFFICER: Let the record reflect
- 14 that we are back in the matter of Charter Hall vs.
- 15 Overland Transportation System, PCB 98-81, after a
- 16 five-minute recess. Our court reporter seems to
- 17 have corrected any technical difficulties. We'll
- 18 proceed.
- 19 Mrs. Bergau, I'll remind you that you are
- 20 still under oath. Again, it's important that one
- 21 person speak at a time. It's very difficult for the
- 22 court reporter to hear or to try to transcribe two
- 23 people. I just make a point of that for everybody's
- 24 sake. Thank you.

- 1 Mr. Siros.
- 2 BY MR. SIROS:
- 3 Q. Mrs. Bergau, could you describe how the
- 4 noise from the Overland facility has affected your
- 5 life?
- 6 A. Well, it has affected our lives in many,
- 7 many hardship ways, two specifically. In March of
- 8 1996, my mother was released from the hospital. Let
- 9 me backtrack. My father passed away five years
- 10 ago. Her health deteriorated, and in March of 1996,
- 11 she was hospitalized again for a heart condition and
- 12 other ailments.
- Her doctor told -- I have two sisters.
- 14 One lives primarily in Florida now. The other lives
- 15 is McHenry, Illinois. The doctor told us that she
- 16 could no longer live by herself. She either had to
- 17 live with one of us or we had to put her into a
- 18 nursing home because she needed to have constant
- 19 care. We do not want to put her into a nursing home
- 20 if at all possible, and since my sister who lives --
- 21 who has a home in Arlington Heights, but resides in
- 22 Florida now, was the only one close to her hospital
- 23 and her doctors besides myself, we decided that she
- 24 would live with us. So on March 20th, she was

- 1 released to our care.
- Q. March 20th of what year?
- 3 A. Of 1996, yes.
- 4 We brought her home from the hospital. We
- 5 put her upstairs. We made a room for her, moved her
- 6 clothes over from her house and everything into our
- 7 second bedroom. It turned out to be a nightmare.
- 8 She would be up walking the floor because the trucks
- 9 would wake her up, the loud banging, the dragging,
- 10 everything else. They would wake her up in the
- 11 middle of the night just like it woke us up.
- 12 I'd come out of the bedroom to go
- 13 downstairs, we have three sofas in our house, and
- 14 until she came to live with us, it became habit and
- 15 routine that when they would wake us up, Denny and I
- 16 would just go downstairs, pick a sofa, and sleep
- 17 there the rest of the night.
- 18 It's to the point now where we just leave
- 19 the bedding out during the week. If we have
- 20 company, we put the bedding away. Otherwise, we
- 21 keep the quilt and the pillow on the sofas.
- 22 She would wake up, as I said earlier, and
- 23 when I would come out of the bedroom to go
- 24 downstairs, she would already either be walking in

- 1 the bedroom with her walker or sitting on the end of
- 2 the bed saying her rosary. She just -- she could
- 3 not get sleep.
- We tried various measures. I tried
- 5 earplugs with her. I tried putting a fan in her
- 6 bedroom to kind of drown out the noise hopefully.
- 7 That didn't help. We would take her downstairs and
- 8 have her sleep on one of the sofas with us, and, of
- 9 course, she was 85 years old at the time, and to
- 10 take a woman that age and put her through that, you
- 11 know, lack of sleep, it just seemed ludicrous to
- 12 me.
- 13 I called Overland. I don't remember the
- 14 date. I believe it was in April sometime. It was a
- 15 couple -- a week or two after she came to our
- 16 house. One morning around 4:00 o'clock because they
- 17 were so loud and she was up walking, you know,
- 18 walking the floor with her walker, and I called over
- 19 there and I spoke to, I don't remember the
- 20 gentleman's name, but I explained the situation to
- 21 him, told him that we had an elderly woman with a
- 22 heart condition who had just come from the hospital,
- 23 needed her rest, could you please do something to
- 24 quiet the noise, you know, at least work on the

- 1 other side of the building.
- 2 He said that he couldn't do anything.
- 3 They had to stay on schedule and get their work done
- 4 and I should call back at 7:00 in the morning and
- 5 talk to a Mr. Don Trujillo and explain it to him
- 6 because he was the facility manager.
- 7 I called Don Trujillo after 7:00 in the
- 8 morning and I explained again the situation to him
- 9 that she was in desperate need of her rest, she
- 10 could not be awoken suddenly by these loud
- 11 bangings. It wasn't good for her heart to begin
- 12 with. He said well, we'll try and do what we can,
- 13 but we have to do our job and that's not a quote,
- 14 but in so many words that's what happened.
- 15 Q. Did you inform anyone else besides
- 16 Overland about the problems that your mother was
- 17 having with the noise?
- 18 A. Yes, I did. When we didn't get any
- 19 response from Overland or any show of concern or
- 20 consideration, I wrote a letter of complaint to the
- 21 Village of Palatine and with -- I carbon copied I
- 22 believe all the trustees. I wrote it to the zoning
- 23 manager and copied the village president, the
- 24 village manager, the trustees, and everyone, you

1 know, involved, the association management company.

75

- Q. Okay. I'd like to show you what I'd like
- 3 to mark as Complainants' Exhibit 2.
- 4 (Complainants' Exhibit No. 2
- 5 marked for identification,
- 6 5-12-98.)
- 7 MR. SIROS: Let the record reflect I'm
- 8 tendering a copy to Mr. Steger.
- 9 BY MR. SIROS:
- 10 Q. Do you recognize that document?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. Could you please tell us what that
- 13 document is?
- 14 A. This is the document that I sent to
- 15 Mr. Fieldman, the zoning administrator in Palatine,
- 16 reiterating the entire incident, you know, what had
- 17 happened when she came to our house on the morning
- 18 of March 20th.
- 19 Q. Okay.
- 20 (Complainants' Exhibit No. 3
- 21 marked for identification,
- 22 5-12-98.)
- 23 BY MR. SIROS:
- Q. I'd also like to show you what's been
 - L.A. REPORTING (312) 419-9292

- 1 marked for identification purposes as Complainants'
- 2 Exhibit 3.
- 3 MR. STEGER: I think you got the wrong one.
- 4 This is the same.
- 5 MR. SIROS: I apologize.
- 6 MR. STEGER: I think you want to do that again.
- 7 MR. SIROS: Let the record now reflect that
- 8 I've given Mr. Steger an accurate copy of what's
- 9 been marked as Complainants' Exhibit No. 2, and then
- 10 I'm also tendering Mr. Steger what's marked for
- 11 identification purposes as Complainants' Exhibit No.
- 12 3.
- 13 BY MR. SIROS:
- 14 Q. Do you recognize that document?
- 15 A. Yes. This is the response from the
- 16 village, from the village manager that I got telling
- 17 me basically that I should direct my concerns to the
- 18 association and the EPA.
- 19 Q. And what did you do, if anything, after
- 20 you received that letter from the Village of
- 21 Palatine?
- 22 A. Actually, I started contacting the
- 23 association members, Jeff Cohen in particular, to
- 24 find out what, in fact, was being done, if

- 1 anything. I talked to him about the letter and, you
- 2 know, told him that basically, you know, what's
- 3 going on. You know, is anything going to be done
- 4 with this?
- 5 I just want to emphasize the hardship that
- 6 it has created for our family with my mother. She
- 7 now has to reside -- we kept her for approximately
- 8 two months, three months at the most. Since she
- 9 could not get any rest, we had to move her to my
- 10 other sister's house in McHenry. She is an hour
- 11 drive away from her doctors, away from her hospital
- 12 that she has been being treated by these people for
- 13 approximately 25 years.
- Now, she has gone to -- she had an
- 15 incident in McHenry I want to say about six months
- 16 ago, three months ago, where she had -- my sister
- 17 took her to the hospital in McHenry. Because they
- 18 could not, obviously, sift through 25 years of
- 19 medical history, they did what they thought was the
- 20 best thing to do and that was -- I believe it was
- 21 nitroglycerin that they administered to her. She
- 22 has an allergic reaction to nitro. They didn't know
- 23 that. She, of course, didn't tell them, and so, you
- 24 know, it could have been an extremely serious

- 1 situation.
- Ideally, we would like to have her with us
- 3 in Palatine so she's ten, 15 minutes away from the
- 4 doctor, you know, that has treated her.
- 5 Q. And where is she residing now?
- 6 A. In McHenry, Illinois. It's approximately
- 7 45 minutes to an hour drive to Arlington Heights.
- 8 Q. How -- if at all, how else has the noise
- 9 affected your life?
- 10 A. Okay. Another serious issue is my husband
- 11 Dennis. He had colon cancer surgery this past
- 12 November. He was released from the hospital on
- 13 Thanksgiving Day and was -- he needed to have 18 --
- 14 MR. STEGER: Mr. Hearing Officer, I have an
- 15 objection.
- 16 THE HEARING OFFICER: Yes.
- 17 MR. STEGER: I believe her husband will be
- 18 testifying. I believe he can testify more
- 19 accurately to what he's experiencing than she can.
- 20 MR. SIROS: Your Honor, I believe she can
- 21 testify as to her actual observations.
- 22 MR. STEGER: As long as it's limited to her
- 23 actual observations.
- 24 THE HEARING OFFICER: Well, I think there's

- 1 going to be some crossover testimony on all this.
- 2 So I'm going to allow the testimony, but I would ask
- 3 that where we can avoid redundancy, let's do so.
- 4 So at this time, I'm going to overrule
- 5 your objection subject to the condition that we try
- 6 to limit redundancy where we can, but I understand
- 7 where that is going to be necessary sometimes,
- 8 Mr. Siros.
- 9 So with that ruling, do we want to reask
- 10 the question. I don't know if Mrs. Bergau got the
- 11 entire -- if she was finished with her answer.
- 12 BY MR. SIROS:
- 13 Q. Let me just ask the question again, and
- 14 you can answer.
- 15 In terms of how this has affected your
- 16 life, you were describing how it affected your
- 17 husband and his coming back from the hospital and
- 18 after having just received chemotherapy.
- 19 Based on your physical observations, how
- 20 has the noise affected your husband Dennis?
- A. One of the effects from chemotherapy, and
- 22 the doctors explained this to me because I would be
- 23 helping him through this, among hair loss and
- 24 nausea, fatigue is the third most common reaction to

- 1 chemotherapy. The effects, as they were explained
- 2 to me, are cumulative. So, consequently, the more
- 3 chemo he would get, the stronger his chances were of
- 4 experiencing these reactions.
- 5 He was -- as I started to say earlier, he
- 6 needed to receive 18 treatments of chemotherapy in
- 7 six-week increments. So he would be -- every Friday
- 8 for six weeks he would receive a chemotherapy
- 9 treatment and then off two, on six, off two, and on
- 10 six.
- 11 As each week -- as each six-week increment
- 12 transpired, I would take him to chemo on Friday
- 13 mornings, and toward the end of this last treatment,
- 14 he was physically falling asleep in the car on the
- 15 way home.
- 16 He would come home and just go lay down.
- 17 I mean, he could not stay awake. He'd be sleeping
- 18 and all of a sudden the banging would start, and he
- 19 would be up, and he'd come downstairs, and it would
- 20 still be like 7:00, 8:00 o'clock at night and the
- 21 banging would get worse and worse, and he would just
- 22 kind of walk around in a stupor is the only way I
- 23 can explain it. I mean, he was just so fatigued and
- 24 tired, but he couldn't sleepy. I mean, with the

- 1 banging noise outside, he could not get the rest
- 2 that he needed to get to help whatever this chemo is
- 3 doing to his body.
- 4 Q. Not to diminish in any way the effects
- 5 it's had on your mother and on your husband, what,
- 6 if any, effects -- what, if any, additional effects
- 7 has it had on your everyday life?
- 8 A. We can't entertain outside. We had
- 9 friends over about three, four weeks ago on a
- 10 Saturday. We were going to go and sit out on the
- 11 patio for the first time. It was the first nice,
- 12 warm day that we had. We were out there probably 15
- 13 minutes and they started in. We couldn't talk.
- 14 We'd have to stop talking because the banging was so
- 15 loud and the hooking up of the trailers to the
- 16 trucks, the dragging of the trailer.
- We just finally went in the house. You
- 18 know, it's ridiculous. We can't entertain.
- 19 Everyday life, as I mentioned earlier, if you're on
- 20 the phone, you can't have the windows open if
- 21 they're working. You can't have the sliding door
- 22 open if they're working because you can't hear on
- 23 the phone. You have to say wait, what did you say?
- Television, if we want to sit and watch

- 1 television, we'd have to turn the volume up. I'm
- 2 concerned about my neighbors, it being too loud for
- 3 them. To sit and turn on some soft music and just
- 4 read a book, it's next to impossible. I mean, you
- 5 cannot sit and just relax when they're working.
- 6 There's no such thing. They're just so loud.
- 7 Q. Anything else?
- 8 A. No. It's just constant.
- 9 Q. When was the last time -- I'm sorry. Let
- 10 me back up a second.
- When you moved in in 1993, I'd like you to
- 12 compare that to the present in terms of the
- 13 frequency of the noise.
- 14 Can you compare the noise in 1993 to the
- 15 noise at present?
- 16 A. I can compare it in terms of my sleeping
- 17 at night. They would -- when Yellow Freight was
- 18 there, they would wake me up maybe three nights a
- 19 week. Now, it's every night except for Sunday
- 20 night, but then I know they're going to be working,
- 21 you know, at 2:00 o'clock Monday morning again. So
- 22 there really isn't a night.
- Q. When was the last time you were bothered
- 24 by noise from Overland facility?

- 1 A. 5:41 this morning, absolutely.
- Q. And what was that noise?
- 3 A. It was the hooking up of the truck to the
- 4 trailer and the guys yelling outside.
- 5 MR. SIROS: Thank you. Nothing further.
- 6 BY MR. SIROS:
- 7 Q. I'm sorry.
- 8 I would like to just direct your attention
- 9 back to what has previously been marked as Group
- 10 Exhibit 1, picture number three.
- Would you just, again, describe where you
- 12 took that picture from and what that's a picture of?
- 13 A. Okay. Again, I took that picture from
- 14 where I indicated on Exhibit 1 with the red circle.
- 15 It's facing the east side of the Overland facility,
- 16 and it demonstrates all the space that's there where
- 17 they could park the trailers that are at that time
- 18 currently parked on the west side, on our side, of
- 19 the building.
- 20 MR. SIROS: Thank you. Nothing further.
- 21 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. Let the record
- 22 reflect that when Mrs. Bergau indicated Exhibit 1, I
- 23 believe she was referring to Complainants' Exhibit
- 24 1, is that correct, Mrs. Bergau, the same exhibit

- 1 where the red circle is?
- 2 THE WITNESS: Yes, yes.
- 3 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.
- 4 Mr. Steger.
- 5 CROSS EXAMINATION
- 6 by Mr. Steger
- 7 Q. First of all, I have some questions with
- 8 respect to your pictures.
- 9 Referring to Complainants' Exhibit No. 1
- 10 where you took the picture, the red circle.
- 11 A. Uh-huh.
- 12 Q. Okay. There appears to be a fence in
- 13 front of you?
- 14 A. That's correct.
- 15 Q. Okay. That fence if you look at picture
- 16 number three.
- 17 A. Okay.
- 18 Q. Okay. On the left corner of the picture,
- 19 you'll see some cabs there?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. Okay. Could you draw a blue -- would you
- 22 mark on Complainants' Exhibit 1 about where those
- 23 cabs are?
- A. In all honesty, this drawing has me

- 1 confused with the actual layout, and it must be the
- 2 fence that's doing it because when we look out, it
- 3 appears that they can drive right straight through.
- 4 I'm not sure what this corner is.
- 5 Q. Okay.
- 6 A. So -- and consequently, I don't know where
- 7 these trucks relate to that drawing.
- 8 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. Mrs. Bergau, are
- 9 you indicating that you cannot tell where those
- 10 trucks are located in the photograph in relationship
- 11 to what's been marked as Complainants' Exhibit 1?
- 12 THE WITNESS: In relationship to this corner on
- 13 Exhibit 1.
- 14 THE HEARING OFFICER: All right.
- 15 BY MR. STEGER:
- 16 Q. Why don't you have a look at picture
- 17 number five?
- 18 THE HEARING OFFICER: Are you withdrawing that
- 19 last request, Mr. Steger?
- 20 MR. STEGER: Yes.
- 21 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.
- Let the record reflect that Mrs. Bergau is
- 23 now looking at what has been marked as Group Exhibit
- 24 1, photograph five; is that correct?

- 1 THE WITNESS: Five, yes.
- 2 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.
- 3 BY MR. STEGER:
- 4 Q. And it shows in the picture with the
- 5 cyclone fence in the foreground a series of trailers
- 6 in the background?
- 7 A. Correct.
- 8 Q. Okay. And further in the background are
- 9 the Charter homes?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. Can you -- is the fence shown in this
- 12 picture?
- 13 MR. SIROS: Object as to which fence.
- 14 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Steger.
- 15 BY MR. STEGER:
- 16 Q. The wooden fence that runs along your
- 17 backyard.
- 18 A. Yes, it is.
- 19 Q. Could you tell us where that is? Describe
- 20 it for us in that picture.
- 21 A. If you look at the two trucks or trailers
- 22 most pronounced in the middle of the picture facing
- 23 you as you're looking at the photo --
- Q. Whose backs are facing us?

- 1 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay.
- 3 A. You can see the wooden fence in between
- 4 those two trailers.
- 5 Q. If you also look between those two
- 6 trailers, do you see some -- it looks like some
- 7 grass on our side, on Overland's side of the fence?
- 8 A. Yes, there's a grassy area.
- 9 Q. Do you know about how long and how high
- 10 that is?
- 11 A. I have no idea.
- 12 Q. You have no idea.
- Do you know how high the fence is in your
- 14 backyard?
- 15 A. Eight feet I believe.
- 16 Q. When you put in an offer on your house, on
- 17 your unit, when did you look through your unit? Do
- 18 you recall the first time, what time of day?
- 19 A. It was a Sunday afternoon.
- Q. How many times did you see it after that
- 21 before you moved in?
- A. I would guess we drove by the area -- are
- 23 you talking inside the house or outside?
- Q. Outside the house, the general area?

- 1 A. Just driving by?
- 2 Q. Right.
- 3 A. Probably three or four times after that
- 4 first time.
- 5 Q. Do you know what time of day?
- 6 A. Again, I want to say in the afternoon,
- 7 Sunday afternoon, and then a Sunday evening around
- 8 6:00 o'clock, just, you know, during the day. We
- 9 certainly weren't there at 4:00 o'clock in the
- 10 morning.
- 11 Q. Did you look at any other units in the --
- 12 A. No. It was the last unit available.
- 13 Q. And this was approximately what time, June
- 14 of '93?
- 15 A. June '93, yes. Well, no. It was -- it
- 16 would have been April or May because we moved in
- 17 June.
- 18 Q. In June of '93?
- 19 A. We closed June 4th, yes.
- 20 Q. Okay. But for the Overland operations,
- 21 what time do you normally get up for work?
- A. I normally get up around 7:00 o'clock.
- Q. And what time do you leave for work?
- A. About 8:30, 9:00, depending on what my

- 1 schedule is for the day.
- 2 Q. And you return?
- 3 A. I return at different times. Again, if I
- 4 need to meet with a customer at the store or at the
- 5 showroom, then I, you know, will get home later,
- 6 earlier. It just depends.
- 7 Q. What exactly is it that you do?
- 8 A. I sell office furniture.
- 9 Q. Office furniture. Is there any office
- 10 furniture in your house now? Strike that.
- 11 A. Yes, the best.
- 12 Q. Okay. There are two bedrooms upstairs in
- 13 your unit; is that correct?
- 14 A. That's correct.
- 15 Q. When Overland is not operating, do you
- 16 hear anything from Northwest Highway, traffic?
- 17 A. Not that I notice.
- 18 Q. You don't hear anything from the shopping
- 19 mall?
- 20 A. No.
- Q. You don't hear anything from White Hall?
- A. No. No, their back is to us, not the
- 23 front of the shopping center.
- Q. Would there be anything else that
 - L.A. REPORTING (312) 419-9292

1 interrupts your sleep other than Overland? Do you

90

- 2 get up at night --
- 3 A. If the geese --
- 4 Q. -- for any other reason?
- 5 A. If the geese are quacking very loudly,
- 6 then it wakes me up, yes.
- 7 Q. Ever woken up to an airplane flying
- 8 overhead?
- 9 A. No.
- 10 Q. Car alarm?
- 11 A. I haven't heard one.
- 12 Q. Dog barking?
- 13 A. Uh-uhn. There aren't any dogs really
- 14 close.
- 15 Q. Now, you testified, too, that when you're
- 16 awoken from a sleep, you go downstairs and then
- 17 sleep on the couch?
- 18 A. Exactly.
- 19 Q. And your husband does the same thing?
- 20 A. Exactly.
- Q. And you get up for work about 7:00?
- 22 A. Exactly.
- Q. Did you take any noise measurements
- 24 yourself?

