ILLINOIS POLLUTION CONTROL BOARD January 3, 1975

COMMONWEALTH EDISON COMPANY,) Petitioner,) V. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY,) Respondent.)

CONCURRING OPINION (by Mr. Dumelle):

I concur with the grant of the variances in this case but for reasons different from the majority.

PCB 74-16

My fellow three Board Members of the majority seem to agree that flue gas desulfurization techniques (FGD) are not yet proven. disagree on this major point. The successful operation of the Mitsui Aluminum plant in Japan since March 1, 1972 is proof that American technology does work (at least in Japan).

In two months, Mitsui should have 36 months of successful operation. In addition, in this country we have the excellent results of flue gas desulfurization at the Paddy's Run power plant in Louisville and the good experience at the Cholla plant in Arizona. If it only takes the sighting of a single albino crow to prove its existence, then these three examples are more than enough proof.

It is interesting to see that Edison's State Line plant began working on FGD on January 1, 1972 and its Will County plant on February 23, 1972. Both were started before Mitsui but have not had the same successful experience in the intervening years.

The question on this variance then boils down to "what is to be done now?" The time has gone past. Edison did try to make FGD work (and may yet do so) but failed (at least to date). Had Edison successfully brought in FGD by the end of 1972 it could have then installed the process in all its other units in about three more years or by December, 1975. The instant variances are largely until October, 1975 (or sooner) and the same end result, namely early compliance, is obtained. The later dates, until 1980, for coal gasification at Powerton and Kincaid, are justified in the interest of encouraging alternative technology to use Illinois' ample coal supplies.

The conversion to low sulfur coal, which is Edison's own choice, is by this variance left to them. I have some doubt that Edison will in fact be able to secure the massive tonnage of low sulfur coal that they need. If it cannot be secured then an early change in the strategy is required lest more time be lost.

Jacob D. Dumelle

I, Christan L. Moffett, Clerk of the Illinois Pollution Control Board, hereby certify the above Concurring Opinion was submitted on the day of ______, 1975.

Christan L,

Illinois Pollution control Board