- 1 A. No. Actually, my husband did the majority
- 2 of the noise measuring. I made a few entries on the
- 3 log that he kept, but primarily he did them.
- 4 MR. STEGER: Nothing further.
- 5 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Siros.
- 6 MR. SIROS: Nothing.
- 7 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. Thank you, Mrs.
- 8 Bergau. All right. Where do we want to go from
- 9 here? Would it be convenient at this point -- what
- 10 I had hoped to do, for the record, was try to get
- 11 through three witness at least this morning --
- MR. FORCADE: Yeah, we'd very much like that.
- 13 THE HEARING OFFICER: -- and then four in the
- 14 afternoon. Mr. Forcade.
- 15 MR. FORCADE: I'd very much like that.
- 16 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Steger.
- 17 MR. STEGER: That's fine.
- 18 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. What I want to
- 19 make sure is that there's no -- some people have
- 20 health-related issues --
- 21 MR. FORCADE: Any reason we would not be able
- 22 to do a third witness?
- 23 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. The court reporter
- 24 is willing. I'm willing. We'll try to proceed

- 1 through one more witness and then take a lunch
- 2 break.
- 3 Mr. Siros.
- 4 MR. SIROS: I call Denny Bergau.
- 5 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Bergau, if you'll
- 6 raise your right hand and be sworn in.
- 7 (Witness sworn.)
- 8 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Bergau, would you
- 9 please state your name and spell your last name for
- 10 the record?
- 11 THE WITNESS: My name is Dennis Bergau,
- 12 B-e-r-g-a-u.
- 13 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Siros.
- 14 DENNIS BERGAU,
- 15 called as a witness herein, having been first duly
- 16 sworn, deposeth and saith as follows:
- 17 DIRECT EXAMINATION
- 18 by Mr. Siros
- 19 Q. Mr. Bergau, would you please inform us
- 20 where you live?
- 21 A. I live at 667 Charter Hall Drive.
- 22 Q. I'd like to direct your attention to
- 23 Complainants' Exhibit No. 1. Would you please
- 24 identify the mark next to your address on the blown

- 1 up exhibit?
- 2 A. It's marked with a red X.
- 3 Q. At?
- 4 A. At 667 on the west side I guess it would
- 5 be. Actually, it's on the east side of the street,
- 6 of Charter Hall Street, next to Overland, facing
- 7 Overland.
- 8 Q. And who resides there with you?
- 9 A. My wife does and my son recently moved in
- 10 with us.
- 11 Q. And what's your occupation?
- 12 A. I'm a manager for a furniture store.
- 13 Q. Are you taking time out to testify here
- 14 today?
- 15 A. Yes, I took time off.
- 16 Q. After you moved into your house in June
- 17 of '93, when did you first notice noise from the
- 18 facility?
- 19 A. Pretty almost immediately. One of the
- 20 first times we were there, we noticed that Yellow
- 21 Freight was there, and they were doing some loading
- 22 and trailer hookups and stuff like that. So we
- 23 heard some noise then.
- Q. And would you describe the frequency of

- 1 the noise back in June of '93?
- A. It happened, I don't know, maybe a couple
- 3 times a week. I'm guessing. You know, it's been a
- 4 while, and they didn't bother me at that point like
- 5 they do now. So a couple times a week I would say.
- 6 Q. And what type of noise did you hear
- 7 back --
- 8 A. Oh, one other thing. Not only was it a
- 9 couple times a week, but I was never woken up in the
- 10 middle of the night. So the timing was different
- 11 too.
- 12 Q. What type of noise did you hear back in
- 13 June of '93?
- 14 A. Loading of trucks, hooking up of trucks
- 15 when the forklifts would go over the plates as we
- 16 know now or if a trailer was hooked up, noise from
- 17 the air brakes I guess is what they are or that kind
- 18 of noise, and we were used to sleeping with a window
- 19 open. So, you know, you hear it a lot more. We
- 20 can't sleep with the window open anymore.
- Q. Did this noise bother you in June of '93?
- 22 A. Sure, it did then. You know, it just
- 23 wasn't as frequent as now.
- Q. Did it wake you up?

- 1 A. You know, I don't recall ever being -- it
- 2 was during the day mostly.
- 3 Q. How often does the noise occur presently?
- 4 A. I hear it seven days -- almost seven days
- 5 a week, and it awakes me at night because I work
- 6 during the day. Also, Fridays, as my wife was
- 7 saying, I go to chemotherapy, and I kind of drop off
- 8 real quick after I have that treatment. So I try to
- 9 sleep in the afternoons just to, you know, catch up
- 10 with the or try to overcome the fatigue from the
- 11 medication. I can't do it a lot of times. So, you
- 12 know, I'll go to sleep, I'll hear the banging even
- 13 with the windows closed, and I wake up and go from
- 14 there, but other days you said -- you asked about.
- During the week, we hear it -- I hear it
- 16 almost every night, and the pattern has been I hear
- 17 it, I wake up at 2:00 o'clock in the morning, and
- 18 it's changed recently to a 4:00 o'clock, 3:30, 4:00
- 19 o'clock. I'm not quite sure why, but it's what I
- 20 hear now, and that's what wakes me up.
- Q. So you hear the noise currently at 3:30,
- 22 4:00 o'clock in the morning?
- 23 A. Right now.
- Q. And how long does that continue?

- 1 A. You know, I get up and I try to shut it
- 2 out, but it goes on for a while because I get up --
- 3 I like to get up at 6:00. I try to get up at 6:00
- 4 and get ready and go to work. I can't do that now
- 5 because I'm woken up much earlier. So once I'm up,
- 6 I'm up, you know, that kind of thing.
- 7 Q. What time do you normally leave for work?
- 8 A. About 7:30.
- 9 Q. Do you hear the noise when you leave for
- 10 work?
- 11 A. Yeah, I hear the noise.
- 12 Q. What time do you usually get home from
- 13 work?
- 14 A. It varies. It depends on what my schedule
- 15 is for the day, 6:00, 7:00, 8:00 sometimes.
- 16 Q. And that's at night?
- 17 A. Yeah, uh-huh, at night.
- 18 Q. Do you hear the noise when you come home
- 19 in the evening?
- A. Yeah, we hear it around supper time.
- 21 Q. And how long does that noise -- when you
- 22 come home and you hear it, how long does the noise
- 23 last?
- 24 A. It varies, but it goes 10:00, 11:00, 12:00

- 1 o'clock, sometimes later than that. Infrequently
- 2 later, but it's, you know, 11:00 o'clock in my
- 3 opinion is kind of the norm.
- 4 Q. What time do you usually try to go to bed
- 5 at night?
- 6 A. I try to go to bed at 10:00.
- 7 Q. Are you able to?
- 8 A. Sometimes. When you get so tired, you
- 9 just sleep.
- 10 Q. And when does the noise start again?
- 11 A. Well, like I said, in the past, it started
- 12 at 2:00. Recently now it's more like 3:30, 4:00
- 13 o'clock.
- 14 Q. Would you describe the different types of
- 15 noise that you hear?
- 16 A. I hear the -- like a double bang and
- 17 it's -- when we visited the facility, we'd notice
- 18 that a forklift goes over the loading plate or
- 19 loading dock, whatever they call that thing, and
- 20 they -- when the wheels go over it, it's a double
- 21 bang, and then sometimes we hear a third bang or I
- 22 hear a third bang that shows that they're loading or
- 23 dropping the freight off the forklift or lowering
- 24 the freight. That's one noise, and another noise,

- 1 of course, is when the trailers are hooked up to the
- 2 I guess it's the yard truck as they call it, and
- 3 another real big noise -- and you're shocked. I
- 4 mean, it's a loud bang that we hear or what I hear
- 5 anyway. That's what wakes me up.
- 6 The other thing is when sometimes they'll
- 7 hook up a trailer and the engine will rev and then
- 8 the next thing I know is you hear something dragging
- 9 and it just shakes the house. It vibrates the whole
- 10 house. So along, again, with air brakes and so on
- 11 and the engine, the noise, you know, from the
- 12 engines of the yard truck.
- 13 Q. You mentioned that you had a meeting with
- 14 Overland. Do you recall when that meeting occurred?
- 15 A. It was early May of '96. You know, I was
- 16 one of the attendees of the meeting with Mr. DePietro
- 17 and Don Trujillo I guess it is.
- 18 Q. Do you recall specific dates when you
- 19 heard excessive noise from the Overland facility?
- 20 A. Well, just recently it was on -- I think
- 21 it was May 4th, 5th. I had a pretty important
- 22 meeting on the 6th. So I had to prepare for that,
- 23 and I just remember that specific incident as being
- 24 one, and, you know, it happened other times, too,

- 1 but recently, that's one I remember recently where
- 2 it was very noisy.
- 3 Q. Do you keep any records of the noise from
- 4 the facility?
- 5 A. I have in the past, yeah. I've taken
- 6 measurements and I've kept records.
- 7 (Complainants' Exhibit No. 4
- 8 marked for identification,
- 9 5-12-98.)
- 10 BY MR. SIROS:
- 11 Q. I show you what I've marked for
- 12 identification purposes as Complainants' Exhibit 4
- 13 I've given a copy of Complainants' Exhibit 4 to
- 14 Mr. Steger.
- Do you recognize that document?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. Would you please inform me as to what that
- 18 document is?
- 19 A. It was my way of tracking by date and time
- 20 and a brief description of what the problem was.
- 21 For example, on 10-28-96 at 2:00 a.m. it was
- 22 loading, and then again at 11:45 p.m. there was
- 23 loading of the trailers is what woke me up, and what
- 24 I tried to do is just mark what woke me up.

- 1 Q. Do you independently remember all the
- 2 dates when excessive noise occurred?
- 3 A. No, I don't. I mean, that's why I tracked
- 4 them on here.
- 5 Q. Does this document accurately reflect the
- 6 notations you made when you heard excessive noise at
- 7 the Overland facility?
- 8 A. Yes, uh-huh, yes.
- 9 Q. Would you please turn to the last page of
- 10 what's been marked as Complainants' Exhibit No. 4?
- 11 THE HEARING OFFICER: How many pages are there,
- 12 Mr. Siros?
- 13 MR. SIROS: There should be seven.
- 14 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay.
- 15 BY MR. SIROS:
- 16 Q. Would you please read that last paragraph?
- 17 A. I wrote although we stopped logging after
- 18 9-3-97, the noises of loading and dragging and
- 19 hooking up trailers has continued Monday through
- 20 Saturday on a constant basis. Then I signed it
- 21 Dennis Bergau.
- Q. Do you recall the approximate date when
- 23 you signed that document?
- 24 A. I don't.

- 1 Q. Is that statement accurate through today?
- 2 A. Yes. Accurate -- as a matter of fact, I
- 3 mean, this also -- I wake up Sunday morning
- 4 sometimes when they start loading early Sunday
- 5 morning, 2:00, 3:00, 4:00 o'clock in the morning.
- 6 So I would include Sunday then as well. I put down
- 7 Monday through Saturday when Sunday should be
- 8 included too.
- 9 Q. Can you tell us what affect the noise from
- 10 the Overland facility has had on your everyday life?
- 11 A. Well, I think it's lowered the quality of
- 12 life in many ways. One thing I can't sleep in my
- 13 bed throughout the night. I have to go downstairs
- 14 after walking and, you know, getting very tired. We
- 15 sleep downstairs because the fence apparently blocks
- 16 the noise a little bit.
- 17 As far as having friends over, it's
- 18 difficult to have friends over and have a decent
- 19 conversation on our patio or even inside. I mean,
- 20 when you drag a trailer and the whole house shakes,
- 21 you know, you just can't -- you joke about it, but
- 22 it's not really funny. That's how it is, you know.
- 23 So as far as having company over, it's
- 24 almost impossible to have that. The quality of

- 1 life, you know, I get tired, obviously. It affects
- 2 my job negatively I should say. It affects it
- 3 negatively because I'm fatigued and I can't sleep.
- 4 So I go to work and I can't perform at the level I'd
- 5 like to perform at.
- 6 Q. How has it affected your ability to rest
- 7 after your chemotherapy?
- 8 A. Well, after chemo, I try to sleep on
- 9 Friday afternoons is when I have my chemo
- 10 treatments, once a week, and I'm almost every time I
- 11 can't go to sleep for any length of time. The time
- 12 I was able to sleep, I would sleep all the way from
- 13 like maybe 1:00, 2:00, 2:00 o'clock on all the way
- 14 through the night until the next morning. I can't
- 15 do that anymore. So I wake up, you know, several
- 16 times.
- 17 (Complainants' Exhibit Nos. 5
- and 6 marked for identification,
- 19 5-12-98.)
- 20 BY MR. SIROS:
- 21 Q. I'd like to show you what's been marked as
- 22 Complainants' Exhibit No. 5 for identification
- 23 purposes.
- 24 Do you recognize this?

- 1 A. Yeah.
- 2 Q. Could you please inform us what that is?
- 3 A. It's a sound level meter that I purchased
- 4 at Radio Shack specifically for the purpose of
- 5 taking measurements and getting some idea of what
- 6 the decibel levels were at different baselines.
- 7 Q. And did you, in fact, use that to take
- 8 measurements?
- 9 A. Yes, I did take measurements and charted
- 10 the measurements.
- 11 Q. Would you please describe how you would
- 12 use that instrument to take noise measurements?
- 13 A. Yes. It has a -- I used it by, first of
- 14 all, setting it up, and I would get a baseline level
- 15 and set the unit to -- it has a slow and a fast
- 16 response. We want it to take a slow response to
- 17 take -- so that sudden noises would not appear as
- 18 heavy as they probably would with a more
- 19 sophisticated device and then the see wading would
- 20 be a lighter reading. So, in other words, it
- 21 wouldn't be -- show -- the output of this wouldn't
- 22 be as severe as it may be if it was done with a
- 23 \$50,000 machine. Okay.
- Q. How would you set the baseline?

- 1 A. Then I would set the baseline by simply
- 2 dialing to the baseline, which then would indicate
- 3 zero on the meter and anytime -- there's a scale on
- 4 the meter. It has a zero in the center and it goes
- 5 to minus ten on the left to the minus side and plus
- 6 six on the right side, and the baseline would be set
- 7 at zero or at 50, for example, which would -- where
- 8 the needle would be at zero. Anything above it,
- 9 would be above 50 decibels.
- 10 So I would -- I took these measurements
- 11 from our bedroom window. I opened the window,
- 12 through a screen, and took the measurements, and I
- 13 just pointed the device that takes the reading, the
- 14 little silver spot or chrome or whatever this is,
- 15 and pointed it right towards the Overland activity
- 16 where the activity was going on.
- 17 Q. When you said you took it from your
- 18 bedroom window, where is that bedroom located in
- 19 relationship to your house?
- 20 A. The bedroom window is located upstairs
- 21 facing the Overland facility.
- Q. So that would be on the east side of your
- 23 home; is that correct?
- A. Yes, it would be the east side of my

- 1 house.
- Q. How did you learn how to use that device?
- 3 A. I talked to the person at Radio Shack for
- 4 one, and we also got some instructions from Greg
- 5 Zack of how -- what we should set the settings at
- 6 and how we should set the settings. Greg Zack works
- 7 for the EPA, the Illinois EPA.
- 8 Q. Okay. Do you recall the measurements that
- 9 you got when you recorded the noise level?
- 10 A. I took the exact -- you know, each reading
- 11 I don't, but I remember taking it on intervals of
- 12 about a minute and then marking it down for charting
- 13 purposes.
- 14 Q. Do you independently recall those numbers?
- 15 A. No. I know some of them were 78
- 16 decibels. Some were pretty high.
- 17 Q. Did you record those numbers anywhere?
- 18 A. Yeah, I recorded them on a chart.
- 19 THE HEARING OFFICER: If we can go off the
- 20 record, please.
- 21 (Discussion had
- off the record.)
- 23 THE HEARING OFFICER: All right. We're back on
- 24 the record for PCB 98-81. We went off the record to

- 1 discuss marking the testimony of the present
- 2 witness, Mr. Bergau, regarding his use and the
- 3 manner in which he used the device that has been
- 4 marked as Complainants' Exhibit 5 for purposes of
- 5 the possibility of rereading that testimony back to
- 6 an expert to be called by the complainant.
- 7 The court reporter has indicated that she
- 8 has marked that area and may not -- while this court
- 9 reporter may not be the person who is here tomorrow,
- 10 she will make it available to the court reporter who
- 11 is here tomorrow in the event that we need to have
- 12 that portion read back.
- 13 Is that your understanding, Mr. Forcade?
- 14 MR. FORCADE: Yes.
- 15 THE HEARING OFFICER: And, Mr. Steger, any
- 16 objection to that?
- 17 MR. STEGER: No.
- 18 THE HEARING OFFICER: And, Ms. Court Reporter,
- 19 I guess I'm going to ask you to confirm is that
- 20 something that will be available tomorrow.
- 21 THE REPORTER: Yes.
- 22 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. Thank you.
- 23 Mr. Siros.

24

1 BY MR. SIROS:

- Q. I'll provide you with a copy of what's
- 3 been marked as Complainants' Exhibit 6.
- 4 Do you recognize that document?
- 5 A. Yes, I do.
- 6 Q. And would you please tell me what that is?
- 7 A. It's what they call a checkmark survey or
- 8 a data sheet I should say, which I marked the
- 9 baseline levels and then took readings at one-minute
- 10 intervals, and it shows the noise or the decibel
- 11 level recorded at each one of those one-minute
- 12 intervals.
- 13 Q. Can you please explain to me what the
- 14 little Xs marked in between the boxes on
- 15 Complainants' Exhibit 6 represent?
- 16 A. The Xs represent the magnitude of the
- 17 decibel level above the baseline.
- Q. Can you please tell me where you got these
- 19 checkmarks or the data sheets from?
- 20 A. I used the Radio Shack sound level meter
- 21 to record -- take the readings pointing -- by
- 22 pointing this unit at the Overland trucking firm and
- 23 logging it onto the sheet.
- Q. Where did you get the actual sheet from,

- 1 the blank sheet?
- 2 A. I got it from one of our neighbors who got
- 3 it from Greg Zack. Tara got those, Jeff's wife.
- 4 Q. You're referring to Tara Cohen?
- 5 A. Cohen.
- 6 Q. When you were recording the sound levels,
- 7 did you hear any other noises other than those from
- 8 the Overland facility?
- 9 A. You know, I don't know. I didn't
- 10 concentrate on anything else. I mean, I
- 11 concentrated on listening to what the trucks -- no.
- 12 It was -- you know, the times of the day, this was
- 13 done at 10:26 p.m. No, I don't remember hearing
- 14 anything else. It was specifically -- you know,
- 15 there weren't -- if you're looking for like airline
- 16 noises or anything, I didn't hear anything like
- 17 that.
- 18 Q. So these --
- 19 A. These were individual instances. You
- 20 know, they were taken for a period of like a couple
- 21 of seconds. You know, when the needle goes up and
- 22 goes back down, it's a matter of seconds.
- Q. So each of the checkmarks that are on
- 24 these data sheets represent noise that was occurring

- 1 from the Overland facility?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. And would you please explain to me your
- 4 handwritten -- the handwriting on the top of the
- 5 first page of what's been marked as Complainants'
- 6 Exhibit 6?
- 7 A. I marked down the address 667 Charter Hall
- 8 Drive, Palatine, Illinois, and then the date of the
- 9 -- that I took the recording, which was 5-1-96, and
- 10 the period of time that I did -- that I took these
- 11 readings at and the baseline, and it was from 10:26
- 12 p.m. until 10:36 p.m., and these measurements were
- 13 taken at a baseline level of 60, and then I put the
- 14 name at the top, Bergau.
- 15 Q. Did you, in fact, do that at the top of
- 16 each one of these checkmark data sheets that is
- 17 comprised of Complainants' Exhibit 6?
- 18 A. Yes, whichever baseline. The baseline
- 19 changed from 60 to 50, but yes, I did.
- 20 Q. Did you make these checkmarks -- I'm
- 21 sorry. Let me rephrase that.
- After you saw the reading on the noise
- 23 meter, how long did it take you to record these
- 24 checkmarks on this data sheet?

- 1 A. As long as a stroke -- it takes the stroke
- 2 of a pen.
- 3 Q. So you did it at the same time?
- 4 A. Yeah.
- 5 Q. And did that document accurately represent
- 6 the noise levels at the point in time when you took
- 7 the readings off the noise meter?
- 8 A. To the best of my knowledge it did because
- 9 I took it right off the meter itself, and if I --
- 10 you know, if the recording was higher and if I
- 11 wasn't quite sure, I would always mark it a little
- 12 bit lower.
- 13 Q. Okay. Can you compare the noise when you
- 14 moved in -- compare the noise when you moved in with
- 15 the noise now in terms of the frequency of the
- 16 noise?
- 17 A. Yeah. The frequency of the noise it's
- 18 almost seven days a week, oftentimes seven days a
- 19 week versus just the noise that bothered me just a
- 20 couple times a week.
- Q. Do you remember when the last time you
- 22 were bothered by noise from the Overland facility
- 23 was?
- 24 A. This morning, but we're very conscious of

- 1 it, but throughout the week, it has every day, and
- 2 it's been at 4:00 o'clock. I've been waking up at
- 3 3:30, 4:00 o'clock every morning, even this week.
- 4 Q. What time did you wake up this morning?
- 5 A. I woke up at ten to 5:00 this morning, but
- 6 it was with an alarm. We set our alarm.
- 7 Q. Okay.
- 8 A. To make sure that we got up on time to get
- 9 here.
- 10 Q. But then you heard the noise this morning?
- 11 A. Yeah. We heard the noise at 5:30 or
- 12 something like that.
- 13 MR. SIROS: Nothing further.
- 14 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. As far as
- 15 Complainants' Exhibit 6, how many pages are there,
- 16 Mr. Siros?
- 17 MR. SIROS: There are seven pages.
- 18 THE HEARING OFFICER: Seven pages.
- 19 Mr. Steger.
- 20 CROSS EXAMINATION
- 21 by Mr. Steger
- Q. Well, let's go quickly to the measurements
- 23 just so I'm clear.
- When you say set the baseline, what does

- 1 that mean?
- 2 A. It means that the meter will indicate
- 3 readings above or below the baseline anytime a noise
- 4 occurs and that's set on the meter. There's a dial
- 5 on the meter where I set the baseline. I set it to
- 6 that.
- 7 Q. And did you take it through the window?
- 8 A. Yes, I took it through the window --
- 9 Q. Did you hold it?
- 10 A. -- the upstairs bedroom window.
- 11 Yes, I hold it.
- 12 Q. Okay.
- 13 A. I hold it in my hand and point it just
- 14 towards the Overland facility.
- 15 Q. And then zero in -- and then -- I'm not
- 16 quite sure --
- 17 A. Okay. The first thing I do -- the process
- 18 goes like this. I take the meter, I check the
- 19 battery and make sure the battery power is good, and
- 20 there's an indicator on here that shows me that.
- 21 Then I set the baseline. There's a dial that sets
- 22 the baseline.
- 23 Q. Is there a dial that says baseline?
- A. It's a dial that indicates a number, and

- 1 then that number -- and it's either battery or a
- 2 number like 50, 60, 70, which according to my
- 3 instructions, show that that's the baseline reading,
- 4 and then I take the meter, put it in my hand and
- 5 hold it out the window, and I have a chart on my
- 6 right side, and I take the readings with minute
- 7 intervals. We had a clock upstairs that I used for
- 8 the timing.
- 9 Q. So, for example, on the first page, you
- 10 would take those -- it was on May 1st, 1996, from
- 11 10:26 to 10:36 p.m. You merely looked at the meter
- 12 and then just checked the box where it read?
- 13 A. Right.
- 14 Q. So let's go to the first box.
- 15 THE HEARING OFFICER: You are referring to
- 16 Group Exhibit -- Complainants' Exhibit 6?
- 17 MR. STEGER: I'm referring to page one of Group
- 18 Exhibit 6.
- 19 THE HEARING OFFICER: I apologize. I misstated
- 20 it. It's Complainants' Exhibit 6; is that correct.
- 21 MR. STEGER: Complaints' Exhibit 6.
- 22 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.
- 23 BY MR. STEGER:
- Q. Do you see where it says baseline level on

- 1 the graph?
- 2 A. Uh-huh.
- 3 Q. Okay. You've circled 60?
- 4 A. Right.
- 5 Q. What does that mean?
- 6 A. That I set the baseline level on the meter
- 7 to 60.
- 8 Q. Through what you just described?
- 9 A. Uh-huh.
- 10 Q. And then the first checkmark it goes from
- 11 zero to 50 along the Y axis?
- 12 A. We're talking about a baseline level of 60
- 13 now, not 50.
- 14 Q. Okay. But the Y axis says zero, ten, 20,
- 15 30, 40, 50 --
- 16 A. Okay.
- 17 Q. -- going up the left side, the Y axis?
- 18 A. Uh-huh.
- 19 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Bergau, it's
- 20 important that your answer be a yes or no response.
- 21 THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm sorry.
- 22 THE HEARING OFFICER: It's very difficult for
- 23 the court reporter to record that.
- 24 THE WITNESS: I didn't understand the

- 1 question.
- 2 BY MR. STEGER:
- 3 Q. I'm just putting a frame of reference.
- 4 I'll ask the question.
- 5 On the first block, you have marked what
- 6 appears to be two -- between ten and 20 on what's
- 7 called the two to four. What does that mean?
- 8 A. That means it was -- let's see. I have to
- 9 refresh my memory on this too.
- 10 THE HEARING OFFICER: Let the record reflect
- 11 the witness is looking at the document marked as
- 12 Complainants' Exhibit 6, the first page.
- 13 BY THE WITNESS:
- 14 A. God, I can't remember how I did this.
- 15 BY MR. STEGER:
- 16 Q. Were you pointing --
- 17 A. I took the reading --
- 18 THE HEARING OFFICER: Hold on. Hold on.
- 19 Are you saying you don't remember,
- 20 Mr. Bergau?
- 21 THE WITNESS: I don't remember exactly how I
- 22 did this, but I took the -- I want to say I took
- 23 the -- I don't remember exactly I hate to tell you.
- 24 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Steger.

1 BY MR. STEGER:

- Q. Let's ask you what about the columns to
- 3 the far right --
- 4 A. Uh-huh.
- 5 Q. -- the little numbers, did you fill those
- 6 in?
- 7 A. Yes, I did.
- 8 Q. Do you know what they mean?
- 9 A. Not really. I followed the directions
- 10 given to me. So they indicate the incidents, number
- 11 of incidents, at a certain level.
- 12 Q. Okay. Now, with respect to your
- 13 measurement, you set the baseline and then you sat
- 14 down and held it in your hand; is that correct?
- 15 A. Uh-huh.
- 16 Q. Pointing it out the window?
- 17 A. Right.
- 18 Q. So you would measure whatever sound came
- 19 in the window?
- 20 A. Exactly.
- Q. And then you'd mark it on your chart?
- 22 A. Right.
- 23 Q. Okay. Was there any ability to account
- 24 for ambient noise levels to differentiate what noise

- 1 you're hearing by that unit?
- 2 A. I have no idea.
- 3 Q. Any -- does this unit account for
- 4 reflection?
- 5 A. I'm not the expert on this meter. I don't
- 6 know.
- 7 Q. All right. Let me ask you about -- okay.
- 8 You're currently under treatment for --
- 9 A. I just finished my last treatment last
- 10 Friday for colon cancer.
- 11 Q. And then you testified that you would go
- 12 to sleep and then be woken up throughout the night?
- 13 A. I meant -- this was after the treatment?
- 14 Are you talking about the Friday treatment?
- 15 Q. Since you moved in to the facility.
- 16 A. Oh, yes.
- 17 Q. Okay. And then you would go downstairs
- 18 and sleep?
- 19 A. Right, uh-huh.
- Q. Okay. Is there anything else that wakes
- 21 you up during the night?
- 22 A. I don't -- I can't think of anything else
- 23 that would wake me up, not really.
- Q. I believe you testified that you moved in

- 1 in June of 1993?
- 2 A. That's correct.
- 3 Q. And did you accompany your wife when you
- 4 guys drove around the area before you put in your
- 5 bid?
- 6 A. Yes, we did.
- 7 Q. About how many times?
- 8 A. About four times, four or five times I
- 9 would say. I don't remember exactly, but we took
- 10 different times of the day and tried to look and see
- 11 what the noise -- if the noise affected -- would
- 12 affect our living there.
- 13 Q. Uh-huh.
- 14 A. So obviously --
- 15 Q. So you were aware of the truck terminal?
- 16 A. Yes, sure.
- 17 Q. About how far is it from your backyard to
- 18 the fence from your -- excuse me, from your patio to
- 19 your fence?
- A. From the house, I can tell you from the
- 21 house to the fence it's 32 feet.
- 22 Q. Okay. And is it about the same for your
- 23 neighbors?
- 24 A. Similar I would imagine. Some homes are
 - L.A. REPORTING (312) 419-9292

- 1 set back a little bit.
- Q. Okay. And the fence was there when you
- 3 moved in?
- 4 A. Yes, it was.
- 5 Q. The wooden fence behind your house?
- 6 A. Yes, it was there.
- 7 Q. I'm sorry. I missed what your occupation
- 8 was.
- 9 A. I'm a furniture store manager, keep it in
- 10 the family.
- 11 Q. We should work out a deal. Strike that.
- 12 MR. STEGER: Okay. I believe that's it. I
- 13 don't have any other questions.
- 14 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Siros.
- 15 MR. SIROS: Give me a moment. All right.
- 16 Nothing further.
- 17 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. Your witness asked
- 18 me if I kept the exhibits here. I simply indicated
- 19 that it would be -- and if they're introduced.
- What I would like to ask at this time and
- 21 I should have probably made a preference prior to
- 22 the other witnesses testifying, but my understanding
- 23 is that these are exhibits that are going to be
- 24 introduced without objection; is that correct,

- 1 Mr. Steger?
- 2 MR. STEGER: That is correct.
- 3 THE HEARING OFFICER: All right. And that is
- 4 referring to the exhibits that have been marked up
- 5 to now, Complainants' Exhibit 1, Complainants'
- 6 Exhibit 2, Complainants' Exhibit 3, Complainants'
- 7 Exhibit 5, Complainants' Exhibit 6. There is no
- 8 Complainants' Exhibit 4 at this point. However,
- 9 there is a Group Exhibit No. 1.
- 10 MR. SIROS: Yes, there is.
- 11 MR. STEGER: Yes, there is.
- 12 THE HEARING OFFICER: I apologize. Oh, I
- 13 apologize. There is a Complainants' Exhibit --
- 14 MR. FORCADE: Four.
- 15 MR. STEGER: Complainants' Exhibit 4.
- 16 THE HEARING OFFICER: Oh, I see. That is the
- 17 handwritten --
- 18 MR. FORCADE: Log of noises.
- 19 THE HEARING OFFICER: -- log. I see. I stand
- 20 corrected. There is a Complainants' Exhibit 4,
- 21 which is the handwritten log, which consists of
- 22 seven pages. Yes, seven handwritten pages referred
- 23 to in the testimony of Mr. Bergau, and there is a
- 24 Complainants' Exhibit 5 and 6, and there is also a

- 1 Group Exhibit 1, which consists of five photographs
- 2 numbered one through five, and those are -- are you
- 3 asking that they be admitted now?
- 4 MR. FORCADE: We're going to reserve the
- 5 request to admit evidence until the end of the
- 6 citizen testimony, and then we'll move to a second
- 7 component and, again, refreshing that we will make a
- 8 motion at a later time to ask for return of the
- 9 mechanical devices.
- 10 THE HEARING OFFICER: Of course. All right.
- 11 Mr. Bergau, you can step down.
- 12 THE WITNESS: Thank you.
- 13 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.
- 14 All right. If we're not going to admit
- 15 the documents, I'd ask that the documents remain in
- 16 your possession or exhibits.
- 17 MR. FORCADE: Sure.
- 18 THE HEARING OFFICER: Why don't we do this.
- 19 Let's -- based on what we've talked about
- 20 previously, let's take a lunch recess. I don't have
- 21 the exact time right now.
- 22 MR. FORCADE: It's about one -- sorry, about
- 23 12:20.
- 24 THE HEARING OFFICER: 12:20.

- 1 MR. FORCADE: And I'd like to ask if we could
- 2 keep it reasonably short.
- 3 THE HEARING OFFICER: Well, I would like to do
- 4 that as well. I would like to try to be back here,
- 5 but I wanted to go -- give everybody about 45
- 6 minutes. Is 1:00 o'clock reasonable for everybody?
- 7 Mr. Steger?
- 8 MR. STEGER: That's fine, yes.
- 9 THE HEARING OFFICER: That's less than 45
- 10 minutes obviously. What I'm afraid of is downstairs
- 11 you're going to hit lunch crowd now. We're a little
- 12 late. So I don't know what everybody's plans are.
- We will be -- why don't we try to be back
- 14 here at 1:00 with the hopes -- and my expectation is
- 15 to restart back at no later than 1:15. Okay? All
- 16 right. Thank you all very much. We'll return at
- 17 that time. Thank you.
- 18 (Whereupon, further proceedings
- 19 were adjourned pursuant to the
- 20 lunch break and reconvened
- 21 as follows.)
- 22 THE HEARING OFFICER: Let the record reflect
- 23 that this is Pollution Control Board docket number
- 24 98-81, Charter Hall Homeowner's Association vs. D.P.

- 1 Cartage. We have come back after the lunch recess
- 2 and are back in the complainants' case in chief.
- 3 Mr. Forcade, anything that we need to
- 4 discuss prior to going on with testimony?
- 5 MR. FORCADE: No. We're ready to call our next
- 6 witness.
- 7 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.
- 8 Mr. Steger?
- 9 MR. STEGER: No.
- 10 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. Let's go. Next
- 11 witness, please.
- 12 MR. SIROS: I call Behram Dinshaw.
- 13 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Dinshaw?
- 14 THE WITNESS: Yes.
- 15 THE HEARING OFFICER: Am I pronouncing that
- 16 correctly?
- 17 THE WITNESS: Yes.
- 18 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. Would you please
- 19 state your name and spell -- I apologize. You need
- 20 to be sworn in first.
- 21 Geanna, if you don't mind.
- 22 (Witness sworn.)
- 23 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Dinshaw, if you'll
- 24 please state your name and spell your last name? In

- 1 fact, why don't you spell your whole name?
- THE WITNESS: My name is Behram Dinshaw.
- 3 That's B-e-h-r-a-m, D-i-n-s-h-a-w.
- 4 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.
- 5 Mr. Siros.
- 6 BEHRAM DINSHAW,
- 7 called as a witness herein, having been first duly
- 8 sworn, deposeth and saith as follows:
- 9 DIRECT EXAMINATION
- 10 by Mr. Siros
- 11 Q. Mr. Dinshaw, would you please tell me
- 12 where you live?
- 13 A. 663 Charter Hall Drive in Palatine.
- 14 Q. Mr. Dinshaw, I would request that you
- 15 approach what's been marked as Complainants' Exhibit
- 16 1 and with this red pen put a circle -- I'm sorry.
- 17 Let me withdraw that.
- With this blue pen, please put a circle
- 19 around the address where you reside.
- 20 A. (Witness complied.)
- 21 MR. SIROS: Let the record reflect that
- 22 Mr. Dinshaw has put a blue circle at 663 Charter
- 23 Hall Drive on Complainants' Exhibit 1.
- 24 THE HEARING OFFICER: The record will so

- 1 reflect.
- 2 BY MR. SIROS:
- 3 Q. And who resides there with you?
- 4 A. Just myself.
- 5 Q. Yourself.
- 6 Do you own or rent your house?
- 7 A. I own it.
- 8 Q. When did you move in?
- 9 A. August 1996.
- 10 Q. When did you sign the contract on your
- 11 house?
- 12 A. August 6th, 1996.
- 13 Q. When you moved in, how long --
- 14 A. About four or five days later.
- 15 Q. And what is your occupation?
- 16 A. I'm an actuary.
- 17 Q. And you're taking time out to testify here
- 18 today?
- 19 A. Yes, I am.
- 20 Q. Would you please describe the layout of
- 21 your house?
- A. It's a two story house. Downstairs has
- 23 the living room, kitchen, dining room, half bath and
- 24 the garage, and the upstairs has three bedrooms, one

- 1 on the east side, two on the west side and two
- 2 baths.
- 3 Q. If I'm looking out from your first
- 4 floor -- the first floor of your house looking east,
- 5 what would I see?
- 6 A. From the first floor, you see the patio
- 7 and then a fence behind that.
- 8 Q. Okay. If I was looking east from your
- 9 second floor, what would I see?
- 10 A. You see the Overland trucking operations.
- 11 Q. And what can you see when you're looking
- 12 out from -- when you're seeing the Overland trucking
- 13 operations, what do you see?
- 14 A. You can see the terminal. You can see the
- 15 forklifts running in there. You can see the yard
- 16 truck. You can see the trailers parked and running,
- 17 and you can see individuals walking around.
- 18 Q. I'd like to hand you what I'm going to
- 19 mark as Group Exhibit 2, which will consist of 26
- 20 pictures. I've already tendered Mr. Steger a copy
- 21 of these.
- 22 (Group Exhibit No. 2 marked
- 23 for identification,
- 24 5-12-98.)

- 1 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Steger?
- 2 MR. STEGER: Yes.
- 3 THE HEARING OFFICER: Let the record reflect
- 4 that Mr. Steger has indicated that he has received
- 5 copies.
- 6 Okay. These are marked as Group Exhibit
- 7 2 --
- 8 MR. SIROS: Yes.
- 9 THE HEARING OFFICER: -- and they are
- 10 numbered -- enumerated on the back as well?
- 11 MR. SIROS: They are enumerated on the back,
- 12 and they consist of pictures one through 26 with a
- 13 time date stamp on the front of each picture to
- 14 differentiate them from Group Exhibit No. 1.
- 15 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. The distinguishing
- 16 feature from Group Exhibit No. 1 is the time date
- 17 stamp on these photos that is not there on Group
- 18 Exhibit 1?
- 19 MR. SIROS: That is correct.
- 20 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you very much.
- 21 BY MR. SIROS:
- 22 Q. Mr. Dinshaw, do you recognize these
- 23 pictures?
- 24 A. Yes, I do.

- 1 Q. And can you tell me how you recognize
- 2 these pictures?
- 3 A. I took these pictures myself.
- 4 Q. I'd like to direct your attention to Group
- 5 Exhibit 2, picture number one. Can you describe
- 6 that picture for me?
- 7 A. Picture number one was taken out of my
- 8 bedroom window facing east that is looking at the
- 9 Overland operations.
- 10 Q. I notice a time date stamp on that. Is
- 11 that time date stamp on picture number one 3-29-97?
- 12 A. That's correct.
- 13 Q. Does that, in fact, indicate the date that
- 14 you took that picture?
- 15 A. That's correct.
- 16 Q. Are all the pictures -- do all the
- 17 pictures in the group exhibit have similar time date
- 18 stamps?
- 19 A. They have similar time date stamps.
- Q. And would the time and date stamp in those
- 21 pictures reflect the date that those pictures were
- 22 taken?
- A. Yes, they do.
- 24 MR. STEGER: For the record, I don't have any

- 1 times on these. All I have is dates.
- 2 THE WITNESS: It is dates.
- 3 MR. SIROS: I'm sorry.
- 4 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay.
- 5 MR. SIROS: I'll rephrase that. It would only
- 6 be the date.
- 7 MR. STEGER: The date.
- 8 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. There are no time
- 9 values on any of the photographs?
- 10 THE WITNESS: Correct.
- 11 MR. SIROS: That is correct.
- 12 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you. Thank you,
- 13 Mr. Steger.
- 14 BY MR. SIROS:
- 15 Q. So Group Exhibit 2, picture number one,
- 16 represents what again? I'm sorry.
- 17 A. This is looking out of my bedroom window,
- 18 and it shows the west side of the west compound of
- 19 Overland, and it shows basically trailers parked on
- 20 that end.
- 21 Q. I'd like to direct your attention to Group
- 22 Exhibit 2, picture number two.
- Would you tell me what that represents?
- A. Picture number two is again taken out of

- 1 my window, and it's just -- it just shows the south
- 2 side of that compound and it shows trailers parked
- 3 along the perimeter fence.
- 4 Q. Is this picture taken from the second
- 5 floor of your house?
- 6 A. Yes, it is.
- 7 Q. I'd like to direct your attention to Group
- 8 Exhibit 2, picture number three.
- 9 Would you identify that picture, please?
- 10 A. That's a picture taken at night again from
- 11 my window facing the same direction, facing the east
- 12 so looking at the west compound of Overland.
- 13 Q. And would you describe what appears to be
- 14 a white spot along -- in the upper left-hand corner
- 15 of that picture?
- 16 A. Yes. Apparently, I believe, that's
- 17 probably the flood lights outside at nighttime. I
- 18 couldn't get a clearer picture, but this is the best
- 19 I could do. It shows that it shines directly in our
- 20 windows at night.
- 21 Q. I'd like to direct your attention to Group
- 22 Exhibit 2, picture four.
- 23 Please describe that picture for us.
- A. Picture four was an attempt to see the

- 1 north side of the west compound again because there
- 2 are some trailers, but it's rather dark. So I can't
- 3 really see them from this picture.
- 4 Q. I'd like to direct your attention to Group
- 5 Exhibit 2, pictures number five and six. They
- 6 appear to be basically the same picture. Please
- 7 describe them?
- 8 A. Yes, they do. They are taken from my
- 9 bedroom window again, and it shows numerous trailers
- 10 parked on the west side of the compound.
- 11 Q. And were those pictures taken on two
- 12 different days?
- 13 A. Yes, they were.
- 14 Q. Picture number five was taken on?
- 15 A. The 22nd and picture number six on the
- 16 23rd.
- 17 Q. I'd like to direct your attention to Group
- 18 Exhibit 2, picture number seven.
- 19 Would you please describe that?
- 20 A. Picture number seven is again taken out of
- 21 my bedroom window, and, again, it shows numerous
- 22 trailers parked on the west side.
- 23 Q. I would direct your attention to picture
- 24 number eight and ask what that represents?

- 1 A. Picture number eight, again, represents
- 2 pictures taken out of my bedroom window showing
- 3 trailers parked on the west side.
- 4 Q. I direct your attention to Group Exhibit
- 5 2, pictures nine and ten.
- 6 Would you please describe those two
- 7 pictures.
- 8 A. Pictures nine and ten are, again, taken
- 9 out of my bedroom window and show numerous trailers
- 10 parked on that same west side.
- 11 Q. Okay. I direct your attention to picture
- 12 number 11.
- Would you please describe that?
- 14 A. Number 11, again, taken out of my bedroom
- 15 window and shows numerous trailers parked on the
- 16 perimeter on the west side.
- 17 Q. Please describe picture number 12.
- 18 A. Picture number 12 is hazy. It was
- 19 probably snowing, but it's again pictures taken out
- 20 of my bedroom window in an attempt to capture the
- 21 trailers parked on the west side.
- Q. Picture number 13, would you please tell
- 23 me what that represents?
- A. Picture number 13, again, shows numerous

- 1 trailers parked on the perimeter on the west side.
- 2 Q. I direct your attention to picture number
- 3 13. There appears to be a wooden fence in the
- 4 background; is that correct?
- 5 A. Correct.
- 6 Q. I'd like to direct your attention to
- 7 Complainants' Exhibit 1, the dark black line that is
- 8 drawn between lots 699 -- I'm sorry, addresses 699
- 9 and 627.
- 10 Is the wooden fence referenced in picture
- 11 number -- Group Exhibit 2, picture 13, the same
- 12 fence line that appears to be referenced in
- 13 Complainants' Exhibit 1?
- 14 A. Yes, it is.
- 15 Q. Directing your attention to picture number
- 16 14, would you please tell me what that represents?
- 17 A. Picture number 14 is, again, another
- 18 picture taken out of my bedroom window showing
- 19 several trailers parked on the west side.
- 20 Q. I direct your attention to picture number
- 21 15. Would you please tell me where that was taken
- 22 and what that represents?
- 23 A. Yes. Picture number 15 is taken as I --
- 24 it's taken as I enter the complex from Northwest

- 1 Highway, and it shows the east side of the compound,
- 2 and it also shows that there are no trailers parked
- 3 on the east side of the compound like there were on
- 4 the west side.
- 5 Q. What direction were you facing when you
- 6 took this picture?
- 7 A. This would be facing south.
- 8 Q. I would request that you approach
- 9 Complainants' Exhibit No. 1 and with this -- with a
- 10 black pen, please make a black square where you took
- 11 that picture from?
- 12 A. Probably approximately -- kind of where
- 13 the circle is. If I can just make a black circle
- 14 here. There is a fence out here, a wire fence, and
- 15 it's before that. It overlooks this side
- 16 (indicating).
- 17 MR. SIROS: Let the record reflect that Mr.
- 18 Dinshaw has placed a black circle right next to the
- 19 red circle in the -- right next to the White Hall
- 20 designation on Complainants' Exhibit 1.
- 21 THE HEARING OFFICER: The record will so
- 22 reflect.
- 23 MR. SIROS: And that is, in fact, where he took
- 24 picture number 15 from.

- 1 THE HEARING OFFICER: Is that accurate,
- 2 Mr. Dinshaw?
- 3 THE WITNESS: Yes, it is.
- 4 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you. The record
- 5 will so reflect.
- 6 BY MR. SIROS:
- 7 Q. Directing your attention to picture 16,
- 8 would you please describe what is referenced in that
- 9 picture?
- 10 A. Picture 16 is taken from the same
- 11 position, except I've just twisted a little to the
- 12 right. In other words, facing the back side of
- 13 Charter Hall to show that there's trailers parked on
- 14 the west side.
- 15 Q. And are those homes in the far background
- 16 the Charter Hall homes?
- 17 A. Yes, they are.
- 18 Q. Directing your attention to pictures 17
- 19 and 18, could you please describe what those
- 20 pictures reference?
- 21 A. Yes. Pictures 17 and 18 are most likely
- 22 west, just a few paces slightly west, to capture a
- 23 better picture of the west compound, which shows,
- 24 again, that there's trailers parked on that end to

- 1 try and compare with the other photographs we saw
- 2 where there were no trailers parked on the east
- 3 side.
- 4 Q. And where approximately were these
- 5 pictures taken from?
- 6 A. Right where the black circle -- where the
- 7 black circle is, but a few paces to the west of
- 8 that.
- 9 Q. The black circle you're indicating is the
- 10 one that you marked on Complainants' Exhibit 1?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. I direct your attention to picture number
- 13 19. Would you please explain what that references?
- 14 A. Picture number 19, again, is an attempt to
- 15 capture the trailers parked on the west side. I
- 16 moved even slightly further west of my black mark to
- 17 get a better photograph to show numerous trailers
- 18 parked on that side of the compound.
- 19 Q. Approximately, how much farther west did
- 20 you move to take this picture?
- A. Probably another 20 feet.
- 22 Q. Referencing picture number 20, would you
- 23 please explain what that represents?
- A. Picture number 20 is, again, taken at

- 1 approximately the black spot that I drew to show
- 2 that there are no trailers parked on the east side
- 3 of that compound.
- 4 Q. Would you please describe where you took
- 5 the pictures referenced in pictures 21 and 22 from
- 6 and what they reference?
- 7 A. Pictures 21 and 22 are, again, taken out
- 8 of my bedroom window and they show -- 21, for
- 9 example, shows a few trailers parked on the west
- 10 side of the compound, and 22 shows several trailers
- 11 parked in a line on the perimeter on the west side
- 12 of the compound.
- 13 Q. Turning your attention to picture number
- 14 23, would you please describe what that picture
- 15 references?
- 16 A. Picture number 23 is, again, taken from
- 17 the spot marked on the -- the spot marked with the
- 18 black circle again to show that on the east side of
- 19 the compound there are, in fact, no trailers parked
- 20 out there like there were on the west side.
- 21 Q. The black circle you're referencing is the
- 22 one you marked on Complainants' Exhibit 1; is that
- 23 correct?
- 24 A. Correct.

- 1 Q. And would you please describe what's
- 2 referenced in picture 24?
- 3 A. Picture 24, again, is taken out of my
- 4 bedroom window to show several trailers parked on
- 5 the west side of the compound.
- 6 Q. I'd like to direct your attention to
- 7 pictures 25 and 26. Would you please identify where
- 8 you took those pictures from?
- 9 A. Twenty-five and 26 were taken from a few
- 10 paces west of the black circle shown on Exhibit one,
- 11 again, to show that there were trailers parked only
- 12 on the west side of the compound.
- 13 Q. Mr. Dinshaw, when you moved in in August
- 14 of 1996, were you aware that there was a trucking
- 15 operation located immediately to the east of your
- 16 property?
- 17 A. I was aware there was an operation, yes.
- 18 Q. Were you aware that a -- that the
- 19 developer had filed a notice informing you --
- 20 informing people that there was, in fact, a 24-hour
- 21 trucking operation located to the east of the
- 22 property?
- A. No, I was not informed.
- Q. You were not aware of that?
 - L.A. REPORTING (312) 419-9292

- 1 A. I was definitely not aware of that.
- 2 Q. Did you do anything to determine whether
- 3 or not the trucking facility that you saw to the
- 4 east of your property -- I'm sorry. Let me rephrase
- 5 that.
- 6 Did you do anything to determine whether
- 7 the trucking facility generated noise?
- 8 A. Yes, I did. I was certainly concerned
- 9 about the trucking facility. So I actually went
- 10 over to the facility, went into their office and
- 11 asked them what their hours were, and I was told
- 12 specifically that they shut down by 10:00 o'clock at
- 13 night, they don't disturb neighbors, and they don't
- 14 work on the weekends.
- 15 Q. Do you recall who you spoke with?
- 16 A. No. I did not ask for a name. I had no
- 17 reason to ask or no reason not to believe them at
- 18 the time. I was simply inquiring. I also --
- 19 naturally, that was wasn't enough for me, and so I
- 20 visited the property at least twice, if not three
- 21 times. One was on a Saturday, you know, just to
- 22 make sure they weren't working on the weekend, and
- 23 the other one was -- I believe it was a Friday night
- 24 rather late. It was probably around midnight when I

- 1 went to visit them, visit the property rather, and
- 2 saw that it was quiet, the Charter Hall property
- 3 that is.
- 4 Q. After you moved in, when did you first
- 5 hear the noise from the Overland facility?
- 6 A. The very first day I moved in was the
- 7 Sunday following August 6th when I signed my
- 8 contract. That very night at midnight, it was a
- 9 warm night, it was August, I heard the trucks
- 10 rolling in at midnight and the facility beginning
- 11 work, and I couldn't sleep that whole night.
- 12 Q. How often would you say that you hear the
- 13 noise from the facility per week?
- 14 A. Every single night multiple times.
- 15 Q. I'd like to take you through a day
- 16 starting at 8:00 in the morning to 8:00 in the
- 17 morning the next day. Would you please tell me the
- 18 periods when you hear noise from the facility?
- 19 A. Usually I'm at work starting around 8:00
- 20 in the morning. Only on certain occasions have I
- 21 been at home and generally I think by around 8:00
- 22 o'clock that some of the noise has abated and you
- 23 can hear the occasional noise, but when I get home,
- 24 which is around 6:00 or 7:00, it's quite clear that

- 1 they're working at that point, and it's very noisy.
- 2 The noise tends to escalate all the way
- 3 through until they're done, which is around
- 4 midnight, sometimes likely before that, sometimes
- 5 well after that. The noise again starts around 2:00
- 6 o'clock. Sometimes it's before that. Just last
- 7 Thursday I was woken up at 1:40. I noted that time
- 8 down myself, and most of the time I've woken up
- 9 around 3:30 with a very, very loud bang, which
- 10 basically doesn't abate until the time I get out of
- 11 bed.
- 12 Q. Is that 3:30 in the morning?
- 13 A. Yes, it is. That's 3:30 in the morning.
- 14 Q. Okay. What time do you normally get up?
- 15 A. Since I moved into this property, I now
- 16 try to get out of bed by around 7:00 o'clock, which
- 17 is at least an hour later than what I used to do.
- 18 Q. And why is that?
- 19 A. That's because, frankly, I don't get to
- 20 sleep at night. By the time -- I can't get to bed
- 21 until they've stopped work at night, which is
- 22 usually around midnight. At that point, I try to go
- 23 to bed, and I'm woken up again in a couple hours,
- 24 and from that point, it's nothing but tossing and

- 1 turning until I wake up. It's multiple times.
- 2 So, I mean, because of that, I tend to
- 3 spend some more time at home trying to catch up on
- 4 whatever few minutes of sleep I can get. I don't
- 5 get more than like three to four hours of quality
- 6 sleep a night.
- 7 Q. Could you please describe the different
- 8 types of noise that you hear from the facility?
- 9 A. There's several types of noise. One of
- 10 the major noises is the dock plates clashing, at
- 11 least how I view it. When the forklifts sort of
- 12 roll into the trailer, you can hear -- there's a
- 13 double bang, and I'm not sure why it's double, but
- 14 from what I've seen, and I've seen the trailers,
- 15 I've seen the forklifts do this when they run in,
- 16 it's a very, very loud bang. It almost sounds like
- 17 an explosion or a clap of thunder perhaps, you know,
- 18 however you want to put it, but it is extremely loud
- 19 and many times it can shake the house.
- 20 For example, another source of noise, a
- 21 really large source of noise, is when the yard truck
- 22 hitches the trailers parked on the west side. When
- 23 they hitch those trailers, the yard truck usually
- 24 comes in with a fair amount of speed as it reverses

1 in. That's something, again, that I viewed and

- 2 noticed.
- 3 It comes in at a speed, shakes the whole
- 4 trailer, and the noise is so loud at that point,
- 5 especially if the trailer is parked at the perimeter
- 6 of Charter Hall Drive -- Charter Hall fence, excuse
- 7 me, that it shakes the house.
- 8 Q. Now, when you say perimeter, what do you
- 9 mean by that?
- 10 A. The fence. I call that the perimeter. I
- 11 should be more clear.
- 12 Q. And which side is that on?
- 13 A. That's on the east side of Charter Hall,
- 14 of my house. That's a very, very large source of
- 15 noise. Once the trailer has been hitched, at that
- 16 point, the engine revs real loud and picks up the
- 17 trailer from its two legs, if you will, and carries
- 18 it away.
- Many times it's not hitched properly, at
- 20 least how I view it, and it's dragged along the
- 21 ground, and that is a terribly disturbing sound and
- 22 noise. I mean, it is amazing. One must hear that.
- 23 It's very, very loud.
- 24 Another source of noise is just the fact

- 1 that you can hear the reverse beep of the trucks
- 2 right on the west side. You hear the yard truck and
- 3 other trailers running around. There are times
- 4 when the yard -- the yard truck is very loud. If
- 5 you can imagine putting your car in first gear and
- 6 just simply running it in first gear, if you can
- 7 just imagine the revving, the noise, and that's how
- 8 the yard truck sounds.
- In fact, there are some times in the
- 10 winter I've noticed when people running the yard
- 11 trucks are simply having fun out there in the snow,
- 12 and they'll come at a high speed from the north end
- 13 to the south and apply their brakes and spin around.
- 14 Q. How do you conclude that they're just
- 15 having fun?
- 16 A. Well, if they're coming at a high speed
- 17 while in snow and they're spinning around having
- 18 a -- it looks to me like they're having a good
- 19 time. You wouldn't come in at that speed and just
- 20 intentionally apply the brakes and spin around.
- Q. Do they load a trailer after that?
- A. Oh, yeah. Then they'll come and reverse
- 23 it and load the trailer. It's very loud. You can
- 24 hear them shouting. You can hear them playing music

- 1 very loud. You can hear them beeping early hours of
- 2 the morning, late hours of the night.
- 3 Q. When you say beeping, what are you
- 4 referring to?
- 5 A. It's the beeping of trucks or even the
- 6 beeping of, I think, the forklifts. It's like a
- 7 beep, beep, like a double beep you can hear. It's
- 8 quite clear what's happening.
- 9 Q. And when you testified as to the noise of
- 10 unloading and loading and the noise of the hitching
- 11 and unhitching of the trailers, is this something
- 12 you've physically observed?
- 13 A. Yes, I have.
- 14 There's another source of noise I failed
- 15 to mention too. Even after -- if they've stopped
- 16 running their forklifts around, what happens is when
- 17 the trucks roll into the west side, and I'm not an
- 18 expert on this, but there's -- apparently, there's a
- 19 certain -- it's a pressurized system and it lets go
- 20 of the pressure. It's not the brakes. They let go
- 21 of the pressure. It's like a hose. They let go,
- 22 and that lets the first trailer sort of settle down
- 23 in the ground, and it's a very loud hissing noise
- 24 that won't go away for a good ten seconds, just a

- 1 very strong hissing sound. It's some sort of
- 2 pressure mechanism. That alone will wake you up. I
- 3 mean, that's pretty loud.
- 4 Q. Have you done anything to record specific
- 5 dates when loud noises occurred?
- 6 A. Yes, I have. I kept a noise log in the
- 7 past.
- 8 Q. Do you independently recall the specific
- 9 dates without referring to that noise log?
- 10 A. No, I don't, but it's pretty much every
- 11 night.
- 12 (Complainants' Exhibit No. 7
- marked for identification,
- 14 5-12-98.)
- 15 BY MR. SIROS:
- 16 Q. I'd like to show you what we're marking as
- 17 Complainants' Exhibit 7 for identification. I've
- 18 already tendered a copy to Mr. Steger?
- 19 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Steger?
- 20 MR. STEGER: Uh-huh.
- 21 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Steger has indicated
- 22 that he's received a copy for the record.
- 23 BY MR. SIROS:
- Q. Do you recognize that?

- 1 A. Yes, I do.
- Q. Would you please let me know what that is?
- 3 A. That's my noise log, basically, which
- 4 shows by date and time when I was woken up.
- 5 Q. Would you please describe how you would
- 6 place these entries on the noise log?
- A. Basically, when I first woke up, I'd note
- 8 down -- you know, I'd turn the light on and note
- 9 down exactly what time it was.
- For several of these dates, you see it is
- 11 multiple times a night. Now, these are the times
- 12 that only the loudest of all the noises occurred.
- 13 There were times in between when, you know, you
- 14 could hear the engines running and them fooling
- 15 around.
- 16 I couldn't really note everything down.
- 17 So when the loudest of all the noises happened is
- 18 when I'd note it down.
- 19 Q. I would ask that you turn to page eight,
- 20 which is the last page of the document.
- Would you please read that last paragraph
- 22 there?
- A. The last paragraph says due to sheer
- 24 inconvenience, I stopped keeping track of the

- 1 specific times that I was disturbed by noise created
- 2 by Overland's operations after 4-7-97.
- 3 Essentially, I'm awakened multiple times
- 4 in the late evening hours each day Monday through
- 5 Friday and the early morning hours each day Monday
- 6 through Saturday, including Saturday morning
- 7 starting around 8:00 a.m.
- 8 The noise consists primarily of; one,
- 9 clashing dock plates; two, hitching of trailers that
- 10 are parked just across the Charter Hall perimeter
- 11 fence; and three, high revving yard truck engine.
- 12 Q. Do you recall when you typed this, the
- 13 date?
- 14 A. I typed this a few months ago.
- 15 Q. Does this still accurately represent the
- 16 present conditions at the Overland facility?
- 17 A. Yes, with a couple of changes or
- 18 additions. Now, on Saturday morning they start much
- 19 before 8:00 a.m.
- Q. What time would you -- do they start now?
- 21 A. Saturday morning -- two Saturdays ago,
- 22 they started at 5:45. Last Saturday they started at
- 23 5:00 a.m. It's gotten worse. In my logs also, just
- 24 for the record, there is one Sunday when they

1 started at 5:30 in the morning. I have noted that

- 2 down too.
- 3 Q. You recorded that on the noise log, which
- 4 has been marked as Complainants' Exhibit 7?
- 5 A. Yes, by date.
- 6 Q. How does the noise from the Overland
- 7 facility affect your daily life?
- 8 A. It affects my daily life in numerous
- 9 ways. Most importantly, I can't sleep at night.
- 10 I'm awakened multiple times. I don't sleep more
- 11 than a couple hours before I'm, you know, woken up.
- 12 At that point, it's simply, you know, tossing and
- 13 turning until I need to get out of bed. You can't
- 14 get -- I don't get more than three to four hours of
- 15 quality sleep a night. That has a profound effect
- 16 and has had a profound effect on me because this has
- 17 been continuous exposure to this kind of noise
- 18 level.
- One of the things, of course, I go to work
- 20 much later now. I have -- I miss a lot of my 8:00
- 21 o'clock meetings. I used to always start around
- 22 7:45. I've been talked to about this by my boss. I
- 23 have been generally somewhat inattentive at work,
- 24 frankly, because I don't get enough sleep.

- 1 I'm responsible for several people and
- 2 productivity for several states, and I think my work
- 3 quality is diminished. At home, I don't even like
- 4 coming home after work. I try and come home after
- 5 7:00 o'clock just to stay at work as long as
- 6 possible. I don't need to, but I'll do anything to
- 7 stay away from home.
- 8 I come home, the first thing I hear is the
- 9 noise. I can't open the windows. It's too loud. I
- 10 can't talk on the phone with the windows open or
- 11 even sometimes closed. I had a very important phone
- 12 call from California one evening, which I had to
- 13 come home early for. I couldn't talk on the phone.
- 14 It was so loud even the gentleman on the phone was
- 15 asking what was going on in the background, what's
- 16 the noise, the thud as he called it. He had to call
- 17 me back at work the next day because we could not
- 18 hold -- just have a general conversation.
- 19 You can't just sit down and relax and
- 20 listen to music, read a book. You can't do anything
- 21 without any ambient noise. If the TV is on, you've
- 22 got to turn it up real loud. That drowns only some
- 23 of the noise. Once the windows are open, there is
- 24 no drowning of noise. It is extremely loud.

- 1 You can't -- you certainly can't entertain
- 2 at home. Since the day I moved in, I have not had
- 3 any entertainment at home at all since the day I
- 4 moved. My father came to visit me the day I moved
- 5 in, which was actually about August 12th, '96. He
- 6 stayed with me for about a month, and he had a very
- 7 difficult time with this. I mean, it was August.
- 8 It was warm. The windows were open. He's a
- 9 workaholic. Staying at home for him is not usual,
- 10 but every time I called him at home, like 11:00
- 11 o'clock in the morning or noontime, I'd wake him
- 12 up. That's very unusual for a gentleman who wakes
- 13 up by 7:00 every morning normally.
- I asked him what's up, and he's like well,
- 15 I was just taking a nap. When is the last time my
- 16 dad has taken a nap at that time? He couldn't sleep
- 17 at night. I was embarrassed. He was embarrassed
- 18 for me. I mean, you can't have that going on. I
- 19 can't have friends over.
- 20 Many times in the evening we get -- I get
- 21 together with friends and they're like why don't we
- 22 just meet at Behram's house and go somewhere? It's
- 23 never done that way because I have to go to someone
- 24 else's house. It is too embarrassing. I can't just

- 1 relax. I can't put my head down to relax and sleep
- 2 on the couch or just relax and read a book I can't
- 3 even do it on Saturdays anymore. The noise has
- 4 worsened. They now work every Saturday starting at
- 5 5:00, for example, last Saturday.
- 6 There was one Saturday where they went all
- 7 the way until midnight. In fact, I got out of the
- 8 house just at 10:00 o'clock and just went to a
- 9 friend's house and can I just crash at your place?
- 10 I couldn't take it. This was my day off to relax.
- 11 They have gotten very loud.
- 12 Another thing they've been doing and one
- 13 thing I need to note is whenever the trucks come in
- 14 to the Overland facility, their first port of entry
- 15 is always the west compound, okay, the one right
- 16 outside of Charter Hall.
- 17 Q. When you say the west compound, what do
- 18 you mean by that?
- 19 A. Can I show you up there on the exhibit
- 20 or --
- Q. Certainly. Why don't I ask you to put a
- 22 yellow X where you're referring to as the west
- 23 compound.
- A. This is the west compound. Okay?

- 1 THE HEARING OFFICER: Let the record reflect
- 2 that a yellow X has been placed in the area within
- 3 the Overland Transportation boundary on
- 4 Complainants' Exhibit 1 between the Charter Hall
- 5 association residents and the Overland facility.
- 6 BY THE WITNESS:
- 7 A. The point I'm trying to make is all the
- 8 trucks come in through here, and their first port of
- 9 entry is here, not there. It's always here
- 10 (indicating).
- 11 THE HEARING OFFICER: Let the record reflect
- 12 that what Mr. Dinshaw is referring to are the -- as
- 13 the point of entry is from the Northwest Highway
- 14 coming in what appears to be behind the Overland
- 15 Transportation facility at least on the west -- what
- 16 would be the west portion of that facility between
- 17 the residents inside Charter Hall and the -- what
- 18 appears to be a building at the Overland
- 19 Transportation facility.
- 20 BY MR. SIROS:
- Q. Mr. Dinshaw, when is the last time you
- 22 were bothered by noise from the Overland facility?
- A. This morning. Starting at about 1:30, the
- 24 truck rolled in.

- 1 Q. Is that 1:30 a.m.?
- A. 1:30 a.m., the truck rolled in and made
- 3 several attempts to park the trailer on the west
- 4 side, and it sat there with the engine running for
- 5 45 minutes and the lights on, too, by the way for 45
- 6 minutes, and then at about 1:45, I heard the first
- 7 bang, the clashing of the plates, and then some
- 8 louder ones around 3:30 that was -- I found it very
- 9 loud around 5:00 o'clock, 5:00, 5:15 this morning.
- 10 Basically starting around 1:30 I couldn't sleep.
- 11 Q. So you were -- were you awoken at 1:30
- 12 when the truck --
- 13 A. I was woken at 1:30.
- 14 MR. SIROS: Thank you. Nothing further.
- 15 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Steger.
- 16 CROSS EXAMINATION
- 17 by Mr. Steger
- 18 Q. Just a few questions here. Who did you
- 19 buy your unit from?
- 20 A. Who did I buy it from? I believe the
- 21 O'Malleys was their last name.
- Q. It was a couple?
- 23 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. Did you deal direct with the

- 1 O'Malleys or not or did you deal through a -- or did
- 2 you deal --
- 3 A. I had a lawyer.
- 4 Q. -- through a real estate broker?
- 5 A. Real estate broker and lawyer.
- 6 Q. Did either the broker for the O'Malleys or
- 7 your broker advise you as to the presence of the
- 8 truck terminal?
- 9 A. They advised me of the presence and also
- 10 advised me to go and find out more about it as to
- 11 their times, operations, and I did exactly that.
- 12 Q. Did you ever talk to the O'Malleys
- 13 directly?
- 14 A. No, because when I visited the home, they
- 15 weren't there.
- 16 Q. Other than the Overland activity, is there
- 17 anything else you hear, any traffic from Northwest
- 18 Highway?
- 19 A. Not particularly, no.
- Q. From the mall?
- 21 A. No.
- Q. Do you ever hear aircraft noise?
- A. On occasion, aircraft flies by.
- Q. Dogs barking?

- 1 A. I don't have any dogs around.
- Q. Birds?
- 3 A. Not really. My window is always closed,
- 4 hot or cold.
- 5 Q. Did you have an air conditioning unit?
- 6 A. Yes, I do, an outside unit.
- 7 Q. Does that run during the hot months?
- 8 A. I have to. The windows are closed.
- 9 MR. STEGER: Okay. I don't have any other
- 10 questions.
- 11 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Siros.
- 12 MR. SIROS: Nothing.
- 13 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Dinshaw, thank you
- 14 very much.
- 15 THE WITNESS: Do I keep these here?
- 16 THE HEARING OFFICER: Why don't we hand those
- 17 back to Mr. Siros.
- 18 Let the record reflect that the exhibits
- 19 that Mr. Dinshaw has referred to have been handed
- 20 back to Mr. Siros.
- 21 Mr. Siros.
- MR. SIROS: Our next witness is Tibebu
- 23 Senbetta.
- 24 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Senbetta, would you

- 1 please raise your right hand and be sworn in?
- 2 (Witness sworn.)
- 3 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Senbetta, why don't
- 4 you spell your first name and last name?
- 5 THE WITNESS: The first name is Tibebu, T, as
- 6 in Tom, i-b-e-b-u. The last name Senbetta,
- 7 S-e-n-b-e-t-t-a.
- 8 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.
- 9 TIBEBU SENBETTA,
- 10 called as a witness herein, having been first duly
- 11 sworn, deposeth and saith as follows:
- 12 DIRECT EXAMINATION
- by Mr. Siros
- 14 Q. Would you please tell me where you live?
- 15 A. I live at 655 North Charter Hall in
- 16 Palatine.
- 17 Q. I'm running out of shapes.
- I would ask that you put a red triangle on
- 19 Complainants' Exhibit 1 that would represent where
- 20 you reside?
- 21 A. (Witness complied.)
- MR. SIROS: Let the record reflect that
- 23 Mr. Senbetta has placed a red triangle on the part
- 24 marked 655 on Complainants' Exhibit 1.

- 1 THE HEARING OFFICER: The record will so
- 2 reflect.
- 3 BY MR. SIROS:
- 4 Q. Mr. Senbetta, when did you move into your
- 5 house?
- 6 A. I moved May of '97.
- 7 Q. And do you own or rent?
- 8 A. Own.
- 9 Q. Do you live alone?
- 10 A. No. I live with my wife.
- 11 Q. Anyone else reside with you?
- 12 A. One fish.
- 13 Q. What's your occupation?
- 14 A. I'm an information systems professional,
- 15 systems analyst.
- 16 Q. Are you taking time out from your job to
- 17 testify here today?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. What's the name of your fish?
- A. I don't have a name yet.
- Q. Still working on it.
- Would you describe generally the layout of
- 23 your house, please?
- A. Yes. It's a two-story house. The bottom

- 1 floor is a living room, a dining room, and a
- 2 kitchen, and a half bath, and a two-car garage, and
- 3 the upstairs has got three bedrooms and two full
- 4 baths.
- 5 Q. Okay. Would you tell me for the first
- 6 floor which rooms are located on the east side of
- 7 your home?
- 8 A. On the east side is the dining room and
- 9 the living room.
- 10 Q. And if I was looking out from the living
- 11 room to the east, what would I see?
- 12 A. You will see a patio and the little
- 13 backyard and then a few trees and the fence.
- 14 Q. Okay. Would you please tell me what rooms
- 15 are on the east side of your second floor?
- 16 A. On the second floor, it's the master
- 17 bathroom and the master bedroom.
- 18 Q. If I was looking out from the master
- 19 bedroom to the east, what would I see?
- A. You'll see the top of the trees and the
- 21 property of Overland, the loading docks, the entire
- 22 building, a couple of trucks sometimes, some stored
- 23 gas I guess for the forklifts and stuff, and maybe
- 24 the shop I believe is out there, too, and the

- 1 offices.
- Q. When you moved in in -- I'm sorry. You
- 3 moved in in May of '97; is that correct?
- 4 A. Yes, I did.
- 5 Q. When you moved in in May of '97, were you
- 6 aware that there was a trucking operation located
- 7 directly to the east of your property?
- 8 A. Yes, I was.
- 9 Q. And were you aware that that was a 24-hour
- 10 trucking operation?
- 11 A. No, I did not.
- 12 Q. Were you aware that the developer had
- 13 filed a notice indicating that, in fact, that
- 14 trucking operation was a 24-hour trucking operation?
- 15 A. Nobody had mentioned that to me.
- 16 Q. Who did you purchase your property from?
- 17 A. I don't remember their names. Watkins or
- 18 I don't really remember their names.
- 19 Q. Did you discuss with them at all the
- 20 trucking facility?
- 21 A. I never talked with them directly. Ever
- 22 time we went to look at the property, they were
- 23 gone. So I never really talked with them.
- Q. How many times did you visit the property

- 1 before you purchased it?
- 2 A. We stopped by and drove by a number of
- 3 times. I would say in excess of ten times or more,
- 4 and we parked the cars normally, looked at the
- 5 property, looked at the surrounding areas.
- 6 Then we looked inside of the house.
- 7 Actually, we'd been there maybe I would say there or
- 8 four times actually inside with the realtor, with
- 9 the real estate agent.
- 10 Q. Did you ever visit the property in the
- 11 middle of the night?
- 12 A. No. Actually, let me back up a little bit
- 13 as far as visiting the place. In terms of the
- 14 trucking company, I did have a concern when I saw
- 15 the property of the trucking company back there, but
- 16 the concern was I wonder what kind of noise there
- 17 will be if there is any.
- 18 So we came by, drove at different times of
- 19 the day, early in the morning, 6:00 o'clock,
- 20 sometimes earlier than 6:00 o'clock. About three or
- 21 four times before I went to work, I'd go drive
- 22 through there, and there was visitors parking right
- 23 next door to our house. I parked the car there and
- 24 rolled down the window to see if I can hear anything

- 1 going on that would be a concern as far as noise is
- 2 concerned, and I didn't hear anything.
- 3 I left work at lunch time, and I came by
- 4 there at lunch time, and did the same thing, drove
- 5 around, sat around, and waited if I can hear
- 6 something. I can hear sometimes a truck going, but
- 7 nothing that was -- that everybody was explaining as
- 8 the banging noise or anything like that.
- 9 Then we came in at night, at different
- 10 times of the night right after work which will be
- 11 about 6:00, 6:30 or so. I came by there about 9:00
- 12 o'clock. So I did and my wife did all this in an
- 13 attempt to see -- you know, to get a feel of what
- 14 the property is and what we're getting into, that
- 15 kind of stuff, and all these times there was no
- 16 noise that we heard was of a concern. That was --
- 17 that's what we decided maybe this is a good property
- 18 to buy at this time, but we didn't come in at 3:00
- 19 o'clock in the morning or 2:00 o'clock in the
- 20 morning, which I never expected in my entire life
- 21 that would happen and it would be allowed.
- Q. Now, after you moved into the property in
- 23 May of '97, when did you first hear noise from the
- 24 facility?

- 1 A. We moved in I believe it was a Friday or a
- 2 Saturday, maybe it was a Saturday, and the first
- 3 time that I heard the noise was early I guess it
- 4 would be Monday morning about 2:00 o'clock in the
- 5 morning, 2:00, 2:30 in the morning. I can't even
- 6 say I heard it. It woke me up in such a way I had
- 7 to jump and see what was actually going on. I mean,
- 8 it was so loud, like a big explosion was going on,
- 9 and I just jumped and looked around and where is
- 10 this coming from, and then I heard it again and
- 11 opened the window and looked out. Obviously, it was
- 12 coming from the trucking company. That's the first
- 13 time I heard it.
- 14 Q. What -- how often do you hear the noise
- 15 now?
- 16 A. Now, I hear the noise every single day
- 17 with the exception of Sundays, but even that
- 18 exception on Sundays sometimes you can hear it on
- 19 Sundays as well. So it's every single night except
- 20 Sunday.
- Q. I'd like to start at 8:00 o'clock in the
- 22 morning Monday until 8:00 o'clock in the morning the
- 23 next day. Would you please describe the periods of
- 24 time when you would hear noise from the Overland

- 1 facility?
- 2 A. Okay. Normally, I start work at 8:00
- 3 o'clock. So I'm gone at 8:00 o'clock, and by the
- 4 time I come home, normally it's about 7:00, 6:30,
- 5 7:00, something around that time, and normally when
- 6 I come in, open the door, and go through the house,
- 7 you hear the banging at that time.
- 8 Then we'll start having dinner, and all
- 9 throughout dinner, you can all hear all this banging
- 10 and the trucks rolling around, all kinds of noises
- 11 going on. Then they will subside a bit about 9:00
- 12 or so. Then 10:00, 10:30, 11:00, around that time,
- 13 it starts back up again.
- When I first moved in, it used to be
- 15 almost about 2:30, between 2:30 and 3:00 o'clock.
- 16 You'd hear all this banging enough to wake me up.
- 17 First I thought maybe I'll just put earplugs in and
- 18 I'll be okay, but earplugs didn't work. One, they
- 19 will fall off, and second it's very uncomfortable to
- 20 sleep with earplugs in your ears.
- 21 Q. When you said 2:30, is that 2:30 in the
- 22 morning?
- 23 A. 2:30 a.m.
- 24 Then sometimes I used to stay up for quite

- 1 sometime because I can't fall back asleep, and
- 2 sometimes you don't just wake up like an alarm
- 3 waking you up. It's a big noise that almost kind of
- 4 scares the daylight out of me to wake up to, and I
- 5 don't fall asleep right away.
- 6 Then I doze off and it starts back up
- 7 again at 4:00 o'clock, 5:00 o'clock, something
- 8 around that time, and from 6:00 to 7:00, it will be
- 9 quiet. You don't hear anything. Now, it seems like
- 10 it has changed. It's changed in a way that even on
- 11 a Saturday you can hear it at night about 1:00
- 12 o'clock in the morning at night. On a Friday, the
- 13 same story. On a Saturday, I occasionally hear the
- 14 noise. Monday mornings obviously it's a given.
- 15 It got to a point where first I thought
- 16 well, all I need to do is get used to it and that
- 17 will be the end of that. I didn't even -- couldn't
- 18 do that at all. So what I used to do is I'd wake up
- 19 at 3:00 o'clock in the morning, 2:00 o'clock in the
- 20 morning, I'd unplug the alarm clock, go to the other
- 21 room, plug in the alarm, set the alarm, and try to
- 22 go to sleep.
- The bad thing about it is when the noise
- 24 gets pretty bad the echo you can hear on the other

- 1 side. I mean, it's not -- it's something you guys,
- 2 other than the Charter Hall folks, take for
- 3 granted. I mean, you're trying to sleep a night's
- 4 sleep and you can't. You wake up.
- 5 Q. Let's talk about the different types of
- 6 noise that you hear. Would you please describe
- 7 those different types of noises?
- 8 A. Sure. There's all kinds of noises. The
- 9 first one that is pretty loud is you hear a double
- 10 bang. I guess that is probably when the first wheel
- 11 gets into the truck, the tractor trailer, and then
- 12 the second wheel follows. I guess that's what it
- 13 is. It's like bang, bang right back to back.
- 14 Q. Have you physically observed that or is
- 15 that -- you're guessing what's going on?
- 16 A. Well, I haven't physically seen whether
- 17 the tires were actually doing the noise, but you can
- 18 see from a crack next to the trailer loading dock,
- 19 you can see a trailer -- I mean, not a trailer, a
- 20 forklift going in, and then that's when you hear
- 21 this bang, bang, and then when it backs out, the
- 22 same noise again, but you can't really see the whole
- 23 thing and say yeah, that's right, I've seen that
- 24 particularly, but you can deduce that's what's going

- 1 on there. That's the loudest noise. Another noise
- 2 is when the trucks go back into the trailer and
- 3 hitch, and that's when you hear this big banging
- 4 against something. So that is another noise that
- 5 you hear. That's also another big bang. That's
- 6 just one bang you hear, and the other one is -- I've
- 7 looked at it out the windows a number of times at
- 8 different times of the hour, including 3:00 o'clock
- 9 in the morning when you wake up and look out the
- 10 windows and see what's going on.
- 11 They hook into the trailers for some
- 12 reason, and I can't really tell you what the noise
- 13 is or what's causing it, but it's like if you take a
- 14 big heavy load of metal and drag it on the floor. I
- 15 mean, it goes for not just one split bang, it just
- 16 kind of drags on and shakes the whole house without
- 17 any of exaggeration at all. It really shakes the
- 18 whole house, and there's no way you can sleep with
- 19 that. That is another noise that you hear.
- The other noise is, especially I think
- 21 what's -- this is my opinion. When -- especially
- 22 for shift changing time, I guess they're in a rush
- 23 to get the thing done and get out of there, you see
- 24 trucks running everywhere, trailers hooking up, and

- 1 this dragging noise that I told you about, the
- 2 forklifts going crazy. You hear all kinds of truck
- 3 noises, and the yard truck I think is what they call
- 4 is, that also makes a huge noise just running around
- 5 the yard, the property on the Charter Hall side of
- 6 property. I think that would be the west side of
- 7 the property, the west side of Overland's property,
- 8 between Overland and Charter Hall.
- 9 You see all that noise going on. You hear
- 10 music going on, especially when they have all the
- 11 loading dock doors open, people shouting. Those
- 12 kind of noises you hear. Those are the main ones
- 13 that I hear.
- 14 Q. Other than what you've already described,
- 15 does this have -- I'm sorry.
- Other than what you've already described
- 17 as your inability to sleep and your inability to
- 18 have the windows open, does this have any other
- 19 affects on your life?
- 20 A. Yeah, absolutely. I mean, it's really not
- 21 asking a lot to have a night's sleep in your own
- 22 home in your own bed without being disturbed. I
- 23 explained to you earlier I used to wake up and
- 24 change rooms in the middle of the night. I gave

- 1 that up. I bought another alarm clock. So I will
- 2 decide if I have an important meeting coming up the
- 3 next day, I will not go and sleep in my own bed. I
- 4 will sleep in the other room.
- 5 Now, keep in mind, even then though I was
- 6 telling you about the echo effect that has -- that
- 7 is going on on the other side sometimes wakes me up,
- 8 but I can pretty much be okay for that.
- 9 During the day, I was sick one time, and I
- 10 came home to rest and sleep and had a headache
- 11 actually, basically, that's what it was, and I think
- 12 it was at 3:00 o'clock or something around that time
- 13 I tried to sleep, and that woke me up. I mean, you
- 14 have a headache and on top of that you can't sleep
- 15 in your own home.
- My wife had the same problem when she was
- 17 sick and during the day she was disturbed and she
- 18 couldn't sleep. Another thing that happened is,
- 19 like everybody explained, we sit down and have
- 20 family over, family over mostly, and you start
- 21 talking and you hear this noise going on, and
- 22 everybody like stopped what they're talking about
- 23 and just kind of look what's going on. I said oh,
- 24 it's the trucks again. Oh, yeah, it's the trucks

- 1 again.
- 2 You can't go outside and play. We had the
- 3 kids over with my brothers and they were out playing
- 4 one day, and they heard this noise, and they were
- 5 scared like crazy. They didn't know what was going
- 6 on. So they came running into the house. They
- 7 didn't want to go back outside, and if people want
- 8 to come and visit it became a consideration, and
- 9 basically in our family we joke about it now, but
- 10 they say if you're going to go to his house, you
- 11 better make sure that you're going to sleep during
- 12 the day because you can't sleep at night, you know,
- 13 that kind of thing.
- 14 Things that you think are very simple that
- 15 were really affects you a whole lot. Those are the
- 16 things that affected me and also driving from work,
- 17 especially if I haven't had enough sleep, you know,
- 18 think about it, if you yourself go home and wake up
- 19 in the middle of the night for whatever reason and
- 20 you didn't sleep, when you wake up in the morning,
- 21 you know how that feeling is, and I find myself
- 22 dozing off driving back to -- driving back home from
- 23 work. That was a big concern of mine. I thought
- 24 maybe I might get into a car accident or something

- 1 one day. Those are the things that affect me.
- Q. Does the noise wake your wife up?
- 3 A. Occasionally it wakes her up, but she is a
- 4 very heavy sleeper. For her to wake up, I mean,
- 5 she -- it takes a whole lot to wake her up, but when
- 6 we first started -- when we first moved there, it
- 7 was not that bad for her, but she would hear it, and
- 8 she will fall asleep right away, but now she's told
- 9 me that it has gotten worse every single time and
- 10 even became an issue with her. You know, she wakes
- 11 up at night, not as much as I do.
- 12 Q. When was the last time you were bothered
- 13 by noise from the Overland facility?
- 14 A. Last night. Last night it was all night.
- 15 Another thing that I failed to mention to you
- 16 earlier, but you reminded me when you asked me that
- 17 question, is last night I was sitting down and
- 18 watching TV and I had to turn the volume on, I mean,
- 19 high, high to be able to hear it because there was
- 20 all kinds of noise going on in the trucking
- 21 company. So that was last night, and the one that I
- 22 heard that woke me up again this morning was about
- 23 4:00 o'clock or so.
- Q. At what time?

- 1 A. 4:00, 4:30 in the morning, and that went
- 2 on for a little while, and I dozed off and had to
- 3 get up anyway. So I got up. So the last time was
- 4 this morning at 4:00.
- 5 Q. And what type of noise was it this
- 6 morning?
- 7 A. The same old banging noise, and, you know,
- 8 trucks moving and banging, the forklifts going to
- 9 the trailer, that kind of stuff.
- 10 MR. SIROS: Nothing further.
- 11 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Steger.
- 12 CROSS EXAMINATION
- by Mr. Steger
- 14 Q. You purchased your unit in May of 1997; is
- 15 that correct?
- 16 A. Yes. Well, we moved in in '97. We closed
- 17 in April.
- 18 Q. Did you -- what did you ask your real
- 19 estate broker, if anything, about the trucking
- 20 terminal next door?
- 21 A. Well, I'm glad you asked that because I
- 22 asked her to find out what the trucking company is.
- 23 Keep in mind, this is our first home. So we didn't
- 24 have a lot of experience with this. So I was

- 1 relying heavily on the real estate agent's
- 2 information, and she called and asked, and the
- 3 information she gave me was it's a very light
- 4 operation trucking company and you don't need to be
- 5 concerned with noise, and my concern was noise at
- 6 that time, and I have called myself and I have asked
- 7 them what their operation was. I was thinking about
- 8 buying this property right behind you. Should I be
- 9 concerned? What are your hours? Can you tell me
- 10 any information at all, and the gentleman that I
- 11 talked to, I didn't ask for a name, like I said, I
- 12 really relied on -- there was no reason why they
- 13 would lie to me, and they basically said they closed
- 14 late in the afternoon -- I mean, late in the
- 15 evening, maybe about 10:00, 11:00 or something like
- 16 that, and they don't start in the morning. So we
- 17 don't need to be concerned about that. I accepted
- 18 what they explained to me, and I let it go like
- 19 that.
- Q. And you independently then visited the
- 21 facility numerous times?
- A. Yes, I did and my wife, together.
- Q. At various times of the day?
- A. At various times of the day.

- 1 Q. This was prior to May of '97?
- 2 A. This was prior to May.
- 3 Q. And what did you experience in those
- 4 visits?
- 5 A. In those visits, like I said, it was early
- 6 in the morning. There was not much of a concern as
- 7 far as noise that I heard. During lunch time that I
- 8 went there, I been spent a few minutes, drove by,
- 9 and didn't hear much.
- The one time I heard trucks going in and
- 11 out, but the trucks going in and out was not really
- 12 a big issue with me. That didn't bother me at all.
- 13 The only thing that I did not do, and for
- 14 the life of me I did not expect or even think about
- 15 doing, is go at 3:00 o'clock in the morning or 4:00
- 16 o'clock in the morning or 2:00 o'clock in the
- 17 morning and see if there was noise at that time, and
- 18 that is the worst noise there is.
- 19 Q. But correct me if I'm wrong, you did visit
- 20 the facility at about 6:00 a.m.?
- 21 A. I did.
- 22 Q. Okay. If it weren't for the Overland
- 23 operations, what time do you get up for work in the
- 24 morning?

- 1 A. About that time, about 6:00 o'clock or so.
- 2 Q. 6:00 a.m.?
- 3 A. 6:00 a.m.
- 4 Q. Do you get up to feed the fish? Strike
- 5 that question.
- 6 And you leave for work when?
- 7 A. I leave for work about 7:00, 7:30.
- 8 Q. And you testified to that when you are
- 9 awakened from sleep in your master bedroom, you go
- 10 to the other bedroom?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. But you still experience some residual
- 13 noise?
- 14 A. There's an echo that you hear. You really
- 15 have to -- to appreciate it, you have to sit down
- 16 and then listen to it. I mean, it's really hard to
- 17 explain to you here what an echo sounds like, I
- 18 mean, from the trucking company.
- 19 Q. Do you have any problems going to sleep?
- A. Yeah. With all that noise, I can't.
- 21 Q. Let me rephrase the question.
- Other than the Overland activities, is
- 23 there anything that you have a problem going to
- 24 sleep with --

- 1 A. No.
- Q. -- either now or in the past?
- 3 A. No.
- 4 Q. Any health problems?
- 5 A. Not -- zero. Actually, I went to New
- 6 Orleans a couple of weeks ago, and a funny thing my
- 7 wife said to me was great, now you're going to sleep
- 8 all week without being disturbed. I mean, you know,
- 9 it sounds funny, but it really isn't.
- 10 Q. Are there any other sounds that you hear;
- 11 aircraft noise, dogs?
- 12 A. I never heard dogs. Aircraft, yes, planes
- 13 fly by.
- 14 Q. Traffic from Northwest Highway?
- 15 A. I've never heard one.
- 16 Q. The mall?
- 17 A. Zero.
- 18 Q. You didn't take any noise measurements,
- 19 did you?
- 20 A. I did not take any noise measurements. I
- 21 started writing some logs thinking that it might be
- 22 a short-time deal, but when it's every day and every
- 23 time of the hour, what's the point of writing it?
- 24 It's as simple as saying every day.

- 1 MR. STEGER: No further questions.
- 2 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Siros.
- 3 MR. SIROS: Just one.
- 4 REDIRECT EXAMINATION
- 5 by Mr. Siros
- 6 Q. You testified that you had called to
- 7 verify the operations at Overland. Who did you, in
- 8 fact, call?
- 9 A. When I talked -- the person that I talked
- 10 to, I asked if I can speak with the manager, and the
- 11 first response that he had was who is this, and I
- 12 told him I am the resident from next door and wanted
- 13 to get some -- I had some questions that I wanted to
- 14 ask you, but he never really gave me his name.
- 15 At that time, what I asked him was is
- 16 there anything at all that you can do just, you
- 17 know, not to be adversaries of yours or anything
- 18 like that, anything that you can do at all so you
- 19 can help me get some rest. You know, I've got to
- 20 get up and go to work just like you have to work
- 21 now, and his response was what is it really that
- 22 bothers you? I told -- I mean, this tremendous
- 23 banging noise is going on, and I don't understand
- 24 what that is.

- 1 He said they do load quite a bit of heavy
- 2 loads, you know, tons of forklift loads, and that's
- 3 what makes the noise and there's nothing they can do
- 4 about that. I've talked with the city. I called
- 5 them and asked them if there was anything -- any
- 6 noise ordinance that there is that they can enforce
- 7 to help us with this situation because, quite
- 8 frankly, I never expected that a city like Palatine
- 9 would allow this to go on, and their response was
- 10 the Pollution Control Board is looking into this
- 11 matter, which was not the case anyway, and at this
- 12 point, there's nothing they can do. The best thing
- 13 I should do is talk with the association because
- 14 they think the association is doing something about
- 15 it.
- 16 Q. I'd like to bring you back to the first
- 17 question I asked you. When you called, who did you
- 18 call?
- 19 A. Where?
- 20 Q. You indicated that you called Overland.
- 21 Was that -- you made a telephone call to the
- 22 Overland facility; is that correct?
- A. Yes, that is to the Overland facility
- 24 right next to us. I looked it up in the phone book,

- 1 and this was 3:00 o'clock in the morning. I asked
- 2 the guy -- the person who answered the phone I would
- 3 like to talk with the manager, and the person then
- 4 came on and really didn't give me the name. I
- 5 didn't really care for the name anyway.
- 6 By the way, that's something similar that
- 7 you hear, seriously. That is one of the noises that
- 8 you hear at 3:00 o'clock in the morning, 2:00
- 9 o'clock in the morning.
- 10 THE HEARING OFFICER: Let the record reflect
- 11 there was a noise. However, I don't want to deal
- 12 with what the noise was.
- 13 MR. SIROS: No further questions.
- 14 MR. FORCADE: Just one question.
- 15 REDIRECT EXAMINATION
- by Mr. Forcade
- 17 Q. Prior to purchasing the home, did you at
- 18 any point contact Overland Transportation and ask
- 19 them about theirs hours of operation or anything?
- 20 A. Yes, I did. That's what I was telling
- 21 you.
- 22 Q. And prior to purchasing the home and you
- 23 contacted them, could you repeat, again, what they
- 24 said?

- 1 A. Basically, what they told me was their
- 2 operation, they stop in the evenings around 10:00 or
- 3 so and they don't start up until the morning so I
- 4 don't need to be concerned about noise.
- 5 Q. Thank you.
- 6 A. That's what they said to me.
- 7 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Steger.
- 8 MR. STEGER: No further questions.
- 9 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you, Mr. Senbetta.
- 10 THE WITNESS: Thank you.
- 11 THE HEARING OFFICER: Let's go off the record.
- 12 (Break taken.)
- 13 THE HEARING OFFICER: We are back on the record
- 14 at 98-81, Pollution Control Board docket number,
- 15 Charter Hall Homeowner's Association and -- well,
- 16 I've got varying degrees, but we'll just go with
- 17 Charter Hall Homeowner's Association vs. Overland
- 18 Transportation System and D.P. Cartage, Inc. The
- 19 heading speaks for itself.
- 20 Mr. Siros, your next witness.
- 21 MR. SIROS: I'd like to call Kathy Hayden,
- 22 please.
- 23 THE HEARING OFFICER: Ms. Hayden, would you
- 24 please raise your right hand and be sworn in?

- 1 (Witness sworn.)
- 2 THE HEARING OFFICER: Ms. Hayden, would you
- 3 please state your name and spell your first name and
- 4 last name for the record since Kathy can be spelled
- 5 with a C and a K?
- 6 THE WITNESS: My name is Kathryn Hayden. It's
- 7 K-a-t-h-r-y-n. My last name is Hayden, H-a-y-d-e-n.
- 8 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.
- 9 Mr. Siros.
- 10 KATHRYN HAYDEN,
- 11 called as a witness herein, having been first duly
- 12 sworn, deposeth and saith as follows:
- 13 DIRECT EXAMINATION
- by Mr. Siros
- 15 Q. Would you please state your address?
- 16 A. 639 Charter Hall Drive.
- 17 Q. Well, it looks like the shape is a blue
- 18 triangle. So I would request that you go to the --
- 19 what's been marked as Complainants' Exhibit No. 1
- 20 and put a blue triangle as to where your address is
- 21 located on that chart?
- A. (Witness complied.)
- 23 MR. SIROS: Let the record reflect that Mrs.
- 24 Hayden has placed a blue triangle on Complainants'

- 1 Exhibit No. 1 at 639.
- 2 THE HEARING OFFICER: The record will so
- 3 reflect.
- 4 BY MR. SIROS:
- 5 Q. Do you live at 639 Charter Hall Drive
- 6 alone?
- 7 A. No. I live with my husband.
- 8 Q. What's his name?
- 9 A. Gregory Hayden.
- 10 Q. And do you own or rent?
- 11 A. We own.
- 12 Q. When did you move in?
- 13 A. We moved in in December of 1992.
- 14 Q. And what's your occupation?
- 15 A. I'm a systems manager.
- 16 Q. Are you taking time out from your work to
- 17 testify here today?
- 18 A. Yes, I am.
- 19 Q. Would you please describe the layout of
- 20 your house?
- A. It's a two-story townhouse. On the lower
- 22 level is the garage. There's a living room, a
- 23 dining room -- a dining area, kitchen, and family
- 24 room, and a half bath. In the upper level, there's

- 1 two bedrooms and a loft.
- Q. If I was on your first floor -- I'm
- 3 sorry. Let me rephrase that.
- 4 Please describe what rooms are on the
- 5 first floor east side of your house?
- 6 A. Our living area is back there, the family
- 7 room and the kitchen.
- 8 Q. And if I was looking out through your
- 9 living room east, what would I see?
- 10 A. The fence. You'd see a fence, the patio,
- 11 and then a white fence.
- 12 Q. About how far from the living room is
- 13 it -- I'm sorry. Let me rephrase that.
- 14 How far is it from the edge of your house
- 15 to the fence?
- 16 A. I would say 35 feet maybe.
- 17 Q. What rooms would be on the east side of
- 18 your house on the second floor?
- 19 A. Both bedrooms.
- 20 Q. If I was looking out of either bedroom to
- 21 the east, what would I see?
- 22 A. You would see the far south end of the
- 23 truck yard, the trees, the fence -- top of the
- 24 trees, the fence, and the far south end of the truck

- 1 yard, and then the marsh starts right there.
- Q. When you moved in December of 1992, were
- 3 you aware that there was a trucking operation
- 4 located next door to your house?
- 5 A. Yes, we were.
- 6 Q. Were you aware that it was a 24-hour
- 7 trucking operation?
- 8 A. No.
- 9 Q. Were you aware that the developer, Pulte
- 10 Homes, had filed a notice that there was a 24-hour
- 11 trucking operation next door to your property?
- 12 A. We found that out at closing.
- 13 Q. So after you closed on the house, you were
- 14 aware that there was that 24-hour trucking
- 15 operation?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. Was this new construction?
- 18 A. It was new construction, and it was noisy
- 19 when we were there. There were windows and there
- 20 were lots of -- there was a lot of equipment
- 21 around. It was really hard to assess at that time.
- 22 Q. What kind of equipment was that?
- A. There were trucks and there were
- 24 construction vehicles. It was in the winter so

- 1 there wasn't anything like road graders or anything
- 2 else, but there was a lot of traffic on the street.
- 3 There was a lot of construction noise and things
- 4 that are just associated with new construction.
- 5 Q. This was activity associated with
- 6 construction of your home, not activities associated
- 7 with the Overland facility?
- 8 A. Correct.
- 9 Q. Actually, let me rephrase that.
- This was activity associated with the
- 11 construction of your home, not activity associated
- 12 with the facility?
- 13 A. Correct.
- 14 Q. Did you do anything before you moved in to
- 15 determine whether or not the trucking operation
- 16 would cause bothersome noise?
- 17 A. We moved from out of state. So we weren't
- 18 able to spend a lot of time there. However, I would
- 19 say while the house was in various stages of
- 20 construction, we probably spent a total of four
- 21 hours there. It would have been mostly during -- it
- 22 would have been always during the day.
- Q. Did you notice noises coming from the
- 24 facility when you were there those four hours --

- 1 A. I don't recall.
- Q. -- four times?
- 3 A. I don't recall.
- 4 Q. After you moved in in December of 1992,
- 5 when did you first notice noise from the facility?
- 6 A. I would say immediately, almost
- 7 immediately.
- 8 Q. What type of noise did you notice?
- 9 A. I noticed trucks driving. You know, it
- 10 was just you could hear trucks maneuvering in the
- 11 truck yard. I would notice it, perhaps, once or
- 12 twice a week, and it would not wake me in the night.
- 13 MR. STEGER: It would not what? I didn't hear
- 14 you.
- 15 THE WITNESS: Would not wake me during the
- 16 night.
- 17 BY MR. SIROS:
- 18 Q. When you said once or twice a week, what
- 19 time of the day would you generally hear that noise?
- 20 A. I know the latest I had heard it was 11:00
- 21 at night.
- 22 Q. Has the frequency of noise changed over
- 23 time?
- A. Yes, substantially.

- 1 Q. At the present, how many times a week do
- 2 you hear the noise from the facility?
- 3 A. I'd hate to count it. It is -- when I'm
- 4 home, it's almost continual.
- 5 Q. Do you hear it every day?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. How many days a week?
- 8 A. Six to seven.
- 9 Q. I'd like to, again, take you through an
- 10 entire day starting at 8:00 o'clock in the morning
- 11 until 8:00 o'clock in the morning the next day.
- Would you please describe the periods when
- 13 you're normally home and you hear noise from the
- 14 facility?
- 15 A. I'm at work usually by 8:00 o'clock in the
- 16 morning, and I, like everyone else, gets home
- 17 somewhere between 5:30 and 7:30. I can tell you
- 18 that we religiously watch Seinfeld reruns at 6:30
- 19 when I'm home, and it's very loud at that time. It
- 20 does interrupt that.
- Q. What time do you leave for work in the
- 22 morning?
- A. I leave for work generally about 6:30 or
- 24 quarter to 7:00.

- 1 Q. Do you hear the noise when you leave for
- 2 work in the morning?
- 3 A. Yes, I do.
- 4 Q. And when you get home and are watching
- 5 Seinfeld at 6:30?
- 6 A. Yeah, hear noise. I generally go to bed
- 7 between 9:30 and 11:00, and I do hear it up until I
- 8 go to sleep. Now, my husband is impacted more by
- 9 that time of the day because he has trouble getting
- 10 to sleep.
- 11 Q. Have you made special plans for the final
- 12 Seinfeld episode?
- 13 A. Well --
- 14 THE HEARING OFFICER: Strike that.
- 15 BY THE WITNESS:
- 16 A. -- I'm kind of depressed.
- 17 THE HEARING OFFICER: Strike that, please.
- 18 MR. STEGER: Argumentative.
- 19 BY THE WITNESS:
- A. It does, what was I saying, impact my
- 21 husband.
- 22 BY MR. SIROS:
- Q. What time do you usually try to go to
- 24 sleep?

- 1 A. I generally try to go to sleep between
- 2 9:30 and 11:00. Where he would try to get to sleep
- 3 by 10:00 and seldom gets to sleep before 12:30 or
- 4 1:00.
- 5 Q. When you go to sleep at night, do you
- 6 normally hear the noise?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. When next do you normally hear the noise?
- 9 A. Generally, I'm able to get to sleep,
- 10 whereas my husband isn't, but I wake up at quarter
- 11 to 6:00 in the morning, and I often wake up before
- 12 my alarm -- quarter to 5:00, 4:45, pardon me, and I
- 13 will lay awake waiting for the alarm to ring, and I
- 14 hear banging every day, every day.
- 15 Q. So let me go back a moment. So you're
- 16 normally awoken at 4:45 every morning?
- 17 A. By an alarm.
- 18 Q. By an alarm.
- 19 A. However, I wake up before the alarm most
- 20 of the time, and while I'm laying in bed, I hear it
- 21 banging.
- Q. So your alarm is set for 4:45 in the
- 23 morning?
- 24 A. Yes.

- 1 Q. What time are you normally woken up?
- 2 A. I would say 4:15, 4:20.
- 3 Q. Do you hear noise before you wake up
- 4 usually at 4:15 in the morning?
- 5 A. Well, I think something wakes me up. I
- 6 can't say it's that, but I know that I wake up
- 7 before my alarm every day.
- 8 Q. Okay. Can you describe -- I'm sorry. Let
- 9 me rephrase that.
- Does the noise wake your husband up as
- 11 well?
- 12 A. It doesn't wake him. He just simply can't
- 13 get to sleep at night.
- 14 Q. Would you please describe the different
- 15 types of noise that you hear from the facility?
- 16 A. Well, I hear banging noises, and unlike my
- 17 neighbors, I haven't been to the facility. So I
- 18 can't describe what's causing the banging noise, and
- 19 also from our perspective we don't have a real
- 20 direct shot of the truck terminal itself, but I hear
- 21 two very distinct, very harsh bangs and it's
- 22 associated with after a trailer has backed to the
- 23 dock, which I can see, but I don't know what happens
- 24 then. It's almost kind of a -- it's sort of a

1 thunking noise, and it's just a very harsh, very

- 2 startling noise.
- 3 Q. So you associated that with the loading
- 4 and unloading operations?
- 5 A. Yes, I think I'm right.
- 6 Q. Is there any other type of noise that you
- 7 associate with the facility?
- 8 A. Yes, I do. We hear the trucks maneuvering
- 9 in the west side of the Overland compound on the
- 10 west side of the base. The trucks pull in. It
- 11 seems that they drop the trailers, and then they
- 12 reposition the trailers and back them up to the
- 13 loading docks.
- So there's a lot of truck and engine noise
- 15 going along. There's squeaking of brakes, horns,
- 16 odor, and the scraping noise that I -- I don't know
- 17 what it is. I thought it was chains or something.
- 18 It's just an awful noise, an atrocious noise.
- 19 Q. Can you describe that scraping noise?
- A. To me, it sounds like metal on concrete.
- 21 It just -- it sounds to me like big heavy chains is
- 22 how I would -- but enough to -- it's just
- 23 startling. It's awful.
- Q. How long does that screeching noise occur?

- 1 A. I would say several seconds at a time. I
- 2 mean, it seems longer just because it is such an
- 3 outrageous noise, but I would say a few seconds,
- 4 four to five seconds.
- 5 Q. Okay. I'd like to take you back to the
- 6 loading and unloading noise you've testified about.
- 7 Can you describe in the ten-minute period how often
- 8 you would hear that?
- 9 A. The scraping, the chain scraping?
- 10 Q. No. I'm sorry. The loading and unloading
- 11 I believe you had testified that was banging.
- 12 A. Yes. You'd hear the banging I would
- 13 say -- and I -- I think the whole process takes a
- 14 few minutes. It takes several minutes in order to
- 15 do whatever it is they do in the back of those
- 16 trucks, and so within a period of a few minutes
- 17 you'll hear bangs, oh, I don't know, maybe four.
- 18 Q. Okay. How does the noise affect your
- 19 daily life?
- 20 A. Well, we cannot use the back -- the
- 21 outdoor back of our house at all. It's just
- 22 impossible to spend any time outside. We cannot
- 23 open the back of our house just because the noise.
- 24 It's just -- we just can't use the back of our house

- 1 or we can't use the patio. We don't grill.
- 2 It's had significant impacts in different
- 3 ways. One of them is, I think may have alluded to
- 4 this, but we -- my family, my husband and my family
- 5 is from out of state, and we cannot entertain them
- 6 for weekends. They simply cannot sleep at our
- 7 house. We do not entertain other than our dear
- 8 friends that live on Charter Hall Drive. We really
- 9 don't have people in because it is embarrassing. I
- 10 mean, how did we end up in a place like this? So I
- 11 don't entertain.
- 12 It impacted me specifically in March of
- 13 this year when, again, once the -- I was up an
- 14 entire night before I had a trip. I had to
- 15 represent my company in Hartford. It was in March
- 16 of '98, and I was -- I did not sleep all night. I
- 17 was out of sorts. I real did a disservice to my
- 18 company by even attending because I wasn't able to
- 19 give this the concentration it really required, the
- 20 task that I needed to do while I was out there. So
- 21 I think everybody suffered because I didn't sleep
- 22 that night.
- Q. And why were you not able to sleep that
- 24 night?

- 1 A. It was -- the whole night it was banging,
- 2 the whole night.
- 3 Q. What time did you have to leave in the
- 4 morning for your trip?
- 5 A. I went by plane. I believe before 7:00
- 6 a.m.
- 7 Q. When time did you try to go to bed?
- 8 A. 10:00.
- 9 Q. How else has this affected your life?
- 10 A. Well, again, my husband is -- cannot get
- 11 to sleep at night, and sometimes he's not all that
- 12 charming to be around and I'm sure it's fatigue.
- 13 Q. So your husband is awoken at night?
- 14 A. Yes, he is, and it impacts him as well in
- 15 that he works for the FAA and needs to be on the
- 16 ball.
- 17 Q. What does your husband do?
- 18 A. He works at Palwaukee Towers. He's a
- 19 control tower manager.
- Q. And how often does this wake him up on a
- 21 weekly basis?
- 22 A. If affects him daily. Every night, he
- 23 cannot get to sleep.
- Q. What time does he normally try to go to
 - L.A. REPORTING (312) 419-9292

- 1 sleep at night?
- A. Well, he'll try between 10:30 and he
- 3 seldom gets to sleep before 12:30.
- 4 Q. When you first moved in in 19 -- in
- 5 December of 1992 and, you know, for the summer of
- 6 1993, had you been able to utilize your backyard?
- 7 A. Yes. Actually, we bought furniture and we
- 8 have a grill, beautiful windows in the back of the
- 9 house, and we can't open them.
- 10 Q. So has the frequency of the noise changed
- 11 since you moved in to present?
- 12 A. It has. It's intensified, the frequency,
- 13 yes.
- 14 Q. Do you have an approximate date as to when
- 15 it started to get worse?
- 16 A. I went over -- it seems that when --
- 17 actually whether Overland came in is when I noticed
- 18 it. That's the best I can do.
- 19 Q. Do you know approximately what date that
- 20 was?
- A. I know it was in October, and I'm thinking
- 22 it was '95 or '96. I'm sorry. I can't recall the
- 23 year, but I do remember it was in the fall.
- Q. Have you been involved in any efforts to
 - L.A. REPORTING (312) 419-9292

- 1 resolve the noise issues that the Charter Hall
- 2 Association has with Overland?
- 3 A. I have been in and I've supported the
- 4 association and what they're doing. I feel very
- 5 well represented by them and they know my complaints
- 6 and share them.
- 7 Q. When was the last time that you were
- 8 bothered by noise from the Overland facility?
- A. This morning.
- 10 Q. And what --
- 11 A. Well, bothered, I heard it. I noticed it
- 12 when I was laying in bed waiting for the alarm to go
- 13 off.
- 14 Q. And what time was that?
- 15 A. About 20 to 5:00.
- 16 Q. And what type of noise was that?
- 17 A. I think it was the -- it was the banging
- 18 noise.
- 19 MR. SIROS: Nothing further.
- 20 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Steger.
- 21 CROSS EXAMINATION
- by Mr. Steger
- 23 Q. You testified to that it's approximately
- 24 35 feet from the back of your house to the fence?

- 1 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. But then you testified that you
- 3 said you don't have a direct shot. Could you --
- 4 I'll go up to the exhibit.
- 5 You're located at 639; is that not
- 6 correct?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Okay. You said you don't have a direct
- 9 shot. What do you mean by that?
- 10 A. What I mean by that, and I'm assuming this
- 11 represents the whole area, the building and the
- 12 drive area, and that being the case, we cannot see
- 13 directly in the back of the building just from the
- 14 location of our house. The building and the loading
- 15 dock stops.
- 16 Q. Is there a fence somewhere to the south
- 17 here and, if so, where would that be located?
- 18 A. The fence is located -- well, actually it
- 19 runs from 699 to 627. The markings -- the perimeter
- 20 of our property.
- 21 O. Correct,?
- A. There's a chain or a wire fence of some
- 23 type that runs adjacent, perpendicular. I'm not
- 24 sure. Anyway, it goes this way (indicating).

- 1 Q. It runs perpendicular to about 627?
- 2 A. Right.
- 3 Q. And it runs the full length?
- 4 A. I can only see around the -- I don't pay
- 5 much attention to it up where the project --
- 6 Q. You think that fence that runs from east
- 7 to west starts at about 627?
- 8 A. I believe so.
- 9 Q. What is to the south of that fence?
- 10 A. A marsh land.
- 11 THE HEARING OFFICER: Before we go on, Mr.
- 12 Steger, so the record is clear, Mr. Steger has been
- 13 pointing to Complainants' Exhibit 1 as has the
- 14 witness. The witness has been referring to the area
- 15 between what appears to be the Overland
- 16 Transportation building and the perimeter fence
- 17 previously identified by Mr. Steger and marked by
- 18 Mr. Steger as a black line from 699 to 627.
- 19 They have referred also to a fence that
- 20 apparently runs east/west from the -- the
- 21 approximation that Ms. Hayden gave was 627, but she
- 22 was not sure whether it went to the entire boundary
- 23 line -- to the entire east boundary line.
- 24 MR. STEGER: The jotted line from 627 and I'll

- 1 finish it off with my witness.
- 2 BY MR. STEGER:
- 3 Q. So you cannot -- your property at 639, if
- 4 you were to look directly east, would you see the
- 5 building or is it north of your lot?
- 6 A. I'd see the end of the building.
- 7 Q. You'd see the end. Okay. So this is not
- 8 a quite accurate representation of the layout?
- 9 A. Well, I think as far as the property is
- 10 concerned and where the driveway is it probably is,
- 11 but the actual building facility isn't the same.
- 12 Q. The actual building facility. Okay.
- 13 THE HEARING OFFICER: Let the record also
- 14 reflect that Mr. Steger has made a dotted -- a
- 15 dashed line, three dashes, from what appears to be
- 16 the southernmost boundary of the 627 unit to about
- 17 the beginning -- to the middle -- to the beginning
- 18 of the Overland Transportation facility. Is that
- 19 accurate, Mr. Steger?
- 20 MR. STEGER: That is correct.
- 21 THE HEARING OFFICER: And, Ms. Hayden; is that
- 22 right.
- 23 THE WITNESS: Yes.
- 24 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.

1 BY MR. STEGER:

- Q. And you testified to that your building
- 3 was new construction?
- 4 A. Yes. We moved in while it was under
- 5 construction our bought it while it was under
- 6 construction.
- 7 Q. And your unit is one of the middle units
- 8 of your block --
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. -- if you will?
- Do you know how many units are in your
- 12 block? Well, let me ask it differently.
- 13 Is 647, 643, 639, 635, 631, and 627 in
- 14 your one freestanding building?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. Okay. So you share common-laws with 643
- 17 and 635?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Do you know if yours was one of the last
- 20 units to sell or not?
- A. No, actually, it wasn't.
- 22 Q. And you testified that if it wasn't for
- 23 the Overland activities you set your alarm clock for
- 24 4:45?

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. But that you're awakened sometime before
- 3 then?
- 4 A. I wake up before my alarm goes off.
- 5 Q. Did you take any independent
- 6 measurements --
- 7 A. No, I didn't.
- 8 Q. -- noise measurements?
- 9 And then you testified to that you leave
- 10 for work at anywhere between 6:30 and 6:45 in the
- 11 morning?
- 12 A. 6:30 and 7:00.
- 13 Q. And you return at least in sufficient time
- 14 to watch Seinfeld?
- 15 A. Most days.
- 16 Q. Aside from the Overland activities, is
- 17 there any other noise, sounds that you hear? Do you
- 18 hear the traffic from Northwest Highway?
- 19 A. I don't hear traffic from Northwest
- 20 Highway. I hear occasionally airplanes overhead.
- 21 Really that's -- I don't hear much else.
- Q. Birds?
- A. We don't have many birds.
- Q. Any dogs barking?

- 1 A. No, there's no dog.
- Q. Other than the Overland activities, is
- 3 there anything else that disturbs your sleep? Do
- 4 you get up at night?
- 5 A. For biological reasons.
- 6 Q. To go to the bathroom. Okay. That's
- 7 legitimate.
- 8 No health problems though?
- 9 A. No.
- 10 MR. STEGER: That's all I have.
- 11 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Siros.
- 12 MR. SIROS: Nothing further.
- 13 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you, Ms. Hayden.
- Let's take a five-minute break.
- 15 (Break taken.)
- 16 THE HEARING OFFICER: After a five-minute
- 17 recess, we are back in Pollution Control Board
- 18 98-81, Charter Hall Homeowner's Association vs.
- 19 Overland Transportation.
- 20 Mr. Siros, your next witness.
- 21 MR. SIROS: I call Judy Lexby, please.
- 22 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. Ms. Lexby, would
- 23 you please raise your right hand and be sworn?
- 24 (Witness sworn.)

- 1 THE HEARING OFFICER: Ms. Lexby, would you
- 2 please state your name and spell your last name for
- 3 the record?
- 4 THE WITNESS: My name is Judith M. Lexby,
- 5 L-e-x, b, as in boy, y.
- 6 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.
- 7 JUDITH LEXBY,
- 8 called as a witness herein, having been first duly
- 9 sworn, deposeth and saith as follows:
- 10 DIRECT EXAMINATION
- 11 by Mr. Siros
- 12 Q. Where do you reside?
- 13 A. 691 North Charter Hall Drive.
- 14 Q. Okay. I would ask that you approach
- 15 what's been marked as Complainants' Exhibit 1, and I
- 16 would ask that you put a black X on the spot where
- 17 your address is?
- 18 A. (Witness complied.)
- 19 MR. SIROS: Let the record reflect that
- 20 Ms. Lexby has placed a black X at 691 on
- 21 Complainants' Exhibit 1.
- 22 THE HEARING OFFICER: The record will so
- 23 reflect.

1 BY MR. SIROS:

- 2 Q. Do you reside there alone?
- 3 A. Yes, I do.
- 4 Q. When did you move in?
- 5 A. In June of 1995.
- 6 Q. And do you own or rent?
- 7 A. I own.
- 8 Q. What's your occupation?
- 9 A. I'm a finance and marketing manager.
- 10 Q. And are you taking time out from your job
- 11 to testify here?
- 12 A. Yes, I am.
- 13 Q. Would you please describe the layout of
- 14 your house?
- 15 A. My first floor entering from the street
- 16 you walk into a living room, dining room
- 17 combination. Moving forward to the back of the
- 18 house, there's the kitchen and a family room.
- 19 Upstairs I have three bedrooms as well as two baths,
- 20 and there's also a half bath on the bottom floor.
- Q. When you said moving to the back of the
- 22 house, is that the east side?
- 23 A. Correct.
- 24 Q. And if I was looking out your first floor

- 1 family room, what would I see looking east?
- 2 A. You would see a fence and trees.
- 3 Q. If I was upstairs in your east bedroom
- 4 looking east, which way would -- excuse me. Let me
- 5 rephrase that.
- 6 If I was upstairs looking east from your
- 7 bedroom window, what would I see?
- 8 A. You'd see the fence, the trees, and then
- 9 over the trees you'd see the end of their building,
- 10 Overland's building, and I also see the truck yard.
- 11 The truck yard is right behind me on the north side,
- 12 and then I have the back end of the building.
- 13 Q. Okay. Would you describe -- would you
- 14 explain what you mean by the truck yard?
- 15 A. Overland has -- they park cars there as
- 16 well as truck trailers are parked there.
- 17 Q. I'd ask you to approach what's been marked
- 18 as Complainants' Exhibit No. 1, and if you could
- 19 just put the letters TY in black marker at the
- 20 approximate spot where the truck yard is located?
- 21 A. There's trucks that are parked -- TY.
- 22 I'll do it both ways.
- 23 MR. SIROS: Let the record reflect that
- 24 Ms. Lexby has marked two TYs in the upper left hand

- 1 portion of the area that's indicated to be the
- 2 Overland Transportation site.
- 3 THE HEARING OFFICER: The record will so
- 4 reflect.
- 5 BY MR. SIROS:
- 6 Q. Generally speaking, how many trucks do
- 7 you -- I'm sorry. Let me rephrase that.
- 8 How many trucks do you generally see
- 9 parked in the truck yard when you look out your
- 10 bedroom window?
- 11 A. It varies greatly as to whether or not
- 12 it's in the Christmas season where there's a lot
- 13 parked. There's usually at least anywhere between
- 14 three and five, and it can go upwards of ten.
- 15 Q. And the ten would be during the Christmas
- 16 season?
- 17 A. Uh-huh.
- 18 Q. How far is the back of your house to the
- 19 fence line?
- A. It's between 30 and 35 feet.
- Q. When you moved in in June of 1995, were
- 22 you aware that there was a trucking facility located
- 23 directly east of your property?
- A. I was aware there was a trucking

- 1 facility. However, it was vacant. Upon my seeing
- 2 that from going back several times to visit the
- 3 home, I asked the present owners, and they indicated
- 4 that Yellow Freight had moved out, and it was
- 5 vacant.
- 6 They also then told me that when Yellow
- 7 was there, because I asked, the noise was very minor
- 8 and that they -- it did not cause them any problems
- 9 or waken them or anything like that.
- Just taking that a little bit further, I
- 11 wanted to my own investigation. So we called the
- 12 village of are -- the village, not of Arlington
- 13 Heights where I previously lived, but the Village of
- 14 Palatine and asked them if they were aware if
- 15 anybody was looking at the site, how it was zoned,
- 16 and if it was going to be changed.
- 17 Their comments to us where the fact that
- 18 they did not have anybody interested in the site at
- 19 the time and they actually had been thinking about
- 20 or had been proposed to change that to
- 21 noncommercial.
- Q. What else, if anything, did you do to
- 23 determine whether or not there would be a trucking
- 24 operation, an active trucking operation, in

- 1 existence next to your property?
- A. Well, we just -- I came back and visited
- 3 with several independent parties several times, and
- 4 we talked to the existing homeowners, we called the
- 5 village, and my realtor did some research. I feel
- 6 that I did all I could.
- 7 Q. Do you remember the names of the
- 8 homeowners you spoke with?
- 9 A. They were the previous owners. I don't
- 10 recall their names up front.
- 11 Q. After you moved in in June of '95, when
- 12 did you first notice noise from the facility?
- 13 A. Starting in the fall of 1995, and I was
- 14 hopeful, quite honestly, at that point in time that
- 15 it was just because it was like a temporary renting
- 16 or something of that nature because, again, having
- 17 done all the investigation, we were informed at that
- 18 time that there was -- that they were not planning
- 19 to reopen as a trucking facility.
- Q. What types of noise did you start to hear
- 21 in the fall of 1995?
- 22 A. Trucks idling, very loud banging, scraping
- 23 noises.
- Q. How often would you hear the noise in the
 - L.A. REPORTING (312) 419-9292

- 1 fall of 1995 per week?
- A. In the fall of 1995, it was very loud, and
- 3 then it died down a little bit, but since probably
- 4 the summer of '96, it's gotten, you know,
- 5 excessively worse and worse and worse.
- 6 Q. Presently, how many times do you hear the
- 7 noise per week?
- 8 A. Every day except when they grace us by
- 9 taking Saturday night off.
- 10 Q. And in terms of a typical day running from
- 11 8:00 in the morning until 8:00 in the morning the
- 12 next day, could you tell me the times when you hear
- 13 the noise from the Overland facility?
- 14 A. Sure. I'll actually give you two
- 15 different scenarios because I have the wonderful
- 16 flexibility of being able to work from home
- 17 sometimes. So I am actually home several days a
- 18 week during the day too.
- 19 When I do go into my office, I get up
- 20 anywhere between 6:00 and 7:00, and the noise is
- 21 there, very loud. Then I'll usually leave by
- 22 between 8:00 and 9:00. So I don't know what happens
- 23 on those days when I'm not home.
- I usually come home anywhere between 5:00

- 1 and 7:00 and the noise is going again up until I try
- 2 and go to bed, which is again -- I have a very weird
- 3 schedule, but anywhere between 10:00 and 12:00.
- 4 On numerous occasions, I have not been
- 5 able to get to sleep and have had to go to other
- 6 means, which I'll cover next. So that's my one
- 7 typical day.
- 8 The second typical day when I am home I
- 9 can reflect even just back to last Wednesday and the
- 10 noise was constant. It was as if they were
- 11 hammering away at something so hard during the day,
- 12 and this is at 10:00 o'clock Chicago time because I
- 13 had a conference call going on, and I had to turn up
- 14 the volume on my speaker phone almost all the way so
- 15 that I could hear and had to put it on mute so that
- 16 people all the way in California couldn't hear the
- 17 trucking firm. That's how loud it was. Because if
- 18 I didn't put it on mute, the sounds from the firm,
- 19 the trucking firm, interrupted the transmission of
- 20 the phone call.
- Q. Let's say from 12:00 o'clock midnight
- 22 until 8:00 o'clock in the morning, what period of
- 23 time do you hear the noise?
- A. It usually starts up around 4:00,

- 1 between -- you know, if they're quiet -- sometimes
- 2 to me it sounds like they're trying to rush to get
- 3 it all done before 10:00 or 11:00 o'clock at night,
- 4 which, you know, I can appreciate and give us a
- 5 little bit of a break, but then it usually starts up
- 6 anywhere between 4:00 and 5:00.
- 7 Q. Now, what types of noise do you hear?
- 8 A. I hear successions of banging. There will
- 9 be like a bang, bang and then a pause and another
- 10 big bang, and I'll hear that. I'll hear clanking
- 11 almost as if metal is dropping on a concrete floor
- 12 or on something. I'll hear the trucks idling,
- 13 racing. There is a forklift vehicle or whatever,
- 14 and I've looked out over the fence and seen it
- 15 driving through the parking lot like at full steam.
- 16 Q. I'd like to take you back to the banging
- 17 noise that you testified about. Have you ever seen
- 18 any physical activity occurring on the Overland site
- 19 that you can attribute to that banging noise?
- 20 A. Yes, and I can also explain what
- 21 Mr. DePietro at our meeting told us what's
- 22 responsible for that noise.
- Q. Let's address the first part, and then
- 24 I'll get to the meeting.

- 1 A. Okay. What I see is the trailers of the
- 2 trucks being backed up into my side. There's actual
- 3 loading docks on both sides of the building, and for
- 4 the life of us, we cannot figure out why they don't
- 5 just help us out and move to the other side,
- 6 especially at night, but when they back the trailers
- 7 up to the west side of the building, you hear a
- 8 noise immediately upon it, you know, coming up
- 9 against the whole, whatever, the loading dock or
- 10 whatever it is. So that's the first noise I've
- 11 heard.
- 12 After that, I can't see, obviously,
- 13 because the trailer is up there, but I've seen the
- 14 forklift, and it sounds like it's, you know, a
- 15 forklift hitching and dropping boxes or whatever it
- 16 is into the trailers.
- 17 Q. You described a meeting. What meeting are
- 18 you referring to?
- 19 A. I'm referring to a meeting in 1996, May of
- 20 1996, where I'm part of the -- was part of the
- 21 Overland -- not Overland, the Charter Hall
- 22 Subdivision Homeowner's Association Noise Committee,
- 23 and we have been trying on numerous occasions to get
- 24 somebody from Overland to come and talk to us, part

- 1 of the good neighbor policy that supposedly they
- 2 had, to kind of talk with us about what our
- 3 complaints were, how they felt that they could
- 4 assist us and relieve some of the situations, for us
- 5 to get a better understanding, et cetera.
- 6 The initial meeting was scheduled for
- 7 March of 1996, which at the last minute was
- 8 cancelled. It was rescheduled to May.
- 9 At that meeting, Mr. DePietro from I think
- 10 it was D.P. Cartage, who is part of Overland, was
- 11 there. There were several homeowners there, and
- 12 this was held at the village hall in Palatine.
- We had an opportunity at that point to
- 14 express face to face with representatives of
- 15 Overland what our concerns were, how it was
- 16 affecting our physical, emotional, and quality of
- 17 life, and they listened and seemed to understand
- 18 what we were saying, offered to go away and to do --
- 19 look into the situation themselves, and then they
- 20 were to respond back to us with what they could do
- 21 to help alleviate some of the noise.
- 22 At that meeting, and I do remember this
- 23 because I took notes, Mr. DePietro indicated that he
- 24 felt that the bang, bang noise after talking to his

- 1 operations people was where the trailers were being
- 2 hitched onto the loading dock, and that was the
- 3 bang, bang, and then the forklift was taking boxes
- 4 and putting it in and then that was the final big
- 5 bang. So that's what goes along with the sounds
- 6 from his own perspective.
- 7 Q. You had described a noise committee. What
- 8 is that?
- 9 A. The noise committee was developed by
- 10 various concerned owners, members of Charter Hall,
- 11 headed up by Jeff Cohen. Denny Bergau, who you
- 12 probably have already heard from, was the chairman
- 13 of the committee, and we started meeting probably I
- 14 want to say in the fall right after I had moved in
- 15 of 1995 through the summer of 1996. We had meetings
- 16 every other week in which we were trying to
- 17 understand, you know, what were our issues, make
- 18 sure that -- you know, find out were we being
- 19 unreasonable. We had talked to the village people,
- 20 the village management, we had talked to the police,
- 21 and from what we even heard at that point, the
- 22 police had indicated that they understood the noise
- 23 was loud. They indicated to us that it was
- 24 supposedly in violation of their code, but it was

1 such an old law they couldn't do anything about it.

- 2 At that meeting, then we decided to go
- 3 ahead and try and do something ourselves and
- 4 approach Overland, D.P. Cartage, whatever name they
- 5 were going under. Calls were made by
- 6 representatives of the committee to try and schedule
- 7 a meeting.
- 8 At the same time, we went off and did a
- 9 letter campaign where we, the whole Charter Hall
- 10 subdivision, we went door to door and, you know,
- 11 asked people were they disturbed by the noise or
- 12 were they not. Letters were then sent by almost
- 13 every member of Charter Hall subdivision to village
- 14 representatives, to our state representatives
- 15 indicating that we have a serious problem here, and
- 16 this was affecting our quality of life, and we were
- 17 asking in a plea for assistance in helping rectify
- 18 the situation because of the fact that we were not
- 19 seeing any results.
- Q. When were these letters sent?
- 21 A. In 1996, the summer of 1996.
- 22 Q. All right. How does the noise affect your
- 23 everyday life?
- 24 A. The noise affects my life from various

- 1 aspects. The first part is physical. It's very --
- 2 I have a very demanding job, and if I can't sleep,
- 3 that affects my demeanor. It affects my
- 4 concentration. It affects how I feel in interacting
- 5 with people worldwide. I have a worldwide
- 6 position. So I'm talking to people in all different
- 7 time zones, and it's -- if I'm not feeling up to par
- 8 to go and do my job, there's a problem, and
- 9 physically it's affected me from fatigue.
- 10 Emotionally it's been a lack of concentration. The
- 11 quality of life, I can't -- I have entertained, and
- 12 I can give you some specific time frames.
- In January of 1997, I had two instances --
- 14 (Brief interruption.)
- 15 THE HEARING OFFICER: We can proceed. You know
- 16 what, let's just wait.
- 17 (Brief pause.)
- 18 THE HEARING OFFICER: We went off the record to
- 19 accommodate a next door neighbor. We will begin
- 20 again. I don't know if you had a chance to finish
- 21 your last answer, Ms. Lexby.
- 22 THE WITNESS: No, but I know what I want to
- 23 say.
- 24 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay.

- 1 THE WITNESS: He was asking how it affected my
- 2 life, and I was going into the part of quality of
- 3 life.
- 4 THE HEARING OFFICER: That's fine.
- 5 BY THE WITNESS:
- 6 A. In January of 1997, I had occasion to have
- 7 two gatherings of people at my home of 20 people,
- 8 two different Fridays, and this is winter. The
- 9 windows are closed, and I had people sitting in my
- 10 family room jumping at the sounds that were going on
- 11 and like oh, my gosh, what was that, and it's very
- 12 embarrassing to have to say well, I live with that.
- 13 You know, this is what I'm talking about in terms of
- 14 the trucking facility, and it went on just not at
- 15 6:00, which is when the party started, 6:00 and
- 16 6:30. This went on all the way until 11:00 o'clock
- 17 at night, and it was, you know, various home shows
- 18 that were going on. So it's not like we could turn
- 19 up the stereo. We needed to hear what the presenter
- 20 was saying.
- In January of 1998 and in March of 1998, I
- 22 had overnight company at my house meaning by
- 23 five-year-old niece, my sisters, and my mother, and
- 24 they were awoken by the banging. So, again, it's

- 1 not that it's just me. You know, I know that it's
- 2 not just me just not being able to get back to
- 3 sleep. Try to get a five-year-old back to sleep in
- 4 the middle of the night. You know, I don't have
- 5 children, but, you know, I have to be careful of
- 6 when I have people over, and I basically, like my
- 7 neighbors, have to really -- it's a potshot because
- 8 you don't know when it's going to start.
- 9 Let's see. Then the biggest, you know,
- 10 the thing that really irritated me was I thought it
- 11 was quiet during the day until I started working
- 12 from home more. In the past nine months, I started
- 13 working from home more about two days a week, three
- 14 days a week, and, again, I just want to reiterate,
- 15 last Wednesday when I'm on a conference call at
- 16 10:00 in the morning to have to turn my speaker
- 17 phone up so loud and put it on mute so that people
- 18 across the country cannot hear the banging, again,
- 19 it's just like -- you shouldn't have to live that
- 20 way.
- 21 I would like to just continue on one
- 22 thing. You had asked me also as it relates to my
- 23 quality of life and how it affects me.
- 24 Because of the fact that I've had

- 1 difficulty sleeping and getting to sleep, I'm
- 2 exhausted when I finally do get to sleep. I had to
- 3 go out and see a doctor. He's given me sleeping
- 4 pills, which I try, but can't take because the next
- 5 morning then I can't wake up. So I can't take
- 6 them.
- 7 So then I tried the sound machine, and
- 8 even with the sound machine on loud volume, I still
- 9 hear the banging in the back, and there has been
- 10 twice when I've actually had to put the pillow over
- 11 my head.
- 12 Q. When is the last time you were bothered by
- 13 noise from the Overland facility?
- 14 A. Yesterday.
- 15 Q. What time?
- 16 A. I was working from home. It was
- 17 probably -- I worked yesterday all the way until
- 18 11:00 o'clock at night from home. So it was going
- 19 on when I was trying to work and watch TV at the
- 20 same time. So probably about 10:00.
- Q. And what type of noise was that?
- A. It was the banging.
- Q. When do you hear the hammering noise?
- A. The hammering noise was especially

- 1 noticeable to me. Again, I don't normally hear
- 2 that, but Wednesday, last Wednesday, when I was
- 3 home, it was as if it was right outside my window
- 4 hammering, clanking, things falling. It was like,
- 5 you know, I don't know if they're -- I have no idea
- 6 what they're doing. It wasn't the loading of the
- 7 trucks bang, bang, bang. It was clanking, something
- 8 going on.
- 9 Q. Can you estimate approximately how many
- 10 feet it is from your backyard to the actual loading
- 11 and unloading dock?
- 12 A. Thirty to 35 feet to the fence. I have no
- 13 idea. I really don't.
- 14 Q. What about from your -- can you estimate
- 15 how far it is from your house to the six -- I'm
- 16 sorry, 567 property line, 567 Charter Hall property
- 17 line on the north end?
- 18 A. 567?
- 19 Q. I'm sorry. Six -- my eyes are going.
- 20 MR. STEGER: I'll say they are.
- 21 BY MR. SIROS:
- 22 Q. All right. Let's try this again. Can you
- 23 see --
- A. I mean, I can see -- I can see the loading

- 1 docks very clearly. I mean, they're -- it's like 30
- 2 feet to the fence. Then there's probably, I don't
- 3 know, from the wall to here space and then it's like
- 4 the truck can back up to the loading dock
- 5 (indicating).
- 6 Q. How many feet would you stay it's from --
- 7 THE HEARING OFFICER: Hold on. All right. As
- 8 far as the distance from here to the wall, I'm not
- 9 going to --
- 10 THE WITNESS: I'm sorry.
- 11 THE HEARING OFFICER: -- try to guesstimate
- 12 what that is, but for the purpose of the record,
- 13 Mr. Siros, I'm going to ask that you be more
- 14 specific and --
- 15 MR. SIROS: Do you want me to rephrase the
- 16 question then?
- 17 THE HEARING OFFICER: -- direct your witness.
- 18 BY MR. SIROS:
- 19 Q. From your address at 691 to the
- 20 northernmost property line of 667, approximately how
- 21 many feet would you say there is between those
- 22 properties if you know?
- A. I really don't know.
- 24 MR. SIROS: Nothing further.

- 1 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Steger.
- 2 CROSS EXAMINATION
- 3 by Mr. Steger
- 4 Q. Referring to what is Complainants' Exhibit
- 5 No. 1, you had written a TY. Is there anything in
- 6 between the TY and this yellow X?
- 7 A. I can't see that. No, I can't see that
- 8 close because of the fact that the fence is there.
- 9 So I can just see over the fence to tell that
- 10 there's a trucking --
- 11 Q. Are you aware if there's a cyclone fence
- 12 going east/west, do you know?
- 13 A. No, there is not.
- 14 Q. Okay.
- 15 A. There is not. There is no perpendicular
- 16 fence.
- 17 Q. Okay. But for the Overland operations,
- 18 what time would you normally get up for work when
- 19 you go to the office?
- 20 A. When I go to the office, somewhere between
- 21 7:00, 7:00, 7:30.
- Q. Okay. And when you stay at home?
- A. It depends if I've worked the night
- 24 before. I'm on a very flexible schedule.

- 1 Q. And your job is a --
- 2 A. I manage the marketing and finance,
- 3 right. I manage the -- sorry. I manage the finance
- 4 and marketing aspect of a worldwide organization for
- 5 a high tech company.
- 6 Q. Does that require a lot of travel?
- 7 A. No.
- 8 Q. Did you take any independent measurements
- 9 of noise?
- 10 A. I started taking some. Unfortunately, I
- 11 lost my binder that had all the measurements in
- 12 there. So, yeah, I still have the little monitor,
- 13 but suffice it to say --
- 14 Q. Other than the --
- 15 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. Hold on.
- 16 BY MR. STEGER:
- 17 Q. Other than the Overland operation --
- 18 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. Hold on. Hold on.
- 19 MR. STEGER: Sorry.
- 20 THE HEARING OFFICER: Ms. Lexby, it's important
- 21 that if you're not finished with the answer, simply
- 22 say you're not furnished with the answer, but it's
- 23 important that only one party speak at a time for
- 24 the court reporters's sake. She can't transcribe

- 1 both voices at the same time.
- 2 Let Mr. Steger finish his question before
- 3 you begin answering. Thank you.
- 4 THE WITNESS: I think we started at the same
- 5 time, but...
- 6 BY MR. STEGER:
- 7 Q. Were you finished?
- 8 THE HEARING OFFICER: Well, it's important that
- 9 one party speak at a time.
- 10 BY THE WITNESS:
- 11 A. Yes, I am. Thank you.
- 12 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.
- 13 BY MR. STEGER:
- 14 Q. Other than the Overland operations, does
- 15 anything else wake you up at night?
- 16 A. No.
- 17 Q. Traffic noise, airplane noise, nothing?
- 18 A. No.
- 19 Q. Is the -- does the noise -- is the Charter
- 20 Hall Noise Committee still in existence?
- 21 A. I'm not actively involved in it at this
- 22 time.
- 23 MR. STEGER: I have no further questions.
- 24 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Siros.

- 1 MR. SIROS: Nothing further.
- 2 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you, Ms. Lexby.
- 3 All right. Why don't we go off the record
- 4 for a moment.
- 5 (Discussion had
- 6 off the record.)
- 7 THE HEARING OFFICER: Back on the record in
- 8 98-81, Charter Hall Homeowner's Association vs.
- 9 Overland Transportation.
- For the record, it's important that
- 11 everybody knows that we are in this room again
- 12 tomorrow. The notice that went out actually said
- 13 that it would be down on the second floor in room
- 14 25. I think I've already indicated this to some of
- 15 the parties here that this is, in fact, the hearing
- 16 room that it will be conducted in.
- I will also note for the record that what
- 18 I -- I made a comment at the beginning of the
- 19 proceeding indicating that members of the public had
- 20 attended. Those members of the public apparently
- 21 are all members of the Charter Hall Homeowner's
- 22 Association, and members that have come out have
- 23 been members of those except for the exception of
- 24 Mr. Steger's one witness, who is no longer present.

- 1 MR. STEGER: He's not a witness. He was just
- 2 in-house counsel for Overland Transportation.
- 3 THE HEARING OFFICER: I apologize. Then I
- 4 misidentified him.
- 5 MR. STEGER: Mr. David Daniels.
- 6 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you. Then I
- 7 misspoke. He is not a witness, but in-house counsel
- 8 for one of Mr. Steger's clients. I say that because
- 9 each member of the public has the opportunity, as
- 10 you know, Mr. Forcade, and as you know, Mr. Steger,
- 11 has the opportunity to question if they so desire.
- 12 There have been no such members here today.
- 13 All right. As far as wrapping up today,
- 14 Mr. Forcade, you have indicated that you have
- 15 some -- you're going to speak with your clients
- 16 regarding the transcript issue that we discussed
- 17 earlier, and that after the proceeding is finished I
- 18 will let you do that and leave that responsibility
- 19 with you.
- Then as far as exhibits, you had indicated
- 21 that you were going to move exhibits that you
- 22 referred to today; is that correct?
- 23 MR. SIROS: That's correct.
- 24 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Siros.

- 1 MR. SIROS: I'd first like to move into
- 2 evidence Complainants' Exhibits 1, which consists of
- 3 the blown-up drawing of the Charter Hall subdivision
- 4 and the Overland facility into evidence.
- 5 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. Let's deal with
- 6 one at a time. Complainants' Exhibit 1, which is
- 7 the blown up depiction of the facility and Charter
- 8 Hall Homeowner's Association area, Mr. Steger, do
- 9 you have any objection to the introduction of that
- 10 document?
- 11 MR. STEGER: The only objection I have to that
- 12 is that based on the testimony I've heard today and
- 13 talking with my witness, it may not be an entirely
- 14 accurate representation of the layout. How we can
- 15 deal with that is through my witness.
- Do you have any problems with that?
- 17 THE HEARING OFFICER: Well, are you
- 18 representing that it is a true and accurate
- 19 depiction of the area?
- 20 MR. FORCADE: An enlargement of the joint
- 21 stipulation document, and I had assumed that Mark --
- 22 Mr. Steger and his client had reviewed it and found
- 23 it to be accurate. I'm not going to contest the
- 24 fact that his witness may want to testify about some

- 1 things that are not precisely accurate, and we'll
- 2 certainly be willing to address that at the time it
- 3 occurs.
- 4 MR. STEGER: I don't see any problem with
- 5 that.
- 6 MR. FORCADE: I just had assumed by virtue of
- 7 the fact it was in the joint stipulation it had, in
- 8 fact, been reviewed for accuracy by them.
- 9 We'll be happy to discuss any potential
- 10 areas of discrepancy after Mr. Steger's witness has
- 11 taken the stand.
- 12 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. Mr. Steger, do you
- 13 have an objection? Is your objection specific to
- 14 the accuracy of the document?
- 15 MR. STEGER: That is correct.
- 16 THE HEARING OFFICER: I'm going to let the
- 17 document speak for itself. I'm going to admit the
- 18 document over your objection, and you can point out
- 19 any inaccuracies in your case in chief. The
- 20 document is admitted over objection.
- 21 MR. SIROS: The next exhibit is Complainants'
- 22 Exhibit No. 2, which is the letter from Mary Ann
- 23 Bergau to the Village of Palatine.
- 24 MR. STEGER: No objection.

- 1 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. I'm sorry. That
- 2 was Complainants' Exhibit 2. That's the
- 3 correspondence from Mrs. Bergau to the Village of
- 4 Palatine?
- 5 MR. SIROS: That's correct.
- 6 THE HEARING OFFICER: No objection,
- 7 Mr. Steger?
- 8 MR. STEGER: No.
- 9 THE HEARING OFFICER: It is admitted.
- 10 MR. SIROS: The next exhibit is Complainants'
- 11 Exhibit No. --
- 12 THE HEARING OFFICER: You know what, why don't
- 13 you hand me the documents as you see them, and then
- 14 that way I can -- for the record, Complainants'
- 15 Exhibit 1 is about a two-by-four, two and a half
- 16 feet by four foot overblown -- not overblown, blowup
- 17 of the area that's been testified to.
- 18 Complainants' Exhibit 2 is a two-page
- 19 document on eight-and-a-half-by-eleven letterhead
- 20 with the title Mary Ann Bergau. It looks to be a
- 21 correspondence from Ms. Bergau to the village zoning
- 22 administrator of the Village of Palatine dated April
- 23 15th, 1996. Mr. Steger has indicated that he has no
- 24 objection to that document. That document is

- 1 admitted as Complainants' Exhibit 1 over
- 2 Mr. Steger's objection.
- 3 MR. SIROS: Complainants' Exhibit 3 is the
- 4 letter from the Village of Palatine to Mary Ann
- 5 Bergau.
- 6 THE HEARING OFFICER: All right. This is a
- 7 one-page document on an eight-and-a-half-by-eleven
- 8 sheet of paper. It appears to be on Village of
- 9 Palatine letterhead from a Michael D. Kadlecik,
- 10 village manager, to Ms. Bergau dated May 13th, 1996.
- 11 Any objection, Mr. Steger?
- 12 MR. STEGER: No.
- 13 THE HEARING OFFICER: It is admitted.
- 14 MR. SIROS: Complainants' Exhibit 4 is a noise
- 15 log completed by Denny Bergau, which consists of
- 16 seven pages.
- 17 THE HEARING OFFICER: All right. Let the
- 18 record reflect that Complainants' Exhibit 4 does
- 19 consist of handwritten notes -- notations with the
- 20 title Bergau, 667 Charter Hall, pages one, two,
- 21 three, four, five, six, a seven-page document all in
- 22 handwritten notations.
- 23 Mr. Steger, any objection?
- 24 MR. STEGER: The only objection I have to that

- 1 is it goes more to its weight than anything else. I
- 2 believe in the testimony there was some uncertainty
- 3 as to his recordings, but I think those go to the
- 4 weight as opposed to the admissibility.
- 5 MR. SIROS: Actually, as to that document, that
- 6 is, in fact, the noise log which is not the
- 7 checkmark data sheet. So there was no question as
- 8 to uncertainty --
- 9 MR. STEGER: Oh, I'm sorry.
- 10 MR. SIROS: -- as to that.
- 11 THE HEARING OFFICER: This is the noise log.
- 12 As I recall the testimony, this was the --
- 13 MR. STEGER: Written?
- 14 MR. SIROS: Yes.
- 15 THE HEARING OFFICER: -- the handwritten, yes.
- 16 MR. STEGER: I'm sorry. I don't have any
- 17 objection to that one.
- 18 THE HEARING OFFICER: The objection is
- 19 withdrawn. The document is admitted.
- 20 MR. SIROS: The next exhibit is Complainants'
- 21 Exhibit 5, which is, in fact, the noise meter.
- 22 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. Any objection to
- 23 Complainants' Exhibit No. 5 being admitted,
- 24 Mr. Steger?

- 1 MR. STEGER: No.
- 2 THE HEARING OFFICER: It is a -- what is in a
- 3 carrying device captioned sound level meter,
- 4 catalogue number 33-2050. Within is what is
- 5 identified as Radio Shack sound level meter.
- 6 Any objection to that --
- 7 MR. FORCADE: Excuse me.
- 8 THE HEARING OFFICER: I apologize. Yes.
- 9 MR. FORCADE: Is there a, perhaps, serial
- 10 number on the inside machine at a location?
- 11 THE HEARING OFFICER: I do not see a serial
- 12 number, Mr. Forcade. However, if you're -- none on
- 13 the outside of the --
- 14 MR. FORCADE: Okay. We intend to --
- 15 THE HEARING OFFICER: -- instrument.
- 16 MR. FORCADE: -- introduce another one. I'm
- 17 just trying to find some mechanism of telling A from
- 18 B.
- 19 THE HEARING OFFICER: I understand. There's
- 20 nothing other than China.
- 21 MR. FORCADE: China. Thank you very much.
- 22 THE HEARING OFFICER: All right. And I'm not
- 23 sure that will be a way to distinguish it.
- 24 However, Mr. Steger, do you have any

- 1 objection to that document -- that item being
- 2 admitted?
- 3 MR. STEGER: No.
- 4 THE HEARING OFFICER: No objection. It is
- 5 admitted.
- 6 MR. SIROS: The next exhibit is Complainants'
- 7 Exhibit 6, which, in fact, is the checkmark data
- 8 survey sheet completed by Denny Bergau. It is seven
- 9 pages long.
- 10 MR. STEGER: I'll reiterate my last objection
- 11 that I thought I was referring to on Exhibit 4 for
- 12 this Exhibit 6.
- 13 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. Complainants'
- 14 Exhibit 6 is -- consists of one, two, three, four,
- 15 five, six, seven pages all -- it has handwritten --
- 16 they all have handwritten notes on them as well as
- 17 preprinted -- what appears to be a preprinted format
- 18 with the title checkmark survey data sheet page two,
- 19 all have the same entitle.
- 20 Regarding the objections, as I recall the
- 21 testimony, Mr. Bergau did indicate that he was not
- 22 an expert in the area. However, he did testify how
- 23 the recordings were made and when they were made and
- 24 the method in which he employed in making those

- 1 markings.
- 2 The weight to be given to that evidence
- 3 will be determined by the Board ultimately. So as
- 4 far as the objection, if I understand the objection
- 5 correctly, Mr. Steger, it is to the weight to be
- 6 given to it. You can argue that in your brief as to
- 7 what weight --
- 8 MR. STEGER: Understood.
- 9 THE HEARING OFFICER: -- should be given. The
- 10 document is admitted over objection.
- 11 MR. SIROS: The next exhibit is Complainants'
- 12 Exhibit 7, which consists of an eight-page document
- 13 which is entitled Charter Hall excessive noise
- 14 report completed by Behram Dinshaw.
- 15 THE HEARING OFFICER: All right. Complainants'
- 16 Exhibit 7 consists of one, two, three, four, five,
- 17 six, seven, eight pages. The first seven of which
- 18 appear to be on a preprinted form with handwritten
- 19 notes.
- 20 Mr. Dinshaw, as he testified regarding
- 21 alleged noises at the facility, he testified as to
- 22 where they were taken from. The last page appears
- 23 to be a paragraph of his that he read into the
- 24 record as well.

- 1 Any objection to that document going into
- 2 the record, Mr. Steger?
- 3 MR. STEGER: I have no objection to it being
- 4 admitted.
- 5 THE HEARING OFFICER: All right. Complainants'
- 6 Exhibit 7 is admitted without objection.
- 7 Mr. Siros.
- 8 MR. SIROS: The next exhibit is Group Exhibit
- 9 1, which consists of five pictures which are
- 10 numbered one through five on the back.
- 11 THE HEARING OFFICER: This document, as we
- 12 previously described, consists of five photos
- 13 numbered sequentially one through five taken by, I
- 14 believe, Ms. Bergau. The photos are distinguishable
- 15 from other photos referred to in that they have no
- 16 date stamp on any of the photos and consist of five.
- 17 Any objection to those five photographs?
- MR. STEGER: No, there is no objections to
- 19 their admissibility.
- 20 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you, Mr. Steger.
- 21 The documents are admitted without objection.
- MR. SIROS: The final exhibit is Complainants'
- 23 Group Exhibit 2, which consists of 26 pictures
- 24 numbered one through 26 on the back. These pictures

- 1 each have a date stamp on them.
- 2 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.
- 3 Mr. Steger, any objection to those
- 4 documents?
- 5 MR. STEGER: Which ones are these?
- 6 THE HEARING OFFICER: These --
- 7 MR. STEGER: The group of 29?
- 8 THE HEARING OFFICER: These are the Group
- 9 Exhibit No. 2, one through 26.
- 10 MR. STEGER: I'm sorry.
- 11 THE HEARING OFFICER: There are 26 --
- 12 MR. STEGER: No objection to their
- 13 admissibility.
- 14 THE HEARING OFFICER: All right. The documents
- 15 are admitted. However, I do want to clarify for the
- 16 record so it's clear that these 26 photographs all
- 17 have a date stamp in what appears to be the
- 18 right-hand corner, lower corner, taken by
- 19 Mr. Dinshaw.
- 20 All right. Mr. Siros, anything else?
- 21 MR. SIROS: The final exhibit, and I'm not sure
- 22 how you want to handle this, is the joint three page
- 23 exhibit that was going to be attached to the
- 24 stipulations that were going to be added to

- 1 stipulations. I believe Mr. Steger was going to
- 2 take care of having that added to the stipulations.
- 3 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. I believe,
- 4 Mr. Steger, you indicated or pointed out that those
- 5 documents were missing; is that accurate?
- 6 MR. STEGER: That is correct.
- 7 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. Those three pages
- 8 we'll deal with how we -- I previously had indicated
- 9 to the parties and I thought what we agreed to was
- 10 Mr. Steger is to provide a new --
- 11 MR. FORCADE: Version.
- 12 THE HEARING OFFICER: -- stipulation with all
- 13 the documents within tomorrow morning and that we
- 14 will refer to and put into the record as a joint
- 15 exhibit on behalf of both parties, call it Joint
- 16 Exhibit 1, with all attached exhibits.
- We'll give each party an opportunity to
- 18 review that. In fact, I would request prior to the
- 19 hearing tomorrow that the other side be given an
- 20 opportunity to review that document, Mr. Steger, and
- 21 then we can go from there. Okay?
- 22 Anything else, Mr. Siros?
- 23 MR. SIROS: No, that's all.
- 24 THE HEARING OFFICER: Mr. Steger?

1	MR. STEGER: No.
2	THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. I'll go through my
3	own checklist here. We will start tomorrow at 9:30
4	a.m., this conference room.
5	Thank you all for your patients. I will
6	see you all tomorrow morning.
7	(Whereupon, these were all the
8	proceedings had in the
9	above-entitled matter.)
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	

```
1 STATE OF ILLINOIS )
             ) SS.
2 COUNTY OF COOK)
3
4
        I, GEANNA M. PIGNONE-IAQUINTA, do
5 hereby state that I am a court reporter doing
6 business in the City of Chicago, County of Cook, and
7 State of Illinois; that I reported by means of
8 machine shorthand the proceedings held in the
9 foregoing cause, and that the foregoing is a true
10 and correct transcript of my shorthand notes so
11 taken as aforesaid.
12
13
14
             Geanna M. Pignone-Iaquinta
            Notary Public, Cook County, IL
15
            Illinois License No. 084-004096
16
  SUBSCRIBED AND SWORN TO
17 before me this____day
        ____, A.D., 1998.
18
19 __
     Notary Public
20
21
22
23
24
```